

# **EDUCOR MULTIDISCIPLINARY JOURNAL**





# EDUCOR MULTIDISCIPLINARY JOURNAL

The *Educor Multidisciplinary Journal* (EMJ) is an academic journal that encourages and embraces research from all disciplines.

#### **Editorial Policy**

Research and the development of fledgling academic researchers in higher education is of major importance within the ambit of regulatory and academic requirements, while it is also an academic developmental imperative. The EMJ is a blind peer-reviewed multidisciplinary academic journal that draws from various disciplines to gain a broad understanding, a well-developed perspective or to discover something new. It brings diverse academic disciplines together to discuss and view issues from each of their perspectives. The journal is the official academic journal of the Educor group of companies and is published annually. Due to the variety and scope of academic offerings in the Educor group, the journal is generalist in nature as the focus is multidisciplinary.

The EMJ provides a platform for new as well as established researchers and academics to publish and share their research expositions. As such, it is a developmental academic journal that falls in the ambit of the Educor academic developmental and training strategy. The following types of research are welcomed by the Editorial Board of the EMJ:

- Empirical research
- Conceptual research
- Case studies

The journal provides open access to its content, at no cost or prior registration online. We promote the principle that making research freely available to the public supports a greater global exchange of knowledge. In the same vein, the process of submission, revision and publishing of texts is also free of charge to the authors. It is noted that the expressed

opinions, accuracy of facts and interpretations published in the EMJ are those of the authors and do not necessarily represent the views of the Educor group.

#### **Guidelines for Contributing Authors**

The following guidelines must be adhered to:

- All submissions and communication should be addressed to editor@educor.co.za
- The EMJ accepts only articles in English.
- Articles are to be submitted in MS Word format with Roman Times Numeral, 12-point font size and one and a half spacing.
- The submitted article must be accompanied by a letter from the author(s) that states that the article has not been submitted for publication elsewhere.
- No article that was already submitted in full or in part for publication in another journal will be accepted by the editorial committee of the EMJ.
- All illustrations should be appropriately numbered and be part of only one document.
- All submissions will be guided by the research office in terms of agreed guidelines of submission.
- There must be a clear indication of joint publications, co-authors and the corresponding author.
- The declared Educor Harvard referencing style must be used.

#### **Blind Peer Review**

Initial submissions are sent to a peer reviewer for comment. The peer reviewer reviews the significance of the article, its contribution to knowledge in the field of study, the originality of the work, the validity of the discourse, the use of references, valid recommendations and an overview of judgment of the article. Feedback from the reviewer is then forwarded to the author for revision (if necessary).

#### **Ethics Declaration**

The EMJ is committed to assuring the ethics of its published papers. The editorial committee applies the principles of transparency and best practice in scholarly publishing.

The editorial committee is dedicated to publishing corrections, explanations, withdrawals and apologies, when necessary. The EMJ is committed to integrity and academic rigour. For this reason, plagiarism is not acceptable. To protect the integrity of Educor, fraudulent content will be removed or will become unpublished. When accepting the terms and agreements expressed by our journal, the authors must guarantee that the paper and the materials associated to it are original and do not infringe authors' rights. In cases of shared authorship, co-authors must justify full consensus and guarantee that the work has not been previously published in any other format.

#### **Frequency of Publication and Format**

The EMJ will be published annually.

#### The Editors in Chief

Educor Multidisciplinary Journal Educor Holdings 57 Underwood Road Pinetown 3610

#### **Editorial Committee**

Prof. H Hay-Swemmer (Educor)Prof. A Lowies (Educor)Dr A Erasmus (Educor)Ms L Rajagopaul (Educor)Ms T Ramsuraj (Educor)

#### **Editor of Journal**

Mrs L Kraft

Tel: +27-31-7133800 Email: <u>editor@educor.co.za</u>

# **Table of Contents**

| EFFECTIVE TEACHING AND LEARNING: WORKING TOWARDS A NEW, ALL-<br>INCLUSIVE PARADIGM FOR EFFECTIVE AND SUCCESSFUL TEACHING AND<br>LEARNING IN HIGHER EDUCATION AND TRAINING |
|---|
| Leandri Pretorius (Damelin: Bloemfontein)   |
| EFFECT OF TRAINING AND DEVELOPMENT ON EMPLOYEE PERFORMANCE<br>AT AN ACADEMIC ADVISING CENTRE IN DURBAN  |
| Samuel Bangura (Educor)   |
| THE EFFECT OF POVERTY ON EDUCATION IN SOUTH AFRICA47  |
| Martinus Jacobus Nortje (Damelin: Bloemfontein)47   |
| WRITING AS A LEARNING TOOL: A METHOD OF TEACHING LAW AS A 'NON-<br>MAJOR' MODULE  |
| Eunette Beukes (Damelin: Menlyn)  |
| METHODOLOGIES OF STUDYING POWER: AN ANTHROPOLOGICAL PERSPECTIVE ON AGENCY, RESISTANCE AND ETHICS IN SOUTH AFRICA 80   |
| Robin Thompson (INTEC)80  |
| A GREENER APPROACH TO SECONDARY METAL, NON-METAL AND MINERAL PRODUCT MANAGEMENT   |
| Byelongo Elisee Isheloke (Central Technical College)  |
| LIVELIHOODS DIVERSIFICATION AMONG RIVERBED FARMERS: A CASE STUDY OF NYAMINYAMI DISTRICT, ZIMBABWE   |
| Felix Tombindo and Takunda J Chirau (Damelin: Menlyn)113  |
| IS 'READICIDE' A MERE TREND, A CRISIS OR THE INEVITABLE END OF<br>READING IN SOUTH AFRICAN SCHOOLS? OBSERVATIONS FROM THE<br>CLASSROOM                                    |
| Emmanuel Nwaneri (Damelin: Pretoria City)141  |
| MOTIVATING FACTORS OF PERMANENT EMPLOYEES AT A RETAIL ORGANISATION IN PIETERMARITZBURG  |
| Nereshnee Naidoo (Damelin: Pietermaritzburg)172   |
| AN INVESTIGATION INTO THE ROLE OF SCHOOL LEADERS IN MANAGING<br>CULTURAL DIVERSITY AMONG EDUCATORS IN TWO EX-MODEL C PRIMARY<br>SCHOOLS IN GAUTENG, SOUTH AFRICA          |
| Charmaine Soupen  |

# EFFECTIVE TEACHING AND LEARNING: WORKING TOWARDS A NEW, ALL-INCLUSIVE PARADIGM FOR EFFECTIVE AND SUCCESSFUL TEACHING AND LEARNING IN HIGHER EDUCATION AND TRAINING

#### Leandri Pretorius (Damelin: Bloemfontein)

Leandri.Pretorius@damelin.co.za

Since the dawn of the democracy for South Africa in 1994, the educational environment has been rapidly changing. Add to this the increased power and use of Information and Communication Technologies and a picture is formed of a never-ending rollercoaster ride with its associated difficulties. In the world of teaching and learning, some changes that are still taking place today appear in the educational sphere. The Higher Education and Training sphere is perhaps one of the most changing environments in the world. It is in this sphere that changes need to take place, as higher education institutions are responsible for teaching future generations. This is why there is a need for a new, diverse, 21st century-like teaching and Neomillennial type learning paradigm within higher education and training institutions. Because of the sometimes-chaotic environment and surroundings of a  $21^{st}$  century lecturer, it is essential that a single paradigm be put in place to assist them in managing their classrooms effectively and efficiently, and to help them reach their full teaching potential. In light of this, this research article tries to establish this paradigm by looking at the following: 1) The practices, policies and paradigms currently in place; 2) Understanding the basics of student learning; 3) Understanding and expanding on a lecturer's teaching and learning capabilities; 4) Providing several Different alternatives for teaching and learning in higher education and training; and 5) Providing the baseline plan for the 'new' paradigm to assist all in the 21<sup>st</sup> century lecture halls.

**Keywords:** global learner, higher education and training, learning, neomillennial, paradigm, teaching, twenty-first century

#### Introduction

Since the dawn of democratisation in 1994 for South Africa, the environment has been changing for the better. Add to this the increased power and use of Information and Communication Technologies (ICTs), a picture is formed of a never-ending rollercoaster ride with its associated ups and downs. Some changes that are still taking place today appear in the world of Teaching and Learning or the educational sphere. The Higher

Education and Training (HET) sphere is perhaps one of the most dynamic environments in the world. It is in this sphere that changes need to take place, as HEIs are responsible for teaching future generations. If something is lacking or not up to standard in this phase, our future could be bleak. Therefore, there is a need for a new, diverse, 21<sup>st</sup> century-like teaching and learning paradigm within HET institutions.

Every person, whether it be student, teacher or lecturer, is different. People also teach and learn in different ways. Something that works for one student may not necessarily work for the others, or perhaps not for the lecturer. Today's demographics for HET institutions are rich in diversity. Young and old people from different races, cultures and backgrounds come together under one roof with a shared goal in mind: to finish their studies and graduate. This multiracial, multilingual, multicultural environment causes some lecturers to focus their teaching on one type of student; those that exceed expectations in the qualification or modules. The others tend to fall behind and eventually away, as they are driven away' by what is going on in the lecture hall. The diverse population as well as the rapidly changing technologies and times puts considerable pressure on lecturers to be a 'Jack-or-Jill-of-All-Trades'. Lecturers need to consider all students when planning for lessons, and they also must take into consideration the standing principles, policies and practices for their institutions. Because of the sometimes-chaotic environment and surroundings of a 21<sup>st</sup> century lecturer, it is essential that a single paradigm be put in place to assist them in managing their classrooms effectively and efficiently, and to help them reach their full teaching potential.

In light of this, this research article will try to establish this paradigm by looking at the following: 1) the practices, policies and teaching and learning paradigms currently in place; 2) understanding the basics of student learning; 3) understanding and expanding on a lecturer's teaching and learning capabilities; 4) providing several different alternatives for teaching and learning in HET; and 5) providing the baseline plan for the 'new' paradigm to assist all in the 21<sup>st</sup> century lecture halls.

#### **Understanding the Basics of Student Learning**

Before effectively defining a new and interesting paradigm, one first needs to know how a student learns. Many lecturers base their teaching methods on how they themselves have been taught. However, their exposure training and learning may not be the best for their student (Fry et al., 2008:8). It is imperative that lecturers know and understand how their students learn in order for their teaching methods to be effective.

Learning can be defined as how we see (perceive) and understand the world around us, and how we make meaning based on what we see (Fry et al., 2008:8). For student learning, researchers use the term 'learning styles'. This term elicits the idea that they are referring to the student's personality characteristics and traits (Fry et al., 2008:20), which can be seen as fixed and immovable. This term is used to define which mode or method of learning a student feels comfortable with at a particular time, perhaps even with a particular module. It can and does change (frequently) for each student as the semester progresses. There are also approaches to learning that need to be kept in mind when lecturing, which a student uses to interact with a set task (Fry et al., 2008:10). Along with their preferred style of learning, their approach or intention to the task at hand can also have a significant effect on their learning experience (Ramsden, 2003:47). There are different types of learning styles and approaches, which will briefly be discussed.

#### Approaches to Learning

Although a fair amount of research exists on this subject (see Fry et al., 2008), none can come close to the pioneering work done by Biggs and Ramsden in 1988. Ramsden explains that approaches to learning can be deep or surface approaches (Ramsden, 2003:47-48).

- The **deep approach** to learning can be seen as the intention to understand and seek meaning, relating new concepts to existing knowledge and understanding (Fry et al., 2008:11). For example, a student learns facts in the context of meaning and understanding those facts.
- The **surface approach** to learning, on the other hand, is the intention to study the facts and to memorise them (Ramsden, 2003:47); this is rote learning of facts

without a meaningful understanding and application of knowledge gained. In this instance, a student merely rushes to learn the facts of the textbook quickly, to regurgitate them onto the exam paper. There is no intention to understand or find meaning for these 'facts'.

Lecturers who take a student-focused approach to teaching and learning will encourage and help their students achieve the deep approach, and they will help their students understand the context, facts and meaning better when they lecture (Fry et al., 2008:11). Biggs identified a third approach in 1987 (cited in Fry et al., 2008:11), namely the strategic / achieving approach. For this approach, it is suggested that a student may prefer a deep approach to learning, but in some instances (like in a test or an exam) they will use characteristics of a surface approach in order to pass. They use one or both of these approaches during different phases of the learning cycle, but must be guided by the lecturer to use or focus on only one. This means that lecturers must know which approach to drive home with their students. Lecturers need to encourage and help the students use the strategic approach (majority deep approach, with a little surface approach for easier tasks). In this way, their students will be able to pass their modules and understand content, which in turn reflects well on the lecturers.

#### **Dimensions of Learning Styles**

On the other side of learning lies the different styles of learning, the various dimensions of student learning. There are four dimensions that will be discussed. These dimensions were established by Felder and Silverman to establish the preferred styles of engineering students, as well as to help engineering lecturers adapt their method of teaching for effective learning in HET (Felder & Silverman, 1988:674). Figure 1 shows a summary of these styles / dimensions as established by Felder and Silverman (Online: 2017):

• Sensing-Intuitive Dimension: This continuum is based on how students perceive or take in the information given to them during a lecture. Sensors like memorising facts, data and solving problems. They are patient and careful. Intuitors prefer principles and theories, 'surprises' and innovation, and are comfortable with symbols.

- Visual-Verbal Dimension: This dimension pertains to how they prefer the information to be presented. Visual students learn better with visual stimuli (like pictures, graphs and diagrams), whilst verbal (or auditory) students tend to learn better with sounds and words. It is interesting to note that lectures tend to cater more for the verbal students, as opposed to the visual (as per Felder and Silverman).
- Active-Reflective Dimension: This continuum is based on how students prefer the information to be processed. Active learners like doing something or experimenting to learn something new, whereas reflective students tend to observe and process information introspectively. These can also be linked to being either extra- / introvert; active learners tend to be extraverted and reflective students are introverted (Felder & Silverman, 1988:678).
- Sequential-Global Dimension: This is based on how students organise information, as well as how they progress towards the understanding of information. Sequential students tend to learn better when information is given to them sequentially and in a logical progression (i.e. from basics to the highest level and eventually exams). Global learners tend to learn in fits and starts and cannot follow a sequential or linear line of teaching. They may be lost for days on the most rudimentary concept, until they suddenly 'get it' and all the pieces seem to fall into place for them and they suddenly understand the content.



#### Figure 1: The Felder-Silverman Model (Online: 2017)

#### Integrated Perspective of Approaches and Styles of Learning: Why Knowing this is Important

For effective teaching and learning to be implemented in HEIs, assessments and teaching methods should be developed and implemented alongside the styles and dimensions discussed before (Fry et al., 2008:22). Students experience the same type or method of teaching in a variety of different ways. If the lecturer understands the styles and approaches to learning, and also grasps how their students tend to learn, they will be able to adapt their teaching style in such a way as to address all aspects. Lecturers need to know that concepts may be new to students (especially for first year students), and they must therefore try to understand where the students are coming from. In this way, lecturers can try to address any misconceptions or gaps in knowledge at an early stage, which will ensure better results by the end of the year (Fry et al., 2008:22).

What is important for all academic staff to remember is that they are dealing with young people who are starting their journey in a rapidly changing and upgrading society. If we teach and learn in the same way and with the same content, we will lose these young minds to boredom and stagnation. Lecturers still need to be active learners as well to ensure that interest is maintained for all their modules. Felder and Silverman summarised concisely (Table 1) the various methods that could work for all the types of learning previously discussed (Felder & Silverman, 1988:680).

| Teaching Technique                          | Teaching / Learning Styles |
|---|----------------------------|
| 1. Motivate learning as far as possible;    | Inductive / Global         |
| relate everything to each other, and to     |                            |
| previous experiences or personal            |                            |
| experiences.                                |                            |
| 2. Provide balance of concrete information  | Sensing / Active           |
| and abstract concepts (raw facts vs         | Intuitive / Reflective     |
| theories).                                  |                            |
| 3. Balance practical problem-solving        | Sensing / Active           |
| materials, with those for fundamental       | Intuitive / Reflective     |
| understanding.                              |                            |
| 4. Do not fill the entire scheduled class   | Reflective                 |
| time with lecturing or writing on the board |                            |
| - try to provide intervals so that students |                            |
| think about what has been.                  |                            |
| 5. Give students the option of cooperating  | Active                     |
| on homework assignments to the greatest     |                            |
| possible extent.                            |                            |

# Table 1: Techniques for Teaching and Learning (Felder & Silverman, 1988:680)

#### **Understanding and Developing Lecturer Learning and Teaching**

Various theories and studies have been done about lecturing in college (see also Fry et al., 2008), especially about how the lecture is delivered and how to maintain the interest of the student. According to Morton (2008:59), an outstanding lecturer should possess the following skills:

- The lecturer delivers the content and/or outcomes in an informative, engaging and interesting way.
- The content is sequentially organised and easy to follow (the student can then understand the logic in the organisation of the information).

- The lecture involves the students (i.e. active participation or the questioning of students tend to be excellent ways to involve them).
- The students leave the lecture wondering where the time has gone (and not sitting in the lecture hall wishing for time to go by faster).
- An outstanding lecture leaves the student feeling like they have learned something that they are inspired to go and explore further.

In theory, this sounds easy, straightforward and to the point. Unfortunately, putting it into practice is a different issue. The reality of lectures in today's demanding world leaves the lecturer with little other but the content to rely on. They will sometimes find barriers between them and this so-called 'outstanding' lecture. From personal experience, the researcher has found that many lecturers claim to struggle to keep students interested. Several of the reasons for this are discussed next.

- Students enter HET institutions with a belief that the institution will be similar to high school; they will go to class, write exams and pass. This is one of many gaps in knowledge that lecturers are forced to address and overcome in their classes.
- Some courses have theory and virtually nothing else. Lecturers must find ways to make theories and learning fun and interesting. Because of the gaps in knowledge, the lecturer is now responsible to teach the student critical analytical thinking and research methods to help them cope with this vast new load of information. They try to apply the theories to current events, but in some instances current events are just not applicable.
- Lecturers tend to structure their classes in such a way as they think will be best for the students. They take from their own knowledge and experience and try to present a lecture where the students will learn the necessary outcomes. The lecturer's perception of the study styles and approaches are sometimes very far removed from reality, and they structure the lecture on false information.

• Students are sometimes just not interested. This is a simple and realistic fact that has to be faced: students are only interested in getting their qualification, but may not necessarily be interested in the process of obtaining a qualification (i.e. going to class and doing assignments, etc.). They may also not show interest in the topics; some students like to learn about history, while others do not. In reality, there is little that a lecturer can do to stem this – they will have to try and overcome this aspect if they are to succeed in their careers as educators by adapting their lecturing styles to try and make it as interesting as possible for all (Fry et al., 2008:22).

Chances are slim that a lecturer could ever have a perfect class or lecture. Lecturers need to try to create lessons that are applicable to most (if not all) of the students. Resources, or a lack thereof, also seem to be a common problem faced by many lecturers. Some lecturers have been known to ask: 'How am I supposed to teach a bunch of always-online students, when I myself cannot be online during working hours?' This is an important question and issue that will need to be resolved if lecturers are to maintain a certain level or standard of quality for their teaching (Dede, 2005:7).

Lack of resources can cause lecturers to 'lack' in their teaching delivery. For example: how will a lecturer be able to present a PowerPoint presentation if they do not have a laptop with this program installed? Is it the responsibility of their institution to provide this? With this lack of adequate resources, will it contribute towards lower pass rates and at-risk students?

Several studies have been done on changing the style of teaching in HET institutions (see Fry et al., 2008; Felder & Silverman, 1988). Most notably is the study by Dede on 'Neomillennial Learning Styles' (2005:7). Dede is of the opinion that the new 'class' of students (the so-called Neomillennials) will cause a shift in the educational and academic world to an active construction of knowledge, with the help of information, communication and media technologies (Dede, 2005:7). The global explosion of social media especially is causing the lecturers to adapt their teaching styles to these new technologies and to also be 'always on' different media sites. If lecturers are barred from these media sites, their teaching styles will be lacking the new technological direction in which their students are

moving, and the lecturers will lose the interest of those in class. Though providing the Information Technology (IT) infrastructure can be costly and troublesome to manage, certain websites and/or applications (apps) need to be made available to ensure that the lecturer is online for their class.

Even though a lecturer may have different styles of teaching, one must also bear in mind that they are also learners themselves (DuFour, 2004:1). Many educational institutions are moving to what has been termed a 'Professional Learning Community' and one where professional development for lecturers is done on a regular, on-going basis, rather than the traditional 'once-off, drive-by' format that these workshops have traditionally taken (Darling-Hammond & Richardson, 2009:46). There is an increasing need for institutions to move to a 21<sup>st</sup> century style of teaching and learning. Where there is active teaching, emphasis is placed on student and lecturer learning, and a style that teaches young minds the more complex and analytical skills needed for high-order thinking and academic performance (Darling-Hammond & Richardson, 2009:46). Many academic staff perceive staff or professional development as being individualistic, private and totally irrelevant (Lieberman & Pointer Mace, 2008:226). For the lecturers to be able to adapt to a changing classroom, they will need to be provided with the necessary professional and personal knowledge to be able to adapt their styles. Lecturers therefore need to create and/or establish a professional learning community in which they can operate. Many use this term to describe various people with an interest in education coming together (DuFour, 2004:2). Within this community, these intellectuals work collaboratively to design and implement strategies and systems to move the institution from the (traditional) teaching of providing instruction-paradigm to the newly developed teaching of producing a learning-paradigm (Barr & Tagg, 1995:13). This community helps lecturers work together with others to achieve the collective purpose of 'learning for all' (DuFour, 2004:3). To enhance a student's learning experience, the lecturer needs to be able to have access to various platforms (online and real-life) which will help them adapt their existing teaching methods to fit their students' styles (and their own) better.

#### **Organisational Stressors and its Effect on Teaching and Learning**

For academics all over the world, their jobs have been classified as 'stress factories' (Barkhuizen & Rothmann, 2008:321). Various factors contribute to this, which have an adverse effect on lecturers and their teaching. Work overload, time constraints, lack of advancement opportunities within the organisation, inadequate salaries and/or remuneration, inadequate resources as well as student interactions are just some of the key stressors identified by research (Barkhuizen & Rothmann, 2008:322). They have a significant impact on the professional (and sometimes personal) working of an individual lecturer. As with many other issues, salary and resources remain a point of contention in meetings held on all educational campuses. Many lecturers firmly believe that they are paid too little for the immense workload they are given, and therefore do not put in any extra effort into their classes. They feel management does not provide adequate support and benefits (like raises, performance bonuses or other conditions of service), so they do not put in any effort either (Barkhuizen & Rothmann, 2008:322). Because of this, teaching and learning fall behind, and the demotivation of the staff can be felt by all. Due to the immense stress they are perceived to be under, their impaired work performance, job dissatisfaction as well as physical and mentally ill health cause teaching to take a back stance to what is happening at organisational level (Barkhuizen & Rothmann, 2008:322). In order for lecturers to be great at what they do, the institutions they serve must help manage and protect their staff against excessive stressors (Barkhuizen & Rothmann, 2008:322). In so doing, the academic staff will be able receive better job satisfaction and fulfilment, effectively increasing success of their teaching and learning practices within the HET institution.

#### **Existing Policies and Practices that Need to Change**

No educational research article will be complete without the mention of some of the policies and practices in place for quality assurance (QA) purposes, which also need to be adapted for improved and successful teaching and learning in HET institutions (McKimm, 2008:186). All educational institutions are expected to adhere to certain set rules and regulations, and to put policies and procedures in place to ensure high quality teaching

(McKimm, 2008:186). When the external bodies demand, the institutions have to obey or face closure by these parties. These demands are sometimes developed and implemented by people who may not be in the teaching or lecturing fields, which may be a source of great concern for HEIs. They are sometimes far removed from what is happening in the lecture halls, and this is easy to see when certain policies look good on paper but are inefficient. To ensure continued quality enhancement and assurance within the educational institution, standing practices need to be adaptable and changeable to fit the environment of society today.

Quality is still needed in the institutions; without it, the institution may as well close its doors (McKimm, 2008:190). Institutions and their leaders rarely seem to focus their energy on systemic structures (Barr & Tagg, 1995:189). The structure refers to the framework within which activities and processes occur to fulfil the purpose of the organisation (Barr & Tagg, 1995:18). For this entire process to be successful, the basic structures need to be altered to improve the organisational performance. If the basic structures reflect the thinking of an old paradigm, the best thinkers and innovators will immediately lose focus and waste time and money. To ensure effective and successful teaching and learning in an HET institution, the structures for the teaching for instruction / instruction paradigm need to shift to the teaching for learning / learning paradigm (Barr & Tagg, 1995:19). The only way that an institution will be able to enhance its practices is by adapting existing structures to better fit the new and evolving world. One such exiting new venture can be seen in the work done by the Quality Assurance Agency from the United Kingdom. It was established in 1997 and still remains one of the leading agencies for quality education to this day (cited in McKimm, 2008:188). They are doing quality research to try and reduce external scrutiny and bureaucracy and to move towards self-regulation and autonomy for institutions (McKimm, 2008:189). What all educational institutes can take from this is to ensure that their standing quality practices and policies are indicative of self-management; outside scrutiny will then be lowered and institutions can ensure effective teaching and learning practices and policies at ground level.

Quality is a practice that cannot be forfeited or slacked; there will always be an external third party who will impose rules and regulations upon institutions to try and enhance the

current practices. It is up to the college to micro-manage the situation to ensure that their standing rules, regulations and practices take into account what is happening at institutional level, and to adapt (if necessary) to ensure the inclusion of all parties involved.

# Different Alternatives for Teaching and Learning in HET Institutions: What will Work?

To ensure effective alternatives are given for teaching students in a 21<sup>st</sup> century classroom, it needs to be clearly defined and established exactly what alternatives to which practices are suggested. For the purposes of this article, alternative teaching strategies will be examined. It is important to mention that curricula for the different programmes on offer also need to take into account the different styles of teaching and learning. The curricula should determine: What should be taught? How should it be taught? How should learning (and teaching) be measured? (Pickard, 2007:51).

The taxonomy of Benjamin Bloom is a widely accepted standard for teaching and learning in the educational world today (Pickard, 2007:45). This taxonomy (meaning the classification of items) was introduced in the early 1950s because of the huge amount of World War II veterans that flooded the educational system in America (Pickard, 2007:45). It was created as a possible answer to one of the many questions asked by lecturers at that time: certain questions need to be asked in a certain way in order to test a student's knowledge and their ability to apply this knowledge in real-world examples.

Many institutes use the 'talk-and-chalk' method of lecturing (Colbeck et al., 2002:3), which is the traditional method of the lecturer standing at the front, teaching from of a textbook and perhaps using a chalkboard or whiteboard to indicate an important point. The 21<sup>st</sup> century Neomillennial students tend to get bored very easily with this type of lecturing, and this could lead to low attendance rates, drop-outs and low pass rates. To turn the classroom around, new alternative methods have to be reintroduced, so that all in class may experience an exciting and interesting class for a particular module.

This 'talk-and-chalk' method, many academics believe, are being used by lecturers, as they tend to use teaching strategies based on their own backgrounds, training, beliefs and, as

seen previously, their own preferred learning (teaching) style (Colbeck et al., 2002:1). In order for teaching and learning to be successful and effective, lecturers will have to adapt their approaches to teaching and learning which, in turn, will lead to better pass rates, higher-order thinking and critical thinking abilities among all involved, as well as personal and professional growth for the lecturer. Alternative strategies may include the following.

#### **Games and Simulations**

An exciting alternative to the traditional lecturing strategy has to do with games and simulations (Franzoni & Assar, 2009:19). Using this method, the lecturer provides an opportunity for the students to act out or simulate what the problem is and then to find solutions. For example, if students need to discover what the solution to a mathematical equation is, and they are struggling, they can get up in front of the class, explain their dilemma and the rest of the class can collaborate towards a solution. It is also particularly impressive for the practical modules (like engineering or computer-based subjects – where students are physically busy with an instrument or a computer) as the student can get help from peers without feeling ashamed.

Although this is a novel and exciting way to involve all in the teaching and learning process, it is imperative that with each good thing, there may be some bad. With games and simulations, the exercise could easily get out of hand, and the students may lose sight of the main objective of the game: to learn and get help in problem-solving. It will be up to the lecturer to manage the situation strictly so that it does not turn into chaos.

#### Learning Based on Problem-Solving

Problem-based learning is usually used to deal with complexities, ambiguities and multifunctional roles in the classroom (Lourenco & Jones, 2006:117). Many theorists equate this type of teaching to constructivism, which is the philosophical view on how we come to understand or know (Savery & Duffy, 2001:1). By adopting this approach in the class, the lecturer provides the background knowledge to the student, who is then expected to solve a problem on their own. By doing so, they learn because they do. Many believe the practical application of knowledge may instil a deeper understanding of the content (Savery & Duffy, 2001:1). This approach, as Lourenco and Jones (2006:117) posit, will help a student take ownership of a problem; they will be able to accept the relevance of the outcomes that they are being taught, and will be actively involved in their own learning. As with the previous strategy discussed, it is an area where the lecturer must monitor students closely in order not to lose sight of the real outcome to be discovered. The situation should be managed well enough so that all the students can be assisted (but not overwhelmed) with the information they need.

#### **Role Playing, Presentations and Brainstorming**

Some lecturers may be of the opinion that role playing is a useless and childish practice which does not fit in HET institutions (Franzoni & Assar, 2009:19). On one hand, the practice seems too much like an acting class, where students hone their acting skills rather than their educational skills. On the other hand, this practice links perfectly with the two previous methods: students are given a 'real-world' scenario and has to apply their knowledge in order to progress. The same goes with presentations. Students present information to their classmates. This teaches them the basic skills of public speaking and also 'forces' them to truly understand the work (in anticipation of answering questions about their work). They also learn because they are doing something. Brainstorming, seen by many as a great exercise to get information and clarity on something, can also be an excellent way to help students develop their skills. By brainstorming answers to certain problems or questions, many will be able to think deeper and more clearly about the problem. By using their peers as assistants, all students can collaborate towards an answer, making them feel a part of the 'team' and also responsible for their own learning.

#### Moving Towards Active and Collaborative Learning

During a traditional lecturer, the only active person is the lecturer, and the students are passively sitting trying to retain the load of information they are given (Felder & Brent, 2004:3). This is not how the 21<sup>st</sup> century (Neomillennial) students learn. They need to be actively part of their own learning in order for them to be able to learn and retain information (Dede, 2005:10). To improve the current traditional teaching strategies, it is imperative that lecturers somehow involve the students in this process. They can

incorporate this active learning, which includes frequent opportunities for reflection and feedback by the lecturer and the students, into curricula for the Neomillennial student. Collaborative learning refers to two or more students working together on one assignment, project or homework (Felder & Brent, 2004:4). Students working collaboratively in groups will develop high-level team-working abilities, which are needed to be successful in the working world. If students are allowed to collaborate on one or more subjects, they will not only develop communication or teamwork skills, but they will also be able to collectively aspire to understand and to learn the new information and/or outcomes presented to them (Bruffee, 1984:635). This is also known as a subset of collaborative learning or cooperative learning.

In the 1950s, Don Bennett, a Seattle businessman, climbed Mount Rainier. This sounds like nothing, but taking into consideration that he was a multiple amputee, this becomes a feat of some achievement! When he was asked how he did it, he only replied that '(you) cannot do it alone' (Johnson et al., 1991). This indicates that in order to become successful, one cannot be alone. When comparing this to current policies within HET institutions, it means that each student cannot stand alone when it comes to being successful. Cooperative learning, like blended learning (which will be discussed in sub-section 5 below), is an easy enough concept to understand, but the implementation is more difficult.

Cooperative learning is the process whereby the lecturer allows students to work collaboratively so that each one masters the course materials (Johnson et al., 1991). This helps the students to become the 'lecturer', teaching them to accept togetherness and, should someone fail to understand, they will all stand together to make sure everyone gets through the materials. Some strategies employed within this method are small discussion groups, peer-learning groups and student-to-student interactive classes (Johnson et al., 1991). This method allows students to take the responsibility of the class's success upon themselves. This means that if one fails, the rest fail too ('your success benefits me, and my success benefits you' and vice versa), which is effective to ensure that everyone learns the accurate information, in their own time and at their own pace (Johnson et al., 1991). Because the traditional classroom setting is so individualistic, cooperative learning will be an effective method to implement. This teaches students to take responsibility for their own

failures and successes (and those of their fellow classmates). They may also learn the much needed social skills and cooperation within the classroom (Johnson et al., 1991) and also the interpersonal skills needed to be successful in today's business world. This method, according to Felder and Brent (2004:4), will ensure that the lecturer meets five conditions:

- Positive interdependence
- Individual accountability
- Face-to-face interaction
- Facilitation of interpersonal skill development
- Periodic self-assessment of team functioning.

If the Neomillennial students work together to achieve their outcomes, they will work better in a team setting and they will be able to take responsibility for their own actions and for their own learning. Their skills will be developed based on real-world situations, problem-solving activities and teamwork functioning. Interpersonal communication will also increase, which in turn will increase their relationships (not only with themselves or their friends, but people of the larger society around them as well). Unfortunately, as with many new methods, certain challenges could exist with the implementation of this method. For one, this method relies totally on the cooperation of the students, thereby pushing the lecturer to the background (Johnson et al., 1991). Without proper control mechanisms, this can lead to total chaos within the classroom, and little to no effective learning will take place. Thus, before any changes are brought about, effective control and monitoring processes should be put in place to ensure that cooperative classes do not divert from the main purpose of studying through your peers (Johnson et al., 1991).

#### **Blended Learning – Strategies and Plans for the Future**

Another strategy that can be implemented for effective teaching in HEIs is blended learning. The first question to ask is what exactly blended learning is. The younger generation is inundated with technology in today's world – they have instant access and knowledge; everything happens and appears in real-time and they have a global knowledge of what is happening in the world at large. Because of this 'always online' lifestyle, many students want to have some form of technology in their classrooms. This is both familiar

and easier for them to understand. If you lack any technological savvy during lectures, your students will immediately be put off. They will become bored, uninterested and lazy, causing the learning method to be ineffective and at a low standard (see also Colbeck et al., 2002).

Though blended learning appears easy, many challenges can exist to implement this method. For one, where does one draw the line between having some multimedia products to assist and enhance the lecture and every student being on their iPad for the duration of the lecture? Technology can easily rob the classroom of the personal touch – conversations will be held online and no longer face-to-face. This, in a sense, also distracts and diminishes quality, as human beings need social contact (physical human-to-human contact), as identified by Abraham Maslow's Hierarchy of Needs (Cleary, 2014). In this hierarchy, he identified people as social beings, with their second level of needs being identified as social needs. If humans do not have this, their brains will wither, inhibiting them from experiencing any emotions or learning.

To prevent technology from taking over, the lecturer can decide to enhance or assist the theory with a funny, inspirational or relevant video on YouTube. This is the online website where people can upload and watch home-made movies and videos. Another option is to have the lecture on PowerPoint slides, with the students following along on their side (either on their laptops or in their textbooks). A popular method of using technology has arisen in the form of e-learning (short for electronic learning), where students can access course materials, lecture notes and additional reading materials on the internet. This also has a forum where students can discuss and share ideas online, known as discussion blogs or groups. This is especially popular with distance learning institutions. To be able to use this method, however, resources should be taken into consideration: is there enough access? Are the students able to afford paying extra for a laptop or iPad for this course? This, of course, needs to be established before this mode of delivery is implemented.

#### Work-Integrated Learning as an Alternative

For the past two decades, South Africa has undergone radical political and social change, thanks to democracy being implemented in 1994. In order to address issues of the past, and to redress all the wrong-doings, HET institutions have turned to civic engagement and service learning to help communities overcome racism (Bringle & Hatcher, 2005). This method, though widely accepted, appears to be implemented in increments, rather than as a whole.

Indiana University (cited in Bringle & Hatcher, 2005) defines civic engagement as 'active collaboration that builds on the resources, skills, expertise, and knowledge of the campus and community to improve the quality of life in communities in a manner that is consistent with the campus mission'. For this definition, work-integrated learning can be used as an alternative or even an additional teaching method for students. Work-integrated learning (WIL) is used to assist students in acquiring skills and competencies which will in turn help communities and the economy (when they are re-integrated into communities).

Many use this unique method to enhance their in-service learning capabilities. By doing this, they ensure that all students who pass through its doors get the high-level of quality education they need. They try to teach as many skills as possible, so that the students will have the best chance of being employed. In most instances, this service learning pedagogy is implemented for third year students or final year students as part of their curricula for a programme. Colleges then work together with other role players in the community (government or private sector) to teach students the knowledge and skills for the benefit of the community (Bringle & Hatcher, 2005). When these students have participated in this in-service learning, they ideally will have what they need to be productive and economic citizens of any community. This, in turn, will help with the enhancement of the community and its economy, and also the level of trust between normal, day-to-day people, and the academic institution (Bringle & Hatcher, 2005). The only challenge for the future is not to substitute service learning and civic engagement with normal, lecturer-student-centred classrooms. This will result in broken knowledge and a certain level of laziness (as students will not bother to go to class or take responsibility for their own activities).

# **Other Considerations**

Mention has to also be made to other factors that need to be addressed and/or changed in order to move to a better and more fitting paradigm for the Neomillennial classroom. Some challenges could include adapting assessments to better fit the trend of the real-world (i.e. instead of having the normal tests and assignments, perhaps a practical portfolio may suffice). Personal factors of students also need to be taken into account: Are they financially stable enough to survive three or more years in college? Will they have enough money to buy all the materials required? If a student comes to a HEI, it is widely assumed that they are 'privileged' enough to come, but the reality for most students seems to indicate that privilege has nothing to do with it. Many students work two or more jobs to pay for their studies, and many live in squalor just to afford their first year (Goldrick-Rab, 2010:456). In order for a paradigm to be all encompassing, it should make mention of these external, somewhat uncontrollable factors as well, since nothing exists in a vacuum. Each of these warrants research on the topic, hence this paper has not focused on the uncontrollable external factors (as the focus was more on teaching and learning within the college, from the perspective of the institution and the lecturer).

#### **Conclusion: Moving to a New Paradigm**

By looking at the different learning styles, the various teaching strategies and dimensions, the alternative methods to teaching, as well as policies and procedures that need to change, it has become clear that a comprehensive and new definition for a teaching and learning paradigm that fits all of the above needs to be developed. One cannot operate alone, and in order to be successful (and to provide effective, high-quality teaching and learning), institutions, lecturers and students have to work together. In order for HET institutions to be of a high quality, and to produce employable students, the academic leadership and skills should be of a high standard. Current knowledge, skills development and human relations should be taken into account when trying to ascertain how and when to change an institution's quality assurance policies and procedures (Ramsden, 1998).

If staff have knowledge, then their methods of teaching will also reflect this; they will help impart their knowledge to the eager minds of the young students, which has an overall increase of that institution's quality (see also Ramsden, 2003). This process, aptly coined by Ramsden (in 1998) as 'learning to lead', will help all academic staff find comfort in their teaching methods, and to duly teach the next generation how to become effective and knowledgeable leaders for tomorrow.

In order to assist with this, knowledge has to be strengthened and deepened. All lecturers must be constantly up to date with what they have to teach, and also with what is happening in the world around them. When lecturers are up to date with new technologies, pedagogical thoughts and methods of learning, then they will have sufficient skills and competencies to teach others. With this, leadership within the academic institutions will also need to be effective, because without effective and adequate leadership, all will suffer and fail (Ramsden, 2003). Management should learn to lead with conviction, compassion and strength so that other staff members could also learn to lead by this example (see also Ramsden, 2003). Several new alternative methods need to be implemented within the college to ensure that effective teaching and learning takes place. This new paradigm may thus be defined as explained next.

This new paradigm is an all-inclusive pedagogy that is aimed at providing alternatives to the traditional teaching and learning for a higher education institution. It is a high-quality approach that changes the views of the academic world, from teaching to produce results to teaching to learn. This new paradigm takes into account the differences between lecturer and student, student and lecturer, lecturer and institution and student and institution. These differences are then encoded into a manageable and controllable format, which will be applicable and learnt by the different students in a classroom (including the lecturer). It needs to be an active, interesting, easy and affordable paradigm that will work with the new ICTs and the community to strive towards excellence. This paradigm takes into account the diversity and uniqueness of every single HET class, and could professionally and personally develop its staff to be able to cope with this unique and diverse environment. It considers the lecturers and strives to lower their occupational stress for effective teaching and learning in all HET institutions in South Africa.

#### List of References

Barkhuizen, N. & Rothmann, S. 2008. Occupational stress of academic staff in South African higher education institutions. *South African journal of psychology*, 38(2):321-336.

Barr, R.B. & Tagg, J. 1995. From teaching to learning: a new paradigm for undergraduate education. *Change*, 27(6):12-26.

Bringle, R.G. & Hatcher, J.A. 2005. Civic engagement and service learning: implications for higher education in America and South Africa. *Education as change*, 11(3):79-89.

Bruffee, K.A. 1984. Collaborative learning and the "Conversation of mankind". *College English*, 46(7):635-652.

Cleary, S. 2014. Communication: a hands on approach. 2<sup>nd</sup> ed. Cape Town: Juta.

Colbeck, C.L., Cabrera, A.F. & Marine, R.J. 2002. Faculty motivation to use alternative teaching methods. (Paper presented at the Annual Meeting of the American Educational Research Association. New Orleans, La., 1-5 April.)

Darling-Hammond, L. & Richardson, N. 2009. Research review / teacher learning: what really matters? *How teachers learn*, 66(5):46-53.

Dede, C. 2005. Planning for neomillennial learning styles. *Educause quarterly*, 28(1):7-12.

DuFour, R. 2004. What is a "Professional learning community"? *Educational leadership*, 61(1):6-11.

Felder, R.M. & Brent, R. 2004. The ABC's of engineering: Abet, Bloom's taxonomy, cooperative learning, and so on. (Proceedings of the 2004 American Society for Engineering Education Annual Conference and Exposition, 25 June, v. 1.)

Fry, A; Ketteridge, S and Marhsall, S (eds). 2008. *A Handbook for Teaching and Learning in Higher Education: Enhancing Academic Practice*. 3<sup>rd</sup> Ed. Routledge: New York.

Felder, R.M. & Silverman, L.K. 1988. Learning and teaching styles in engineering education. *Engineering education*, 78(7):674-681.

Felder, R and Silverman, L. (n.d.) *Felder-Silverman Learning Style Model*. Online: available atwww.thepeakperformancecenter.com/educationallearning/learning/preferences/learning-styles/felder-silverman/ [Accessed: 20 July 2017]

Franzoni, A.L. & Assar, S. 2009. Student learning styles adaptation method based on teaching strategies and electronic media. *Educational technology and society*, 12(4):15-29.

Goldrick-Rab, S. 2010. Challenges and opportunities for improving community college student success. *Review of educational research*, 80(3):437-469.

Johnson, D.W., Johnson, R.T. & Smith, K.A. 1991. Cooperative learning: increasing college faculty instructional production. Washington, D.C.: George Washington University Press. (ASHE-ERIC higher education report, 4.)

Lieberman, A. & Pointer Mace, D.H. 2008. Teacher learning: the key to educational reform. *Journal of teacher education*, 59(3):226-234.

Lourenco, F. & Jones, O. 2006. Developing entrepreneurship education: comparing traditional and alternative teaching approaches. *International journal of entrepreneurship education*, 4(1):111-140.

McKimm, J. 2008. Teaching quality, standards and enhancements. (*In* Fry, A., Ketteridge, S. & Marshall, S., *eds*. A handbook for teaching and learning in higher education: enhancing academic practice. 3<sup>rd</sup> ed. New York: Routledge. p. 186.)

Morton, A. 2008. Lecturing to large groups. (*In* Fry, A., Ketteridge, S. & Marshall, S., *eds.* A handbook for teaching and learning in higher education: enhancing academic practice. 3<sup>rd</sup> ed. New York: Routledge. p. 58-71.)

Pickard, M.J. 2007. The new Bloom's taxonomy: an overview for family and consumer sciences. *Journal of family and consumer sciences education*, 25(1):45-56.

Ramsden, P. 2003. Learning to teach in higher education. 2<sup>nd</sup> ed. London: RoutledgeFalmer.

Savery, J.R. & Duffy, T.M. 2001. Problem-based learning: an instructional model and its constructivist framework. *Educational technology*, 35(5):31-38.

# EFFECT OF TRAINING AND DEVELOPMENT ON EMPLOYEE PERFORMANCE AT AN ACADEMIC ADVISING CENTRE IN DURBAN

#### Samuel Bangura (Educor)

Samuel.Bangura@educor.co.za

In any organisation, employees are considered a very important source of competitive advantage. The success or accomplishment of organisational goals by any organisation depends on their performance. Hence, it is very significant for senior management to invest in training and development to improve employee performance. The concept of training and development is concerned with the improvement of employees' skills needed to perform their job at the workplace, at the same time to increase and grow them at various level of management. The main aim of this study was to investigate the effect of training and development on employee performance at a particular academic advising centre in Durban. The research approach adopted conforms to qualitative research. It reviews the literature and multiple case studies on the significance of training and development as a leverage to employee performance. The data collection method was based on an in-depth interview method and thematic analysis was employed to analyse data. The outcome of the study was averred to top management in the form of a checklist on the need for training and development in organisations.

**Keywords:** training and development, employee performance, off-the-job training, on-the-job training

#### Introduction

The fierce competition, complex work environment, state-of-the-art technological development and uncertainties associated with business have made the need for training and development more common in almost all organisations, whether public or private. According to Rafiq (2015:1), there is a breach in the connection between knowledge provided in formal schooling and that required by the business organisation. To fill this gap, training is required. The same author asserted that knowledge is an impetus that helps organisations to deal with turbulent, uncertain and complex global environment and that intricate business challenges have to be addressed easily with superior and selective knowledge gathered during training and development sessions. For these purposes,

companies and organisations are paying more attention to training and development. Falola et al. (2014:162) asserted that training and development is crucial strategic tools for the effective improvement of individual and organisational performance. Therefore, companies are spending money on training and development with certitude that it will provide them a competitive advantage in the complex world of business. Conversely, for any company to achieve its specified goals and objectives in the competitive and volatile business environment, sufficient and significance training and development of staff cannot be overemphasised. The same authors, however, posit that businesses are expected to analyse and identify training and development needs of their employees as well as develop and design training and development methods that optimally fit the much-desired requirements of their workforce towards the actualisation of any slated objectives.

In line with the preceding assertions, Obisi (2011:83) averred that training and development are interchangeably used. Nonetheless, it can be distinguished from the other. Noe et al. (2012:23) asserted that training is used mainly for detailed work purposes while development goes beyond details development, and it is not concerned with only those activities which improve job performance, but also with those which protrude employee personality. Premised on these thoughts, training and development is vital, especially when it is geared towards employee performance development. Based on the preceding literature and on the nature of the service rendered by the academic advisory centre, considerable emphasis has been placed on the practice of training and development. The effect of it, as a process on employee performance, was the focus of the study.

#### **Problem Statement**

Owing to globalisation and fuelled by a competitive environment, the ability of organisations to effectively attract, develop and retain capacities that leverage competition across the business has become a priority (Chuang, 2013:23). In addition, the pace at which organisational work processes are transforming is now creating the need for companies to change their employee work practices and familiarise themselves with contemporary happenings in the world of work. This has equally placed substantial burden on

organisational leadership to keep their workforce well informed on the current changes taking place in the work environment.

Training and development undoubtedly impacts on organisational competitiveness, revenue and performance (Elnaga & Imran, 2013:137). In general terms, employees ought to learn innovative skills in the workplace since this might act as an influence to easily acquaint themselves with skills and capabilities expected in a new position. However, when not well planned and implemented, training and development can be a huge financial loss to the organisation. In the same vein, training and development can be problematic as the poor implementation and identification of training and development needs make the process difficult and may have a negative effect on the employee. This study therefore investigated the effect of training and development on employee performance at a particular academic advisory centre in Durban.

#### **Research Objectives**

- To determine the particular type of training and development at the academic advising centre.
- To investigate the effect of training and development on employee performance at the academic advisory centre.
- To offer recommendations on training and development as a tool to optimise employee performance at the academic advising centre.

#### **Research Questions**

- What type of training and development method is used in the academic advising centre?
- What is the effect of training and development on employee performance at the academic advisory centre?
- What recommendations can be offered on the improvement of the current training and development at the academic advising centre?

#### Literature Review

According to Nel et al. (2011:370), well planned and implemented training and development methods have always served as a catalyst for the improvement and empowerment of both individual and institutional competitiveness. Organisations both in the private and non-private sectors have equally recognised the critical role of a skilled and knowledgeable workforce in providing competitive advantages in national and international business operations.

#### **Definition of Training and Development**

Armstrong (2009:664) stated that training and development is concerned with the improvement and development of the skill base of an organisation by taking into consideration the knowledge, skills, capabilities, behaviours and attitudes of its workforce. The concept has been a long-time provider of synergy for organisational employees and their strategic plans. Scott et al. (cited in Olubukunola, 2015:9) asserted that training and development refers to the increase of employee knowledge in the areas that leverage performance.

#### **Training and Development Methods**

Within the concept of human resource management, there are mainly two methods for the workforce and managers of organisations to acquire knowledge, skills and attitudes. One is through formal off-the-job training methods, and the other is through on-the-job training methods. When the on-the-job training method is properly balanced with a classroom off-the-job training, the real learning takes place (Armstrong & Taylor, 2014:23).

#### **Off-the-job training methods**

- **The Lecture** is probably the most frequently used form of presentation in training. It is an effective and low-cost method of conveying information in an instructional setting and is used for conveying information to a large group.
- Case Studies are with concerned with presenting to participants a written description of a hypothetical problem in a business setting. In this regard,

participants will be required to read the case and identify a problem and then recommend a solution.

- **Role Playing** involves a two-person situation whereby participants or sometimes facilitators assume the roles of characters and role-play a simulated situation.
- **Business Games** is a simulated work environment in which trainees assume different roles to enact real-life business scenarios (Erasmus et al., 2015:124).

#### **On-the-job training methods**

- **Job Rotation** is generally concerned with the moving of supervisory or managerial role from one department to another within the organisation on a systematic basis.
- **Coaching** is a well-planned and prepared one-to-one instruction between a more experienced manager and a less experienced subordinate. Coaching is generally short in interactions and limited in terms of period and time.
- Understudy Assignment is almost certainly a coaching and job rotation process and is a practically fair and quick way to prepare a selected junior manager for a greater management responsibility through a process of learning by doing (Erasmus et al., 2015:271).

#### **Training and Development Process**

Human resource management offers the vital basis for the application of managing the people side of business operations. Its overall purpose is to ensure that an organisation is able to achieve success through people. Based on the preceding statement, the significance of the concept of training and development arises. The thought on training and development practices encompasses an initial step or stage that deals with the needs analysis aspect of the concept. Erasmus et al. (2015:124) contended that any shortcoming or gap preventing employees from achieving their aims and objectives through their performance can be overcome, or at least be minimised through the practice of strategic training and development. The second phase of the process is the planning and development of the training programme itself. Coetzee (cited in Erasmus et al., 2015:155) maintains that a learning programme is a combination of courses, modules or unit of learning, learning support materials and methodology by which learners or trainees end up

achieving the planned learning outcomes are involved at this stage. The third phase of the training and development process is concerned with the preparation and planning of the training and development programme. During this stage, the trainer ensures that the framework of the training programme corresponds with the expected outcome. Following this process, the particular training and development programme will be implemented and then evaluated.

#### Framework for Training and Development

Generally, the effectiveness and success of a training and development programme are only possible through logical and systematic implementation of it. Through the application of an appropriate training and development model, there is a high chance of success. One such model is the training and development model of Camp et al. (cited in Erasmus et al., 2015:16). The model views an effective training and development process through a six-phase process that focuses on providing effective, targeted training and development. Each phase of the model moves the training and development process forward, and the result of each phase serves as an input for the next phase.

#### Phase 1: Identify training needs

During this phase, the particular training and development need that increases efficiency in job performance is identified. In the regard, the reasons for the training and development must be investigated and the training and development programme must be formulated so that the identified training and development needs will be addressed.

#### Phase 2: Mapping the training and development approach

This phase stipulates that once training and development have been identified, objectives that are considered measurable must be set up and a training and development design must be devised to conform to the prescribed needs. Erasmus et al. (2015:15) stated that once the particular training and development needs have been identified, the aims and objectives that define what type of training is required must be formulated. Generally, objectives are what guide the trainer to the process of choosing a training approach that meets the training and development needs (Erasmus et al., 2015:23).

#### **Phase 3: Produce effective learning tools**

Within this phase, the chosen training approach that has been developed in Phase 2 allows for the creation of the actual training materials. These might include training and development manuals or material to support the training and development programme, which can take the form of on-the-job training and development or an instructor-led course. The objectives of Phase 2 can be used as a guide to developing training and development materials.

#### Phase 4: Application of successful training and development techniques

During this phase, the training and development programme is delivered to the target group. The chosen tools in Phase 3 will help determine the appropriate approach during this stage. Example training and development courses that are associated with computer usage must be delivered on a one-to-one approach.

#### Phase 5: Calculate measurable results

During this phase, the training and development facilitator will determine whether the stated objectives were achieved and whether the training and development approach used met the targeted aim or literally contributed to job improvement. The outcome of the applied training and development programme will be communicated, and the redesigned measure will be taken.

#### Phase 6: Track ongoing follow-through

Once the success of Phase 5 has been determined, the training and development facilitator must certify that the training and development remains objective. As organisations change constantly, applicable training and development programmes must be developed to adapt to these changes (Decenzo & Robbins, 2012:23).

#### **Benefits of Training and Development**

The importance of training and development has never been of lower importance in the management ladder of literature. Accordingly, its importance is highly notable in human
resource management literature, some of these are not limited to being an effective tool, which contributes immensely to organisational success. In addition, training and development acts as a catalyst to help organisations move fast ahead of their competitors. Nassazi (2013:21) states that the acquiring and improvement of knowledge, skills and attitudes are aligned to the task needed to do the job. Cole (cited in Nassazi, 2013:22) averred that training and development provide leverage to employees in regard to their performance, and maintained that constructive planning and implementation of training and development programmes offer employees high motivational levels and confidence on their jobs.

In addition, training and development allows challenges to be eradicated as employees who have been trained and developed can make better and frugal use of material and equipment. This leads to lower cost of production. Furthermore, training and development offers a sense of job security. This in turn allows for a low labour turnover and absenteeism in the workplace (Nassazi, 2013:23).

The management of change is an important process in business operations. Hence, a constructive training and development programme will effectively support change management processes in the organisation to create an understanding and participation of employees in a change management process. Equally important, through the process of training and development the required knowledge and skill needed to adjust to the new situation are offered (Armstrong, 2009:67).

In sum, Erasmus et al. (2015:56) averred that training and development provides recognition and create opportunities for promotion and greater responsibility when well implemented.

# Challenges facing Training and Development, Application of Training and Development Techniques

Hameed and Waheed (2011:225) provided some challenges to training and development in organisations, asserting that the involvement of employees in a training and development programme is critical and in some organisations employee involvement is limited. Equally important, top management's attitude towards training and development programmes and less opportunity regarding promotion are some of the challenges faced by training and development practitioners.

Erasmus et al. (2015:89) asserted that organisational culture can affect training and development. For example, if employees who are supposed to undergo a particular training and development programme are not encouraged and supported by senior management, there will be a decrease in performance. This will lead to demotivation.

Moreover, the sincerity and commitment of the senior management to training and development normally affect the training and development programme. Obisi (2011:12) stated that training and development are often considered costly by senior management, thereby decreasing its importance in organisations.

Limited chances of promotion and the lack of training and development as a whole often deter employees from the training and development activities (Armstrong & Taylor, 2014:23).

In this regard and founded on the above assertions, training and development programmes are important for organisations, and the planning and implementation of it requires suitable training and development methods. These methods should be able to address identified needs, assist in the addressing of them and subsequently evaluate them. Obisi (2011:82) stated that in some organisations, training and development is restricted as it is considered expensive, prompting money to be used on other projects. In this regard, it is fair to state that some organisations do not take training and development programmes seriously. However, the same author states that for training and development to be recognised as an important tool for employee development, it should be seen as strategic, affirming that organisations should continuously apply training and development activities as a continuous process and not as an activity to be done once. It should be placed as a key tool that aims to train and develop new, old, transferred and promoted employees. Training and development should be an integral part of the management process, which in turn requires managers to regularly review with their teams and the individuals reporting to them (Armstrong, 2009:23).

Equally important, Decenzo and Robbins (2012:90) contended that for organisations to improve the competence of their workforce, it is very important for them to take training and development very seriously as well as plan and implement it effectively. Armstrong and Taylor (2014:23), however, cautioned that for training and development programmes to be effective, its aims and objectives must be taken into consideration. This view was reinforced by Obisi (2011:85), stating that when not well planned, training and development should not be undertaken; it should be implemented and embarked upon when it is able to address employee performance problems.

In line with the preceding statement, it is apparent that training and development can influence employee performance. Elnaga and Imran (2013:140) stated that employee performance is vital for organisational and business operations and that higher productivity levels in employees are linked to their performance. Thus, an effective training and development programme can address performance problems and lead to high performance levels in organisations (Armstrong & Taylor, 2014:78).

#### The Relationship between Training and Development and Employee Performance

According to Guest (cited in Elnaga & Imran, 2013:141), training and development programmes are considered as one of the most important human resource management practices and accounts for the quality of employees' knowledge, expertise and competence in organisations. Khan et al. (2011:90) ascertained a positive correlation between training and development and the performance of an employee, as r=.233. From their findings, the possibility of an organisation to gain higher returns is limited without the best utilisation of its human resources. In this regard, training and development can offer chances to managers to identify and train employees who are deprived of a competence that allows for organisational goals achievement. In the same vein, Armstrong (2009:23) averred that constructive training and development programmes could provide job satisfaction for the employee especially, as it seeks to develop their skills and abilities needed in the organisation.

# **Research Methodology**

The study comprised an investigation of the human resource management concept of training and development. On this premise, the qualitative approach that relies heavily on an in-depth interview for data collection was considered to be suitable for the research process. Rahman (2016:104) offered benefits on the use of qualitative research approaches and methods in the research process, asserting that the qualitative research approach produces a detailed description of participants' feelings, opinions and experiences, and interprets the meanings of their actions. In addition, Chalhoub-Deville and Deville (cited in Rahman, 2016:104) argued that qualitative approaches are employed to achieve deeper insights into a research problem. The population for this study consisted of 60 academic advisers at the academic advising centre. To achieve the objectives of the study, six academic advisers from the six faculties, namely Business, Creative, Education, Social Sciences, Informational Technology and Technical were questioned through a data collection process with an interview schedule consisting of seven questions. The collection of data in a research process is an integral part of conducting research; with the use of a suitable data collection technique, the value of research is greatly enhanced (Dawson, 2010:34).

Jankowicz (2005:321) averred that sampling is a social science research technique that allows the researcher to identify respondents concerning the research questions. With this study, a judgemental process in the form of purposive sampling which describes any sample that is directly related to the predetermine non-probability criteria was used. The study was exploratory in nature with insights solely drawn from the interview outcome and existing literature of diverse studies, reports and journals. According to Dawson (2010:119), data analysis is concerned with the analysis of research data. In this regard, the process of analysing data through the identification of theme is called thematic analysis. This type of analysis is highly inductive, and allows themes that are not imposed by the researcher to emerge. With this type of analysis, data collection and analysis take place simultaneously; background reading can form part of the analysis process, especially if it can help to explain an emerging theme. Therefore, thematic analysis was used to analyse data in this study. The concern for reliability and validity was highly acknowledged.

Sekeran (2006:203) indicated that reliability is concerned with the extent to which a measure is free from biases. For the sake of reliability, test-retest reliability was used. It took into consideration the coefficient obtained from the interview instrument and repeated it for the second time to ascertain the correlation between the results. On the part of validity, content validity was used, which allows for the validation of content through the measurement of proposed items to adequately check if they are representative of the concept.

## **Research Findings**

In analysing the research data, themes, issues and units regarding the training and development programme were identified and organised into building blocks, which were then compared with an effective training and development metric to investigate the effect of training and development on employee performance. According to Nel et.al. (2011:370), employee performance through training and development has always been a powerful leverage for the improvement of both individual opportunity and institutional competitiveness. Top management in organisations has also recognised the critical role a skilled and knowledgeable workforce can play in securing competitive advantages in national and international markets. Armstrong (2009:664) perceived the human resource management concept of training and development as a practical method of attaining and developing employee and organisational knowledge, skills, capabilities, behaviours and attitudes. However, based on the research problem, the concept can affect the performance of employees negatively when it is not well designed and developed or constructively implemented. Equally important, it can lead to heavy financial loss and a demotivated workforce, especially in the case of the individual employee because of poor planning. Established on this notion and on existing literature on training and development programmes, the researcher identified themes that reflect on the concepts as per the literature review. The first theme was on the benefits and effectiveness of training and development, which is correlated to employee motivation and performance. The second theme was derived from the first theme and refers to the fact that effective planning and implementation of training and development can positively influence employee performance and organisational productivity.

The aim of the study was to explore the effect of training and development on employee performance. Training and development is the independent variable and employee performance is the dependent variable. In this regard, a well-constructed interview schedule with questions built around the research objectives was asked. A total of 49 academic advisers were invited to participate in the study. In line with the objective of the study, participants were asked to offer their opinion on certain thematic areas that were identified, namely planning of training and development, need analysis and alignment of training and development objectives with that of employees. In this regard, respondents' views on the planning and implementation of training and development were positive as they consider the particular training and development in the centre to be well constructive, aligned to their training needs and the nature of the job in the centre. It can be deduced that the faculty heads in the centre equally ensure that the training and development programmes in the centre are aligned with the aims and objectives of the centre. Jehanzeb and Beshir (2013:34) averred that a manager's role in training and development in the organisation is concerned with the provision of insight and purpose of a training and development programme to trainees.

Employee involvement in the process and how training and development programmes impact were equally mentioned to respondents, and thematic areas such as motivation, increase in performance, job satisfaction, reduction of accident and the addition of new capabilities as results of training and development were similarly identified. Respondents' views were positive on the stated themes. This affirms the views that a training and development activity that encourages employee participation allows new potential to employees to perform tasks, resulting in employee effectiveness.

Ni and Wang (2015:67) concurred that training and development in organisations offers possible development and self-realisation of the employees, while it can also lead to job satisfaction and performance increase. A large number of respondents acknowledged this fact.Recommendations on the effectiveness of training and development programmes were suggested to the respondents; a large number of respondents assented to the training and development cycle approach to training and development. Nischithaa et al. (2014:2) state that the training and development cycle is circular. The first step starts with a needs

assessment. The second step is concerned with the planning. After the successive planning, the training and development is effectively carried out; finally, the programme is evaluated.

The leading finding of this study revealed that training and development has a positive effect on employee's performance when effectively planned. Huselid (cited in Asfaw et al., 2015:23) asserted that the provision of providing formal and informal training and development to employees in organisations has a positive effect on employees' development.

## Recommendations

Based on the literature review and research findings, it was recommended and acknowledged that training and development can positively influence the performance of employees, depending on the meticulous planning and implementation process and the aligning of the training and development programme to the organisational and employee needs. In line with the research aim and problem statement and for any successful training and development programme, it is recommended that the senior management of any organisation premise their training and development programmes on contemporary training and development models such as high-impact model. This type of training and development model allows for the identification of training and development needs, maps an approach, produces effective tools that can enhance learning and successful training and development programmes, calculates the outcome and then follows through. It is also recommended that top management provide a conducive surrounding that can serve as an advantage for a successful training and development programme, for instance an environment surrounded by tools that allow for the completion of training and development tasks. By the same token, it is vital for training and development managers to take into consideration employee perceptions and understanding of their task and duties as it is considered a significant aspect before the commencement of any training and development programme. For example, employees must have basic knowledge of computing to be able to complete a computer-based programme.

#### Conclusion

This study stated general overviews and thoughts on the human resource management concept of training and development. Information on the findings of the study state that training and development are important and can contribute to both organisational and employee performance. However, when not well planned and implemented, its impact can be detrimental to both the organisational and employees in general. These findings were postulated and allowed for informed recommendations on the training and development methods and its application in organisations.

## List of References

Armstrong, M. 2009. Armstrong handbook of strategic human resource management. 5<sup>th</sup> ed. London: Kogan Page.

Armstrong, M. & Taylor, S. 2014. Armstrong's handbook of human resource management practice. 13th ed. London: Kogan Page.

Asfaw, A.M., Argaw, M.D. & Bayissa, L. 2015. The impact of training and development on employee performance and effectiveness: a case study of District Five Administration Office, Bole Sub-City, Addis Ababa, Ethiopia. *Journal of human resource and sustainability studies*, 12(3):188-202.

Chuang, S.F. 2013. Evaluating training and development practices in Taiwan: challenges and opportunities. *Journal of human resource development international*, 16(2):97-99.

Dawson, C. 2010. Practical research methods. Oxford: How to Books.

Decenzo, D. & Robbins, S.P. 2012. Fundamentals of human resource management. 10th ed. Hoboken, N.J.: Wiley.

Elnaga, A. & Imran, A. 2013. The effect of training on employee performance. *European journal of business and management*, 5(4):84-95.

Erasmus, B., Loedolff, P., Van Hoek, Z., Mda, T. & Nel, P. 2015. Managing training and development in South Africa. 5th ed. Cape Town: Oxford University Press.

Falola, H., Osibanjo, A. & Ojo, S. 2014. The effectiveness of training and development on employees' performance and organization competitiveness in the Nigerian Banking Industry. *Bulletin of the Transilvania, University of Brasov, Economic sciences*, 7:161-172.

Hameed, A. & Waheed, A. 2011. Employee development and it's effect on employee performance, a conceptual framework. *International journal of business and social science*, 2(13):224-229.

Jankowicz, A.D. 2005. Business research project. 4<sup>th</sup> ed. New Delhi: Cengage Learning.

Jehanzeb, K. & Beshir, N.A. 2013. Training and development program and its benefits to employee organization: a conceptual study. *European journal of business and management*, 5(5):243-252.

Khan, R.A.G., Khan, A.F. & Khan, M.A. 2011. Impact of training and development on organizational performance. *Global journal of management and business research*, 11(7):62-68.

Nassazi, A. 2013. Effects of training on employee performance: evidence from Uganda. Rotterdam: University of Applied Sciences. (Thesis - PhD.)

Nel, P., Werner, A., Du Plessis, A., Ngalo, O., Poisat, P., Van Hoek, L. & Botha, C. 2011. Human resource management. 8th ed. Cape Town: Oxford University Press.

Ni, C. & Wang, Y. 2015. The impact of perceived organizational support and core selfevaluation on employee's psychological well-being. *Journal of human resource and sustainability studies*, 6(3):73-81.

Nischithaa, P. & Narasimha Rao, M.V.A.L. 2014. The Importance of training and development in hotel industry. *International journal of business and administration research review*, 1(5):50-56.

Noe, R.A., Hollenbeck. J.R., Gerhart T.B. & Wright, P.M. 2012. Fundamentals of human resource management. New York: McGraw-Hill.

Obisi, C. 2011. Employee training and development in Nigerian organisations. *Australian journal of business and management research*, 1(9):82-91.

Olubukunola, S. 2015. Personnel training and development as a tool for organizational efficiency. Lahti, Finland: Lahti University of Applied Sciences. (Bachelors Minidissertation in International Business.)

Rahman, S. 2016. The advantages and disadvantages of using qualitative and quantitative approaches and methods in language "Testing and assessment" research. *A literature review, journal of education and learning*, 6(1):56-58.

Rafiq, M. 2015. Training evaluation in an organization using Kirkpatrick Model: a case study of PIA. *Journal of entrepreneurship & organization management*, 4:151.

Sekeran, U. 2006. Research methods for business: a skill building approach. 5th ed. Queensland: Australia Wiley.

# THE EFFECT OF POVERTY ON EDUCATION IN SOUTH AFRICA

# Martinus Jacobus Nortje (Damelin: Bloemfontein)

martinnortje@gmail.com

This article presents an in-depth study into the literature on the effect of poverty on education in South Africa. To compile this research article, qualitative research in the form of secondary data was used to determine the effect of poverty on education. The researcher conducted this study to prove that education is crucial in reducing poverty in a country. This study indicates that there are high levels of poverty currently present in South Africa. The education standards are also poor in comparison to other countries. In addition, various factors are identified that have a direct influence on education in South Africa, among these are cost of education, capabilities of teachers, infrastructure and resources available. These findings can help to provide a guideline for government and other institutions with respect to the problems that need solutions in order to lift the country out of the current education crisis. There is a staggering number of South African children who are living in poverty and who do not attend schools.

Keywords: developing country, education, illiterate, poverty, uneducated

## Introduction

'The 30% minimum pass requirement instituted by the Minister of Basic Education is a violation of the rights of South Africa's children to quality education' (Allen, 2014).

The low pass requirement currently in force is incapable of providing learners with the skills they require. It leads to individuals who cannot advance their education or obtain lasting employment. Only a small number of South African schools are classified as 'functional' when measured by the attendance of both staff and learners (Wilkinson, 2015). Furthermore, Wilkinson (2015) found that 80% of South African schools cannot provide learners with the necessary skills they require. This can be attributed to poor management of funds by schools and the government, various socio-economic factors influencing learner attendance, as well as staff qualifications. The aim of this study is to determine the effects of poverty on education in South Africa by examining the factors that influence education, poverty in South Africa, and accessibility to and affordability of education in

this country. As a result of the sensitive state of affairs in developing countries, we are presented with the following question: What effect does poverty have on the education of children in developing countries?

In order to address the question, the following four research objectives are pursued:

- to analyse current literature to determine the state of education in developing countries like South Africa;
- to use literature to determine the factors affecting education in South Africa;
- to establish the current situation regarding poverty in South Africa; and
- to determine how the accessibility to and affordability of education influences student success.

# **Research Methodology**

According to Moffitt (2017) research methodology is a methodical plan for performing research. It can be divided into two methods, namely qualitative and quantitative (Moffitt, 2017).

Therefore, based on the theoretical position on the topic of this article, the limited timeframe and the need for an in-depth understanding of the problem at hand, qualitative research in the form of secondary data, such as the available literature and published works, will be used to analyse current literature available to complete this study.

## Literature Review

## **Education in Developing Countries**

According to the Cambridge Dictionary (2017), a developing country is defined as 'a country with little industrial and economic activity and where people generally have low incomes'. Very few people in developing countries are illiterate. Samuel (2013) states that education is important for a country to grow economically and socially.

According to Hanushek and Wößmann (2010), education has long been seen as a key determinant of a country's economic well-being. Furthermore, education is a key factor in

reducing unemployment in developing countries, which in turn will lead to economic growth (Samuel, 2013). Hanushek and Wößmann (2010) argue that education can increase human capital in the labour force, leading to an increase in labour productivity. Furthermore, education increases the innovative ability of the economy and the new knowledge promotes growth. Education facilitates the transmission of knowledge required to comprehend new information and implement new technologies, which also promotes economic growth.

In numerous developing countries, only a small percentage of children complete primary school and even fewer children complete secondary school (Epstein & Yutas, 2012). There are various reasons for children not staying in school, as identified by Epstein and Yutas (2012). These reasons include difficulty to reach schools as well as the cost of schooling. This is seen as a crisis in many developing countries. Children being denied the right to education due to poverty are also being denied various opportunities, such as being employed, supporting their families and contributing to the development of their communities (Brende, 2015). In work published by ACEI-Global (2014), it is stated that children should have access to free primary education that is accessible as educating children can aid the reduction poverty. A school should be a safe place for children in a developing country where they can receive support and supervision as well as vaccines, fresh water and food (ACEI-Global, 2014).

'All countries, regardless of their national wealth, stand to gain from more and better education' (Brende, 2015). This is especially true in South Africa, where high levels of poverty can be reduced by educating citizens.

# **Education in South Africa**

South Africa ranks 75<sup>th</sup> out of 76 according to the League Table of Education Systems drawn up in 2015 (The Economist, 2017). According to the latest statistics, 27% of students who have received schooling for six years cannot read.

Only 37% of pupils who start school pass their matriculation exam, and a low 4% of those students go on to finish tertiary education and earn a degree (The Economist, 2017). The Department of Higher Education and Training found that 2.8 million citizens aged 18 to

24 are unemployed, not enrolled in an educational institution and not receiving training (Gater & Isaacs, 2012). These are significant statistics that highlight the crisis we are in as a country. South African pupils, in comparison to their peers in other countries, lack certain skills and knowledge. This reflects badly on the standard of South African education (ExpatCapeTown.com, 2016).

As stated by the Centre for Education Policy Development (2017), South Africa has a highcost, low-performance education system, which does not compare well with education systems in other developing countries.

Students and the government face a substantial financial burden as a large number of students live in rural areas with poor conditions (ExpatCapeTown.com, 2016). Local governments are attempting to correct this imbalance. UNICEF (2017) found that South Africa spends a higher percentage of its GDP<sup>1</sup> on education than any other African country. Yet, no significant change in the country's education crises can be observed. Based on an article written by Govender (2017), 18 South African schools obtained a 0% pass rates in the 2016 national senior certificate exams.

Many South African students experience broken school careers due to factors such as irregular attendance, teacher absenteeism, teenage pregnancy and violence in schools (UNICEF, 2017). If solutions to this cannot be found, the future of South Africa's education system looks gloomy. Statistics indicate that 27% of public schools do not have access to running water, while 78% do not have libraries or computers (UNICEF, 2017). This leads to poor school infrastructure, which influences the well-being of students, as well as their overall performance.

# Factors Affecting Education in South Africa

Dirks (2013) identified various challenges that negatively affect education in South Africa. These factors include students leaving school without the ability to read; write or do arithmetic; teachers who do not have the necessary competencies and knowledge to teach

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> **Gross Domestic Product** - the monetary value of all the finished goods and services produced within a country's borders in a specific time period (Investopedia, 2017).

the skills needed by students; constant changes in the education curriculum; learners having little motivation to learn from communities and families; as well as a lack of infrastructure and resources. There are also a number of other factors that explain inequality in learning between South Africa and other countries. The Centre for Education Policy Development (2017) identifies these factors as scarcity of teachers' incompetent teachers and poor teacher performance. In the classroom, this results in poor learner performance, a lack of classroom discipline and is aggravated by a lack of resources and infrastructure (Centre for Education Policy Development, 2017).

Agbor (2012) explains that rural schools tend to have less qualified teachers and an inadequate number of staff in relation to the number of students enrolled. Rural areas also have poorly developed infrastructure and limited access to the critical social services required by students. Social services are considered to be benefits or services provided by government (including education, food subsidies, healthcare and subsidised housing) (Business Dictionary, 2017a). There are numerous studies that indicate multiple inputs affecting a learner's achievement, among them infrastructure; class size and textbooks (Gater & Isaacs, 2012).

The lack of infrastructure and access to social services negatively affects the quality of education in rural areas (Agbor, 2012). Gater and Isaacs (2012) found that schools facing the highest poverty are unlikely to have a school hall, playing fields or sufficient security.

South Africa's 395 mud schools are little more than rows of cramped, unsafe rooms where learners squat on the floor or crowd around scarce textbooks (Garter & Isaacs, 2012). In a study conducted by Cuyvers et al. (2011), it was found that students who have access to high-quality school infrastructure performs better in class compared to students who have poor quality infrastructure. A fully functioning school with better quality roofs, walls or floors, desks, tables and chairs and a school library, appears conducive to student learning (Gater & Isaacs, 2012).

# **Poverty in South Africa**

In 2009, a recorded 62.1% of South Africans were living in poverty. These figures were calculated by using the upper-bound poverty line (UBPL) of R992 per person per month <sup>2</sup>(Statistics South Africa, 2017b). The latest trends according to Statistics South Africa<sup>2</sup> (2017) indicated that poverty has since decreased to 55.5% in 2015.

In South Africa, children aged 17 and younger, people from rural areas and those with little or no education are observed to be the main victims in the ongoing struggle against poverty. Growing up in poverty is a big threat to a healthy childhood. Approximately 63% of South African children are currently living in poverty. This affects various aspects of their lives, including their physical, mental and emotional development (Pretorius, 2016). This can clearly be seen in children living in the less developed areas. Pretorius (2016) states that children living in poverty are also affected later in life due to a lack of access to the necessary services. Education is a tool to reduce poverty and empower people, but South Africa`s poor public education system is currently sustaining the poverty cycle instead of breaking it (African Reporter, 2014).

This can be seen in the overall living conditions of South African citizens. In order to address the education crisis, government has implemented policies to reduce poverty in the country (Agbor, 2012).

The policies implemented included improving infrastructure and providing improved health and sanitation conditions. In 2006, the government calculated that in order to sustain social and infrastructure programmes, the economy would have to grow by 7% each year (Philip, 2014).

South Africa`s economy has faced a number of challenges over the past five years, such as low and weak economic growth, continuing high unemployment levels, higher consumer prices and greater household dependency on credit <sup>3</sup>(Statistics South Africa, 2017a). This

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>2</sup> According to the 2017 Poverty Trends in South Africa report published by Statistics South Africa. Entry (b) in the bibliography.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>3</sup> According to Statistics South Africa publication Government Education Expenditure on the Rise. Entry (a) in bibliography.

all leads to poor economic growth. Armed with all the statistics, the government devised the National Development Plan in order to eliminate poverty and reduce equality by 2030 (Philip, 2014). The National Development Plan is divided into thirteen chapters that deal with the most pressing challenges facing South Africa. This plan aims to provide solutions to these challenges in the form of proposals and actions. It outlines sector specific goals and a vision for South Africa to be achieved by the year 2030 (National Planning Commission, 2017).

# Accessibility to and Affordability of Education

'Everyone has the right to a basic education, including adult basic education' (The Constitution of the Republic of South Africa, 1996). According to the South African Schools Act of 1996, section 3(1), educational attendance is compulsory for all children between the ages of seven and 15 (South African Schools Act, 1996). The Education and Training Unit (n.d.) states that the government has implemented two policies in an attempt to make education accessible to children living in poverty. These policies are the School Fee Exemption policy and the No-Fee Schools policy. These policies aid children from underprivileged families to have access to basic education. Statistics South Africa found that total government expenditure on education in the 2013/14 period totalled R294 billion <sup>3</sup>(Statistics South Africa, 2017a).

Even with the increased government expenditure on education, Ally and McLaren (2016) found that the cost of schooling is still a barrier for many students. Government expenditure on education is mostly in the form of grants and subsidies. Schools in the poorest communities receive a certain amount of funding per student. In 2016, this amount was R1 175.00 per student per year (Ally & McLaren, 2016). The funding given to schools can be seen as a replacement for school fees and should make schooling for less fortunate students a possibility. However, despite no fee schools becoming more accessible to poverty stricken students, school fees are still an obstacle and contribute to the current high dropout rate (Ally & McLaren, 2016). Arendse (2011) states that in a judgement on education by the South African Constitutional Court, the focal point was limited access to education due to language policies at schools. Arendse (2011) argued that language is only

one of the many barriers restricting students' access to education. In South Africa, many learners have limited access to education due to school fees and other costs such as stationary and transport to school. It is the obligation of the state to guarantee the availability of free primary education. As statistics indicate, this is currently an area of concern in South Africa as there are vast numbers of children who are still illiterate.

Furthermore, Arendse (2011) states that the availability of education relies upon the state granting the required resources to be able to maintain the basic infrastructure of schools. The findings reveal that government is responsible for the availability of safe water sources, proper sanitation, classrooms and furniture, as well as textbooks, stationary and properly qualified teachers (Arendse, 2011). If all the elements mentioned in the literature cannot be addressed, then the right to basic education as set out in the Constitution is insignificant as a basic human right.

# Findings

In 2009 a recorded 62.1% of South Africans were living in poverty (Statistics South Africa, 2017b) and approximately 63% of South African children are currently living in poverty (Pretorius, 2016). When visually illustrated, as in Figure 1, these statistics indicate the current crisis. It can be concluded that poverty in South Africa is a crisis. Poverty not only affects the children in the country, but all citizens residing here.





The study also indicated a number of factors that affect education in South Africa, including students leaving school without the ability to read, write or do arithmetic; teachers who do not have the necessary competencies and knowledge to teach skills needed by students; constant changes in the education curriculum; as well as a lack of infrastructure and resources (Dirks, 2013). These factors can be seen as areas on which the government should be focusing to increase education opportunities in South Africa.

Statistics indicated that 27% of public schools do not have access to running water, while 78% do not have libraries or computers (UNICEF, 2017). Government spending should be focused on decreasing these numbers as a lack of infrastructure negatively affects the quality of education (Agbor, 2012). Education is a tool to reduce poverty and empower people (African Reporter, 2014).

However, based on the literature it can be seen that South Africa's current education system is of such a low standard that it is increasing poverty rather than empowering people from a young age to break free from their poor situations. As proven in various studies, education can lead to economic growth if implemented correctly. According to South Africa's Constitution 'Everyone has the right to a basic education, including adult basic education.' However, as indicated by Figure 2 below, of the total 11.2 million children aged 7–15 who are enrolled in schools, 245 000 were not attending school (Hall & De Lannoy, 2016).



#### Figure 2: School Attendance in South Africa

This can be contributed to learners not being able to afford the school fees; learners not being able to afford transport to schools and schools not maintaining basic infrastructure or providing learners with the necessary resources such as safe water, sanitation and books (Arendse, 2011).

If all these issues cannot be addressed, South Africa`s education standards will continue to drop and the citizens will be trapped in the chains of poverty.

# Recommendations

By conducting this study, the researcher wanted to establish the effect of poverty on education. Based on the findings, there is a clear link between poverty and the standard of education in a country.

The literature indicates that students are leaving school without being able to read or write. This can in part be attributed to the minimum 30% pass rate implemented by the Minister of Education, Ms Angelina Angie Matsie Motshekga. This means that children now only have to know 30% of their subject content to pass their grade. In essence, the low pass rate also reduces the quality of education that students receive, as teachers only focus on having students pass instead of fully understanding the work. This leads to individuals who enter the work place without the basic literacy or language skills required to perform their required tasks.

In public schools in 2013, the Grade 4 student results were: Home Language 49%, Mathematics 37%. In Grade 6, more than 11% did not reach sufficient achievement in their Home Language, meaning students achieved less than 40%. Furthermore, over 36% of students failed Mathematics. In Grade 9 in Mathematics, only 3.4% of all learners achieved marks higher than 50% (ExpatCapeTown.com, 2017). In order to address this problem, it is recommended that the pass rate be increased to ensure that students have a thorough understanding of subject content, also schools must appoint teachers who are adequately qualified to ensure learners are provided with the necessary skills, knowledge and attention required.

Research also indicates that there are schools that employ teachers who do not have the necessary qualifications for their positions. It is recommended that government apply more of its expenditure to subsidising schools, especially public schools and schools in rural areas, to put those schools in a position where they can afford to appoint qualified teachers.

Further subsidies will allow schools to appoint teachers with the necessary qualifications and to remunerate them accordingly. Furthermore, private schools can be approached to implement workshops for new teachers where they can be tutored and exposed to a variety of classes and students, as well as be taught how to best assist each type of learner.

As indicated by the literature, there are still schools that lack basic infrastructure and resources such as safe running water, sanitation, classrooms and books for students. Government expenditure for schools is mostly in the form of grants or subsidies. It can, however, be recommended that government should also be liable for providing basic necessities such as safe running water and sanitation to schools, as it forms part of social services that should be available to all.

Furthermore, communities can also get involved in funding schools or providing donations such as books, learning materials and stationery for students. By looking at the literature, it is clear that poverty is a crisis in South Africa. The first recommendation that can be made as a solution to poverty is that government should step in and increase the standard of our education system, make work of increasing inflation rates and strengthening the country's currency in order to increase quality of life for South Africans. The second recommendation that can be made is that the local community should come together and support the schools in their area, as the learners in those schools represent the future of the country.

There are still students who cannot afford the cost of education. However, this is being addressed by a government-implemented policy by providing grants to public schools. This policy implementation needs to be carefully monitored to ensure the continued success and to ensure that funds are adequately allocated and used. Furthermore, literature indicates that some South African students still do not have access to schooling. The availability of schooling is based on the school having the necessary infrastructure, but many schools do not. Therefore, if government and local businesses can step in and help improve school infrastructure, those schools will be able to accommodate more learners, which will lead to a higher percentage of the population being educated, which in turn can help reduce poverty linked to unemployment. It can be recommended that the government temporarily increase funding to schools as a stepping stone for schools to implement the necessary infrastructure changes required to make education available to all students.

# Conclusion

The aim of this study was to show the effect of poverty on education. Based on the research there is a clear link between the poverty levels in a country and the standard of education. As clearly indicated by literature, educating the citizens of a country is a tool that can be used to reduce poverty in a country and increase economic growth and living quality for all.

It was also established that many children in South Africa have limited access to education due to various factors such as living in impoverished households, poor infrastructure and lack of resources. Government can ease this burden by helping schools obtain the necessary resources to provide quality education to students.

Due to poor education standards in South Africa, there is a high level of unemployment, which leads to the abject poverty experienced by many South Africans. Statistics clearly indicate the state of crisis of the education system in South Africa. This crisis can be addressed by government programmes and initiatives implemented by the public sector, such as training programmes and mentorships.

# List of References

ACEI-Global. 2014. 15 facts on education in developing countries. https://acei-global.blog/2014/03/06/15-facts-on-education-in-developing-countries/. Date of access: 6 August 2017.

Agbor, J. 2012. Poverty, inequality and Africa`s education crisis. *Brookings*, 20 September. https://www.brookings.edu/opinions/poverty-inequality-and-africas-education-crisis/ Date of access: 6 August 2017.

Allen, K. 2014. Poor quality education trapping children in poverty. *Save the children*, 9 January. https://www.savethechildren.org.za/article/poor-quality-education-trapping-children-poverty. Date of access: 17 August 2017.

Ally, N. & McLaren, D. 2016. Fees are an issue in school too, not just university. *Project Rise*, 12 November. https://projectrise.news24.com/fees-issue-school-not-just-university/ Date of access: 6 August 2017.

Anon. 2014. 10 facts about poverty in South Africa and the world. *African Reporter*, 17 October. http://africanreporter.co.za/35101/10-facts-poverty-south-africa-world/. Date of access: 6 August 2017.

Anon. 2017. South Africa has one of the world's worst education systems. *The Economist*, January. https://www.economist.com/news/middle-east-and-africa/ 21713858-why-it-bottom-class-south-africa-has-one-worlds-worst-education. Date of access: 6 August 2017.

Arendse, L. 2011. The obligation to provide free basic education in South Africa: an international law perspective. *PER: Potchefstroomse elektroniese regsblad*, 14(6):96-127.

Brende, B. 2015. Why education is the key to development. *World economic forum*, 7 July. https://www.weforum.org/agenda/2015/07/why-education-is-the-key-to-development/ Date of access: 6 August 2017.

Business Dictionary. 2017a. Quantitative research. http://www.businessdictionary. com/definition/quantitative-research.html. Date of access: 17 August 2017.

Business Dictionary. 2017b. Social services. http://www.businessdictionary.com/ definition/social-services.html. Date of access: 6 August 2017.

Cambridge Dictionary. 2017. Developing country. http://dictionary.cambridge.org/ dictionary/english/developing-country. Date of access: 6 August 2017.

Cuyvers, K., De Weerd, G., Dupont, S., Mols, S. & Nuytten, C. 2011. Well-being at school: does infrastructure matter? https://www.oecd.org/edu/innovation-education/centreforeffectivelearningenvironmentscele/49167628.pdf. Date of access: 30 August 2017.

Dirks, N. 2013. The challenges of South Africa's education system. *CELE Exchange* 2011/10. OECD. http://www. dreamstoreality.co.za/the-challenges-of-south-africas-education-system//. Date of access: 6 August 2017.

Education and Training Unit. s.a. Government programmes and policies: education policies: school fees. http://www.etu.org.za/toolbox/docs/government/ schoolfees.html. Date of access: 6 August 2017.

Epstein, M.J. & Yutas, K. 2012. Redefining education in the developing world. *Stanford social innovation review*, Winter. https://ssir.org/articles/entry/redefining\_education\_in\_the\_developing\_world. Date of access: 6 August 2017.

ExpatCapeTown.com. 2016. Education in South Africa. http://www.expat capetown.com/education-in-south-africa.html. Date of access: 6 August 2017.

Gater, R. & Isaacs, D. 2012. Spending on school infrastructure does matter. *GroundUp*, 25 May. https://www.groundup.org.za/article/spending-school- infrastructure-does-matter/. Date of access: 30 August 2017.

Govender, P. 2017. Matric results 2016: 18 schools obtain 0% pass rate. *Mail & Guardian*, 5 January. https://mg.co.za/article/2017-01-05-matric-results-2016-18-schools-obtain-0-pass-rate. Date of access: 20 November 2017.

Hall, K. & De Lannoy, A. 2016. Education: school attendance. *Children's Institute*, October. https://www.childrencount.org.za/indicator.php?id=6&indicator=15. Date of access: 22 August 2017.

Hanushek, E.A. & Wößmann, L. 2010. Education and economic growth. (*In* Peterson, P., Baker, E. & McGaw, B., *eds*. International encyclopaedia of education, v. 2. Oxford: Elsevier. p. 245-252.)

Investopedia. 2017. Gross domestic product. http://www.investopedia.com/ terms/g/gdp.asp. Date of access: 6 August 2017.

Moffitt, K. 2017. Research methodology: approaches & techniques. (*In* Educational psychology: help and review. Ch. 7, Lesson 10.) http://study.com/academy/lesson/research-methodology-approaches-techniques-quiz.html. Date of access: 17 August 2017.

Nicolson, G. 2015. South Africa: where 12 million live in extreme poverty. *Daily Maverick*, 3 February. https://www.dailymaverick.co.za/article/2015-02-03-south-africa-where-12-million-live-in-extreme-poverty/#.WZwqW\_gjH3g. Date of access: 22 August 2017.

Philip, S. 2014. South African policies help to reduce poverty, says World Bank. *Brand South Africa*, 9 October. https://www.brandsouthafrica.com/governance/ development news/south-african-policies-help-to-reduce-poverty-says-world-bank. Date of access: 6 August 2017.

Pretorius, W. 2016. 63% of young SA children live in poverty: study. *News24*, 13 May. http://www.news24.com/SouthAfrica/News/63-of-young-sa-children-live-in-poverty-study-20160513. Date of access: 6 August 2017.

Samuel, S. 2013. Importance of education in a countries progress. *HowToLearn*, 13 March. http://www. howtolearn.com/2013/03/importance-of-education-in-a-countrys-progress/. Date of access: 17 August 2017.

South Africa. 1996. The Constitution of the Republic of South Africa. http://www. justice.gov.za/legislation/constitution/SAConstitution-web-eng.pdf. Date of access: 6 August 2017.

South Africa. 1997. South African Schools Act of 1996. Pretoria: Government Printer. https://www.gdead missions.gov.za/Content/Files/SchoolsAct.pdf. Date of access: 6 August 2017.

South Africa. Centre for Education Policy Development. 2017. Challenges facing education in South Africa. Pretoria: Department of Education. http://www.cepd. org.za/files/pictures/The%20 Challenges%20Facing%20Education%20Interview %20Nov%2009.pdf. Date of access: 30 August 2017.

South Africa. Department of Planning, Monitoring and Evaluation. 2017. Vision statement: Vision 2030. Pretoria: Department. http://www.nationalplanning commission.org.za/Pages/NDP.aspx. Date of access: 29 August 2017.

Statistics South Africa (Stats SA). 2017a. Government education expenditure on the rise. Pretoria: Stats SA. http://www.statssa.gov.za/?p=5837. Date of access: 6 August 2017.

Statistics South Africa (Stats SA). 2017b. Poverty trends in South Africa. Pretoria: Stats SA. http://www.statssa. gov.za/publications/Report-03-10-06/Report-03-10-062015.pdf Date of access: 20 November 2017.

United Nations Children's Fund (UNICEF). 2017. Overview: education and adolescent development. UNICEF South Africa. https://www.unicef.org/southafrica/education\_344.html. Date of access: 6 August 2017.

Wilkinson, K. 2015. Are 80% of South Africa's schools 'dysfunctional'? *Mail & Guardian*: 1-2, 25 March.

# WRITING AS A LEARNING TOOL: A METHOD OF TEACHING LAW AS A 'NON-MAJOR' MODULE

#### **Eunette Beukes (Damelin: Menlyn)**

eunette87@gmail.com

This article focuses on introducing writing as a learning tool for qualifications where the curriculum consists of major and non-major modules. Employers seek graduate employees who are proficient in their reading and writing skills, yet they are constantly disappointed as higher education does not produce graduate employees with sufficient writing and communication skills. A variety of challenges exist for the facilitator, who needs to inspire students to be enthusiastic about learning and at the same time improve their writing skills. Challenges can include the variety of writing styles students possess and being able to accommodate them all while students are not prepared on a foundational level for higher education. These challenges must not burden the facilitator. Instead, one needs to consider the benefit that writing holds for various qualifications, such as Travel and Tourism, Marketing and Business Management. This article concludes by investigating four types of writing tools that can be used to improve the classroom experience in a two-fold manner. The first is to use alternative approaches to engage and reflect on the theory and the second is to encourage the improvement of writing as a skill.

*Keywords:* academic writing, learning tool, writing tools, wikis, journal writing, blogs, one-page-paper, higher education

## Introduction

A variety of challenges lie before the facilitator of a student of the 21<sup>st</sup> century. One such challenge is to instil a sense of inspiration for those subjects that form part of their curriculum that are not considered to be 'major' subjects. It would be those subjects that do not form part of the name of the chosen qualification, but those that nevertheless need to be completed to be awarded the prescribed credits. For the author of this article, it is teaching and facilitating the field of law to students who only saw it as a subject the day they registered, but did not appreciate the variation that it will lead to in their cognitive process. This article sets out to discuss how writing can be used as a learning tool for subjects that are not considered 'major' subjects, such as law, communication, research

and ethics. The article will start by stating why writing needs to be taught as a skill for the 21<sup>st</sup> century graduate. There are a variety of writing styles that need to be accommodated in the classroom, This article will explore the variety as a challenge, along with other aspects that contribute to the challenge of the depletion of writing as a skill. The benefits of writing will be discussed by looking at three fields that require writing as part of higher education training as well as a skill that is used in their context of being a graduate employee, namely Travel and Tourism, Marketing and Business Management. As a final discussion, this article will investigate four tools that can be used to execute writing as a tool for teaching law.

## Why the Need to Incorporate Writing as a Learning Tool

Dynan and Cate (2009:67) state that the discipline of economics has become dominated by communication in the form of writing and oral skills as well as 'analytical reasoning skills, such as teaching, policy making as government'. In a study by Bacon and Anderson (2004), it is held that writing skills are essential for business graduates to such an extent that only oral writing is considered more important than writing skills (McDaniel & White cited in Bacon & Anderson, 2004:443). Their studies have also shown that written communication does not necessarily improve, specifically for Marketing students over a period of four years. It would therefore be onerous to state that, due to the fact that students further their education, it would lead to them having improved their writing skills. Writing is not merely a skill that needs to be incorporated into business qualifications – it also needs to be incorporated in all undergraduate curricula. Du Preez and Fossey (2012:346) researched developing academic writing skills as part of graduate attributes in undergraduate curricula. They found that, according to Griesel and Parker (2009), in South Africa 'there is pressure on higher education from both government and employers to produce graduates who are employable in the sense that they have the attributes, capabilities and dispositions to work successfully'. South African employers' expectations of the knowledge, skills, competences and values of undergraduate students were not met (Du Preez & Fossey, 2012:3470). The lack of writing skills is therefore not only a global problem, but one that academics and future employers will experience locally as well.

Bearing this in mind as the foundation of the problem, this article explores the hurdles and challenges faced by those facilitators in higher education. The discussion of these challenges is meant to encourage open-minded thinking so that facilitators are able to accommodate these problems.

## **Challenges of the Different Types of Undergraduate Student**

The first challenge that one needs to consider is the different students who need to be taught writing skills as well as their approach to initiate writing. Kieft, Rijlaarsdam and Van den Berg (2006:20) refer to a study by Torrence, Thomas and Robison that groups three different types of undergraduate students: planners, revisers and the mixed strategy writers. Planners prefer having their ideas clear before they start to write and then to write fewer drafts than revisers. Content is decided on before writing commences: they think and then write. Revisers use revision to develop content. Writing helps them to make their ideas clearer and to understand their arguments better. Revisers tend to develop content as they write: they think while writing. The third group is the mixed strategy writers; they plan content before producing text, just like planners, but change content during subsequent revisions.

A study was done on the same subject in 1999 by Torrence and it was confirmed that the undergraduate students are still clustered in similar groups – the planners and the revisers – but that there was a significant change in the latter group as writers who do not plan or revise but are 'reading reference and writing notes ... and thinking about wording and writing text ... called the non-stop writers or doers' (Kieft et al., 2006:21). A third study by Torrence in 2000 showed that students used one of two strategies to write essays: 'Outline-develop strategy (i.e. writing from an outline, but with possible development in content or structure) and the think-then-do strategy (i.e. thinking prior to writing, not explicit planning or drafting)' (Kieft, et al., 2006:22).

Based on the studies cited, it is difficult to determine whether there is a consistent writing strategy in undergraduate students. Due to this lack of sufficient research, one therefore needs to cater for various writing styles and therefore various writing tools.

# Alternative Challenges

Apart from the challenges mentioned above, there are also other challenges that a facilitator faces when one considers the background of the undergraduate student. Snyman-van Deventer and Swanepoel (2013:512) looked at the problem of teaching law students legal writing skills. Many of the problems outlined in the article by Snyman-van Deventer and Swanepoel (2013) can also be related to undergraduate students in general. Aspects included problems such as that the 'current education system in South Africa renders a large number of students unprepared for higher education, lacking basic writing skills and knowledge of grammar and spelling' (Snyman-van Deventer & Swanepoel, 2013:512). These aspects do not only make it difficult for the lecturer to teach the theory, but also to teach critical thinking skills. Teaching critical thinking skills would require a lecturer to develop a student's integrated thinking. Integrated thinking needs to be developed as problems in practice are often presented as an integrated problem. The circle is completed when one needs to know the theory of a subject, analysing the problem, researching and writing about the various aspects thereof in order to obtain a solution in an integrated manner. Snyman-van Deventer and Swanepoel (2013:514) refer to the words of Du Preez and Fossey (2012:355) that 'Writing is essential for the understanding of academic concepts and theories'. Snyman-van Deventer and Swanepoel (2013:516) refer to Andersen (1980) and the structure that the writing process needs to follow: There needs to be an analysis of the problem – which will lead to an identification of the issues. After that, there needs to be an evaluation of the issues, followed by thorough research. After the research, there is the writing of the draft and the presentation thereof.

# Writing as a Learning Tool across Various Fields

As stated previously, the author of this article teaches law for various fields of study. A particular challenge was to teach Law (which is a non-core module) for qualifications in Travel and Tourism, Marketing and Business Management. One of the challenges was that Law is a writing-intensive module – which was very different from other subjects that were practically orientated or that were directly linked with core aspects that were needed to study. Using writing as a learning tool will not only improve writing skills in general and

the ability to obtain knowledge – it also holds benefits in certain, specific fields of academia. Higher education has undergone major changes in its ability to present learning in new manner – it is not just a question of learning, but also of interpreting, understanding and organising new knowledge (Lea & Street, 1998:157). These processes have to constantly undergo change to help students adapt the school student into the higher education student, as a different kind of learning and understanding will be required. Lea and Street (1998:157) state that 'A practices approach to literacy takes account of the cultural and contextual component of writing and reading practices and this has important implications for an understanding of student learning'. They further state that to understand the nature of literacy practices, one needs to look at it from both the perspective of lecturers and well as the students. Understanding how lecturers and students see literacy practices, such as reading and writing, will help explain why current literacy practices are failing or are deemed successful (Lea & Street, 1998:157). In the following sections, this article will elaborate on the extent to which the incorporation of writing will benefit different disciplines, as a learning for current studies as well as for future career use. The fields of focus for discussion are Travel and Tourism, Marketing and Business Management. These fields are all fields of studies at Damelin on various levels: Diploma in Travel and Tourism, Diploma in Marketing and Business Management and Diploma in Business Management.

## **Travel and Tourism**

Research by Armstrong (2004:46) has shown that students in the field of Travel and Tourism have benefited more from travel writing for three reasons: there was a stronger link between the theory and the practical aspects with regard to the students' overall understanding; the writing proved to be an 'enjoyable and creative assessment item' and it was an assessment tool that could easily be approved.

A subject pertaining to teaching Law to Travel and Tourism students provides an opportunity to integrate legal writing into the field of Travel and Tourism as a method of creating a more attractive employee for future employers. Iqbal (2014:1) focused on the importance of written and oral communication in the hospitality industry. Her findings showed that effective written communication plays such a crucial role that it can lead to

affecting revenues if it leads to a decline in guests and worst-case scenario – a failed organisation (Iqbal, 2014:4). Effective written communication does not only have an effect on the economic status of an organisation, but it 'also enhances a sense of satisfaction and promotes interpersonal relationship through the use of powerful words, messages and presentation' (Iqbal, 2004:4).

If one takes the above into consideration, the crucial role that the improvement in writing will generally have on students cannot be denied, and even more so if it is incorporated into all modules that are not considered core modules. The effect of this will be that writing in non-core modules will lead to better literacy practices, which will not only enhance the different career options of a Travel and Tourism student, but will also improve their work satisfaction in the hospitality sector. The next discipline that will be discussed is the field of Marketing.

# Marketing

In an article by Wright and Larsen (2016:25), numerous authorities referred to writing skills as being essential to the Marketing graduate in their future career and that Marketing students need to have 'both concept knowledge and polished writing'. The problem that has presented itself is the fact that, due to social media, students tend to write more than their predecessors, but the writing is unsatisfactory (Wright & Larsen, 2016:25). The writing seems 'too fast and careless and too full of shortcuts and grammatical errors' (Wright & Larsen, 2016:25). They suggest the use of the one-page paper (1PP) for Marketing purposes (See 'Types of writing tools to incorporate legal writing'), although it can also be related to legal writing as a method of teaching individual concepts where Marketing and Law can be collaborated (or, for example, a case study on whether consensus has been obtained in a contract with a client or the relevant legislation that regulates marketing in South Africa on a topic such as 'Regulation of Spam in South Africa').

# **Business Management**

Lentz (2013:475) conducted an investigation into the field of business professional writing skills and cited various sources that showed the poor state of young employees' writing skills. All studies cited referred to the fact that companies spend millions trying to improve the writing skills of younger employees, as this leads to a loss of millions because of the lack of communication that it causes. Lentz determined that although employees see issues of writing and grammar in the workplace as a major concern and a skill that needs to be improved, students did not see it as a weakness (Lentz, 2013:484). One of the suggestions to improve the awareness between students and employers and the level that is expected of business writing is that business writing should be incorporated into internships that form part of curriculum. In the context of Damelin, one might ask the employers of Work Integrated Learning (WIL) students to ask students to write a report that can also be evaluated and critiqued by the employer. This should assist in indicating to the student what type of level of writing is expected from them in a business context. In terms of using writing as teaching tool in business law, a similar approach can be used as was suggested for Marketing students.

# **Types of Writing Tools to Incorporate Academic Writing**

Writing as a tool for learning is not limited to pen and paper. Due to the development of Web 2.0, technology is integrated into the classroom experience and includes academic discussions on social media. Subsequently, writing has evolved to an online, collaborative exercise. Electronic submissions of written assignments can also be improved by using software that detects plagiarism (for example TurnItIn). The discussion of the types of writing tools will have a two-fold purpose. The first part of the discussion will be focused on introducing and explaining the different types of writing one can use to incorporate academic writing. The purpose of discussing and introducing these tools is to show new ways of achieving an interactive writing experience and to assist in the process of 'out-of-the-box' thinking when considering writing. The second part of this discussion will focus on the various possibilities of incorporating tools that will enhance the academic writing

experience. The tools that will be discussed are wikis, journals, blogs and the one-page paper.

# Wikis

Parker and Chao (2007:57) described the various ways in which a wiki can be used as one of the tools that form part of Web 2.0. They defined a wiki as 'a web communication and collaboration tool that can be used to engage students in learning with others within a collaborative environment' (Parker & Chao, 2007:57). The approaches to learning, suggested by Parker and Chao (2007:58-59), can involve a cooperative/collaborative paradigm (in cases that involve group work, learning with other members, peer interaction and using technology to combine education and research whilst still showing individual accountability). It can also be used where a constructivist paradigm is followed, for instance in cases where there needs to be reflection on prior learning, active explorations, simulations and the conversational interaction between students to discuss solutions. Parker and Chao (2007:61) use Lamb (2004) to show the various advantages of using a wiki as part of writing an assignment. First of all, wikis are a fun and entertaining method of writing. Furthermore, wikis are a low-cost option to collaboration and promote the writing process as one uses reading and revising on a constant basis. Wikis focus more on 'writing as a process' than on the final product. Lastly, wikis make students more comfortable in writing for a larger audience.

## **Journal Writing**

Kerka (2002) refers to the work of Andrusyszyn and Davie (1997), Mitchell and Coltrinari (2001) and Moon (1999) and refers to the writing of a journal as a:

'Crucible for processing the raw material of experience in order to integrate it with existing knowledge and create new meaning. Among the many purposes for journal writing are the following: to break habitual ways of thinking; enhance the development of reflective judgment and metacognition; increase awareness of tacit knowledge; facilitate self-exploration and personal growth; and work out solutions to problems.'

One of the benefits of using journals as learning tools is that it makes a connection between old and new knowledge. There is a clear demonstration in the form of writing to show what the student has learned. It creates a space for reflection, independent thought and feelings and allows for evidence of a deeper understanding rather than memorising information (Kerka, 2002). Journals can be used as a group-reflective experience or as an individual exercise (Kerka, 2002). There are various types of journals that can be considered, depending on the type of writing and expression is required. The first is a 'response journal or a literature log, in which learners record their responses to readings' (Kerka, 1996:2). The second type of journal is a reflective journal which steers into fields of 'observation, speculation, doubt, questioning, self-awareness, problem stating, problem solving, emoting and ideation' (Holt cited in Kerka, 1996:3). The third type is an electronic journal that is related to a distance education setting (Kerka, 1996:3). The author of this paper would suggest that electronic journals are not be treated as a separate journal form, but as a means to conduct either a response journal or a reflective journal. The form of journal writing that is most advantageous is reflective journal writing. According to Van Walraven (2017), one of the advantages is that instructors who use journal writing see greater participation of their students as well as a better response to prescribed reading and writing about class material. One of the disadvantages of reflective journal writing is the paradigm shift that needs happen, especially for lecturers. Sceptical lecturers will see reflective writing as unnecessary effort (Van Walraven, 2017). Apart from the reflective journal, the response also has its advantages and disadvantages. Some of the advantages would include allowing students to engage with the lecturer in their own voice, sharing entries with the class and allowing for class discussion as well as collecting information for self-analysation (Kerka, 1996:2). If response journals are not prepared and introduced properly into the curriculum, there are disadvantages, which include only being used as a recordkeeping tool and not being able to achieve a sensible response and reflective engagement (Kerka, 1996:4). One major disadvantage also pertains to privacy as students might write only what they think lecturers want to see, instead writing their truthful responses to topics (Kerka, 1996:4).

#### Blogs

Blogging is considered a form of micro-publishing – 'a web-based communication tool', 'online personal diaries, to the latest disruptive technology', the 'killer app' that has the capacity to engage in collaborative activity, knowledge sharing, reflection and debate (Hiler cited in Williams & Jacobs, 2004:232). Blogging has a firmly entrenched foot in academic literature as it is used in the form of teacher training where one needs to use a tool that reflects the learning that has been achieved (Williams & Jacobs, 2004:235). One of the reasons for its popularity is due to the fact that the 'blog has many dimensions that are suited to students' 'unique voices', empowering them and encouraging them to be more critically analytical in their thinking'. (Williams & Jacobs, 2004:235). Some of the other reasons why there is value in the education blog is that there is 'a natural tendency for reflection ... contextualisation of learning through hypertext links to other materials encourages revisiting and revising of learned concepts ... blogs are more successful in promoting interactivity that is conversational; a mode of interaction that is more conducive to improve student and teacher relationships, active learning, higher order thinking and greater flexibility in teaching and learning more generally.'

## **1PP (One-page paper)**

The benefit of the one-page paper lies in the fact that it assists academically weaker students to become better writers, while still challenging a student who is a stronger writer in a theoretical framework. The one-page paper works in the following manner. Throughout the semester, students are asked to write a limited number word count document regarding a topic that is set by the facilitator (Wright & Larsen, 2016:25). The facilitator gives feedback before the next topic needs to be submitted and in that regard students can work the feedback into their next attempt. The question that students need to answer must be structured in a manner that will allow the students to think critically (Wright & Larsen, 2016:25). Only when there is an attempt to write down their critical thinking will there be evidence of whether the student understands the theory at a deeper level of understanding. To ease the marking, facilitators will develop shorthand abbreviations that can be given to students to determine what errors can be improved in
their next attempt (Wright & Larsen, 2016:26). These abbreviations will then be considered as codes or keys that the facilitator can use to show where errors have been made. The major benefit of this tool is that it not only makes the weaker writers more competent, but it is also a tool that allows for deeper understanding of information through the exploration and application of key concepts to a case study, rather than a recalling exercise (Wright & Larsen, 2016:26). In the research paper by Wright and Larsen (2016), the instructions were set out as follows: students had to write a 250-word document (all technical elements were prescribed: font, spacing, margin etc.) in which there should not be any footnote, bibliography or quotes (only paraphrasing is allowed) about a case study. The case study was about the Girl Scout Cookies and the kind of marketing management philosophy used to sell their cookies (Wright & Larsen, 2016:30). Students are therefore forced to analyse and evaluate the problem, identify and research the solution and then, finally, apply the research solution to the problem.

# Incorporation of Tools to Improve Academic Writing Experience

# Wikis

As stated above, the main purpose of wikis would be to arrange collaborative writing of students, whilst still maintaining a sense of accountability. Cooperative and collaborative writing is a way to improve the academic writing experience as students are aware that they are writing for an audience (facilitator and fellow students) alike, but they are also in the position where they are part of the audience at the same time. Collaborative writing across a computer-based platform encourages peer interaction and is therefore an excellent option to choose for group work. Being able to share writing of one's own and having access to the writing of a fellow student will lead to better academic writing as it will lead to a community of practice (Parker & Chow, 2007:58). This community is an online community where people are part of a shared domain and they share knowledge regarding a topic (Parker & Chow, 2007:58). Through the constant interaction between students, a sense of practising to write on academic topics will take place. Parker and Chow (2007:62) refer to research that suggests that the use of wikis allows for 'authentic classroom writing activities'. This is imperative for the improvement of the academic writing experience as

it assists students in developing their own academic voice and writing style beyond submitting assignments that are a plagiarism exercise.

# Journal Writing

As stated above, the main value of journal writing lies in the fact that it is an exercise of reflection. As stated in the article by Kerka (2002:1), to write and reflect on one's writing is not a natural-born talent, but rather an exercise of practising writing. Journal writing will improve academic writing as it is a tool that encourages reflection and it therefore encourages a constant practice of rewriting and reflecting. Students, more often than not, tend to copy and paste information without there being a process of writing and reflection. Journal writing can be used in such a way that students need to provide the relative academic information, but in such a manner that it also engages their independent thought and existing knowledge. Over the course of the semester, students should then be asked to return to their initial point of view and reflect on the statements made previously. During the process, students will practise written reflection on their academic writing. Kerka (2002:2) stated that journal writing will be successful only as a learning tool; lecturers and students have to commit to the process of reflective writing. Journal writing will therefore also be an indicator of the students' commitment to the improvement of their own academic writing. Beyond commitment lie inclusivity and the duty on the lecturer to ensure that all students have a platform to communicate their academic understanding. One group that is often marginalised in a classroom are those students who struggle with English as a universal academic language. As journal writing is more informal and more conversational, students are more willing to write and interact in journal writing than in a classroom situation (Kerka, 1996:3). The detriment of this is that students can fall behind or not understand academic concepts because they are too shy to engage with lecturers or an entire classroom. As journal writing creates a sense of privacy, it becomes a safe space for students to not only display their understanding, but also to improve their academic writing. As students reflect on their previous writing and develop an opportunity to re-engage with topics, they will not feel a sense of self-awareness. In traditional assessments, students can feel demotivated if a lecturer gives feedback, as there can be a sense of judgment,

depending on the of use of language and different cultures. With journal writing, there is a sense of rediscovering and correcting one's own work and academic writing.

# Blogs

Blogs can be used effectively as a tool for the improvement of academic writing for the following reasons. The first would be that it can assist students in establishing a writing routine (Thomson, 2016). Blog writing needs to be incorporated in the curriculum as a weekly occurrence, thereby creating the space to constantly return to one's writing, even if it is just for a short period of time. Blog writing also improves academic writing by forcing students to think about the point that they are writing about and only being allowed a certain amount of words per blog, for example 1000-word entry (Thomson, 2016). Traditional assignments are often lengthy to mark and therefore take up more time to assess. However, a longer assignment does not necessarily attest to quality. Limiting students to write about academic concepts allows the lecturer to see whether they truly grasp the essence of the concept or case study. Being able to write in concise, short paragraphs will also assist students when they reach a phase in their academic careers where they need to write abstracts and summaries for research projects and presentations at conferences (Thomson, 2016). Blogs are used for a single, academic author; therefore, it can be incorporated as an individual assignment. When the student author sees their writing and the publication thereof, it will nudge them to improve on every attempt (as the world is their audience). By practising the writing, gradual improvement will take place.

# **1PP (One-page paper)**

As already stated, the one-page paper was developed to specifically improve the academic writing of the less competent student writers. The improvement lies in the fact that there are continuous, small amounts of writing to be done throughout the semester to determine whether students have grasped concepts that are not related to their field of specialisation, for example Marketing, Travel and Tourism or Business Management. Other non-core modules also carry doctrines and terminology which students are less inclined to revise as there is a sense of irrelevance towards a subject or a feeling of being overwhelmed, from the shift from secondary to tertiary education. With continuous feedback, students can

progress weekly on their academic writing, which will ultimately lead to a greater improvement on academic writing.

# **Conclusion and Recommendations**

The following recommendations would be suggested for incorporating writing as a tool to improve academic writing across the curriculum. The first recommendation is to revisit the assessment methods that are currently used at Damelin and to incorporate various writing methods to improve academic writing. The assessment methods can be linked to the individual diploma or degree grading system. It would be more beneficial for students to receive continuous feedback to improve academic writing rather than to receive a semester mark right before examinations occur, without the opportunity to freely view and improve their writing.

The second recommendation would be to introduce an electronic portal which allows students to submit any of the abovementioned writing methods. There are various benefits to such an electronic portal. It allows students to submit through TurnitIn, which will successfully reveal to students their own stance on plagiarism. It will also allow examination officers to keep track of submitted assignments easily as everything is done electronically (as well as moderation). Furthermore, an electronic marking system will allow effective and productive marking and will allow students to view their marks immediately. It will also reduce the use of paper in academic departments, which will lead to a greener and more environmentally friendly office. Lecturers can more easily distribute academic reading material to all students who are registered for each subject.

The third recommendation, which will need to be a long-term project, would be to incorporate the above writing methods and to adapt it for each diploma and degree. This will then replace the generalisation of subjects such as Business Law (which has the same study guide and textbook across all the relevant fields and different courses). An example thereof would be to have students in Marketing and Business Management (both taking Business Law) have case studies, reflective journal questions and blog entries specified for their fields, for example focusing on negative option marketing in terms of the National Credit Act (34 of 2005) as a topic for Marketing students.

There are a variety of challenges that await the facilitator of a 21<sup>st</sup> century student. One of those challenges is not to teach the students only the content, but also to ensure that they develop skills valuable for future employees. As a facilitator in tertiary education, there is a responsibility on the facilitator and the student to ensure that writing skills are on standard. This article has explored some of the challenges that facilitators will face, such as the various writing types of undergraduate students as well as a schooling system that does not produce students who are ready for tertiary education. Challenges can be overcome by innovative and creative thinking on the institution's part by making use of interesting and fun writing activities that will ensure critical thinking, student participation and curriculum development. The use of technology must be incorporated to ensure that the various writing types of students are accommodated and that tools can be used to encourage writing for a wider audience.

This article aimed to inspire the use of writing as a teaching tool across all disciplines as a method of challenging academic creativity.

# List of References

Armstrong, E.K. 2004. Analysis of travel writing enhances student learning in a theoretical tourism subject. *Journal of teaching in travel and tourism*, 4(2):45-60.

Bacon, D.R. & Anderson, E.S. 2004. Assessing and enhancing the basic writing skills of marketing students. *Business communication quarterly*, 67(4):443-454.

Du Preez, I. & Fossey, A. 2012. Developing academic writing skills as part of graduate attributes in undergraduate curricula. *South African journal of higher education*, 26(2):346-357.

Dynan, L. & Cate, T. 2009. The impact of writing assignments on student learning: should writing assignment be structured or unstructured. *International review of economics education*, 8(1):64-86.

Iqbal, M. 2014. A study of the significance of business communication in the hotel industry of Dubai. http://jaipuria.edu.in/pgdm/wp-content/uploads/2014/03/A-Study-of-

the-Significance-of-Business-Communication-in-the-Hotel-Industry-of-Dubai.pdf Date of access: 23 October 2017.

Kerka, S. 1996. Journal writing and adult learning. ED399413 Eric Digest, 174:1-7.

Kerka, S. 2002. Journal writing as an adult learning tool. Columbus, Oh.: ERIC Clearinghouse on Adult Career and Vocational Education.

Kieft, M., Rijlaarsdam, G. & Van den Bergh, H. 2006. Writing as a learning tool: testing the role of students' writing strategies. *European journal of psychology and education*, 21(1):17-34.

Lea, M.R. & Street, B.V. 1998. Student writing in higher education: an academic literacies approach. *Studies in higher education*, 23(2):157-172.

Lentz, P. 2013. MBA students' workplace: implications for business writing pedagogy and workplace practice. *Business communication quarterly*, 76(4):474-490.

Parker, K.R. & Chao, J.T. 2007. Wiki as a teaching tool. *Interdisciplinary journal of knowledge and learning objects*, 3(1):57-72.

Snyman-Van Deventer, E. & Swanepoel, C.F. 2013. Teaching South African law students (legal) writing skills. *Stellenbosch law review*, 24(3):510-527.

SouthAfrica.2005.NationalCreditAct34of2005.http://www.justice.gov.za/mc/vnbp/act2005-034.pdfDate of access: 09 November 2017.

Thomson, P. 2016. Seven reasons why blogging can make you a better academic writer. https:// www.timeshighereducation.com/blog/seven-reasons-why-blogging-can-makeyou-better-academic-writer Date of access: 24 October 2017.

Van Walraven, C.2017.The benefits of reflective journal writing.https://teachingblog.mcgill.ca/2017/04/11/the-benefits-of-reflective-journal-writing/Date of access: 24 October 2017.

Williams, J.B. & Jacobs, J. 2004. Exploring the use of blogs as learning spaces in the higher education sector. *Australasian journal of educational technology*, 20(2):232-247.

Wright, N.D. & Larsen, V. 2016. Improving marketing students' writing skills using a one-page paper. *Marketing education review*, 26(1):25-32.

# METHODOLOGIES OF STUDYING POWER: AN ANTHROPOLOGICAL PERSPECTIVE ON AGENCY, RESISTANCE AND ETHICS IN SOUTH AFRICA

**Robin Thompson (INTEC)** 

robin.thompson@icg.edu.za

This paper reflects on the methodologies of the studying of power within anthropology, and how these methodologies influence the action of power. It draws on Abu-Lughod's exploration of boundaries between the self and other, in which 'culture' operates in anthropological discourse to impose separations that inevitably carry a sense of hierarchy. This paper therefore explores and reflects on the symbolisms of power and the connections between individual agency and freedom, resistance, music and performance, masculinity, feminism, and how they are interlinked in different socio-cultural contexts and the way in which power is used in South Africa.

Keywords: agency, ethics, feminism, power, resistance, South Africa, subjectivation

# Introduction

In South Africa, power in the form of governance of communities and the self has become one of the ways in which people characterise their social positions within society, especially with a series of changes to one's identity as a person and their relation to politics of goodness and injustice. Today, individuals find themselves in shifting dilemmas of identity politics that seek to threaten the agency of other people as well as the self in terms of the power relations and subjectivity between each other. With a continual rethinking of power, agency, freedom and the identification of the self, scholars have sought to recognise these shifts through physical and social forms. These social forms either govern the way people live or empower the way they decipher and understand how personal/public social relationships work as well as how political issues are linked to them.

Throughout the years, concepts such as resistance, agency and sex in post-apartheid South Africa have been contested and revised, bringing new approaches and perspectives of thinking about power and power relations within contemporary anthropology. Becker (2007), based on Borofsky's (2007) argument on applied and public anthropology, asserts that public anthropology, unlike applied anthropology, emphasises the inseparability of

theory and practice within and outside academe. She elaborates by asserting that the attitude with which the statement is made was based on public accountability, seeking to confine the degree 'to which a power elite can manipulate problems and solutions to their personal advantage' (Becker, 2007:91-92). This paper will present an anthropological perspective on agency and resistance according to socio-cultural contexts in South Africa as an offering to the debate of gender, religious, cultural and governmental inequality, thereby suggesting the methodologies of studying power through these critiques.

# Agency and Forms of Resistance

In the article *The Subject and Power*, French philosopher Michel Foucault (1982) questions why we study power, and what legitimises power. To Foucault's question, 'Do we need a theory of power?' he answers, 'Since a theory assumes a prior objectification, it cannot be asserted as a basis for analytical work' (Foucault, 1982:778). He explains that this analytical work cannot continue without further conceptualisation and critical thought into this issue which is constant. In terms of the significance and the weight that the concept carries, 'power' seems to have a vague description. However, the magnitude to which power is used in everyday life around the world and in South Africa seems to be manipulated to conform to a social morale that deems something or someone superior or inferior to the 'other' in various social contexts.

Mahmood (2005:17) states that according to Foucault, the notion of power cannot be understood on only the model of domination as something to be possessed and deployed by individuals or autonomous agents over others, even if there is a singular intentionality, structure or location that presides over its rationality and implementation. Foucault elaborates that power should be understood as an intentional relation of force that permeates life and that it is productive of new forms of desires, objects, relations and discourses. Foucault also argues that the subject does not precede power relations in an individual state of mind, but is produced through these relations, which form the necessary conditions of its possibility.

With this essential formulation of the 'subject', Foucault describes the paradox of subjectivation as methods and conditions that secure a subject's subordination, emphasising

Judith Butler's idea of a self-conscious identity and agent. 'Stated otherwise, one may argue that the set of capacities inhering in a subject, that is, the abilities that define her modes of agency are not the residue of an undominated self that existed prior to the operations of power but are themselves the products of those operations' (Mahmood, 2005:17). In other words, the same form of aggravation that makes an individual feel subordinate would result in the production of a self-identity that the individual recognises within themself. For example, if a parent, whether it be the mother or father, as the subject of power asserts a provoking attitude or phrase such as 'You will never amount to anything' upon their children, this spoken word would subordinate them, rendering them to recognise themselves as useless and worthless. In this way, the children would be in a state of selfconsciousness regarding what they think about themselves and by reflecting on the claim that their parents asserted onto them. In this way, they would reinvent themselves, not according to the way their parents would want them to be, but according to the way they would want to see themselves. However, this would not be the case with all children or older people for that matter. Although the individual would have agency, their subordination could lead them to subvert the dominating power of people in positions of power. In turn, this subversion to power could lead to a resistance that enables the individuals to be an agent of agency. 'One key tension in Butler's work owes to the fact that while she emphasises the ineluctable relationship between the consolidation and destabilisation of norms, her discussion of agency tends to focus on those operations of power that resignify and subvert norms' (Mahmood, 2005:21).

Saba Mahmood draws on work done during the 1970s in the humanities and social sciences that focused on the processes of human agency within structures of subordination. Conti and O'Neil (2007) state that applying qualitative and feminist approaches has tremendous benefits that aid the researcher in the process of doing research and generate nuanced understanding of the complex and multi-layered operations of power (Conti & O'Neil, 2007:80). Feminist researchers wanted to understand how the resistance of women towards the dominant male regulations was performed by subverting the dominative connotation of cultural practices and redirect these practices for their own interests and agendas. The notion of resistance in the context of politics stirs up a range of emotions if some situations

were put into context, where the notion of resistance could be seen as an opposition to power that was institutionalised.

To look at resistance and how it relates to agency from women's perspectives is to acknowledge that there is some kind of power that can be negotiated for the sake of freedom from strife, giving women the opportunity to practise their agency through resistance for the sake of freedom in an oppressing norm. Abu-Lughod (1990) in her article *The Romance of Resistance* illustrates four types of resistance that are associated with women from Bedouin communities in Egypt. The first type of resistance is against the sexually isolated women's world, where women perform various kinds of minor defiance on a daily basis against the precincts enforced by elder men in the community. It is for this reason that women use the power of silence to their advantage. In contrast to this form of resistance, South African women who have been physically and verbally abused were urged to speak out against these forms of horrendous acts, therefore asserting women's rights for the sake of living in tranquillity, even with their spouses. This is where the second form of resistance comes into play, which is the women's resistance to marriage. The elder men, who are fathers and/or uncles and the main power regulators in Bedouin communities, exert their control of arranged marriages in the family.

However, Abu-Lughod (1990) states that despite the men's apparent power, actual marriage arrangements are always complicated and involve many people, especially mothers and female relatives (Abu-Lughod, 1990:43). In relation to this, Bedouin women have found ways to mock the masculinity and the men's 'manhood', which is the third form of resistance that motivates women in deriding men. The Bedouin women's scorn as a form of resistance lies in the men's failure to live out the ideals of autonomy and manhood, which are also the ideals on which their supposed moral superiority and social precedence are based, especially if the men fail as a result of sexual desire. The forth type of resistance corresponds to the third form of resistance, but through poetry and song. Abu-Lughod (1990) states that poetry carries the emotions that violate the moral code, the vulnerability to others that is usually a sign of a disgraceful lack of autonomy and the romantic love that is considered immoral and immodest (Abu-Lughod, 1990:47).

Mahmood (2005) refers to Boddy's study which reveals that even in instances when an explicit feminist agency is difficult to locate, there is a tendency among scholars to look for expressions and moments of resistance that may suggest a challenge to male domination. (Mahmood, 2005:8). Janice Boddy conducted a rich ethnography of women's cultic practices in a village in an Arabic-speaking region of northern Sudan. Mahmood places emphasis on Boddy's study, which reveals that there is a tendency among scholars to look for expressions and moments of resistance that may suggest a confrontation to male domination, even in occasions when an explicit feminist agency is difficult to locate. She therefore asserts that agency, in view of analysis, could be understood as the ability to realise one's own interests and then resist the weight of custom, tradition, inspirational will, and/or other obstacles such as 'conformity', whether individual or collective. Women are not the only 'victims' of the subverting norm; men are too. The resistance of a man may vary from the conforming to a living expectation of society, based on its norm, to an ambiguous threshold that bombards his will to be 'free' from a power over which he has not control.

The movie *Fight Club*<sup>4</sup> represents portrayals of what may seem to be the influence of a 'power' that could either not be controlled or a 'power located in agency', created to cure the 'unnamed narrator' of the movie – an insomniac protagonist – from living the life that he really wants. The narrator also represents the consumer body of a capitalist society. According to Csordas (1994), the consumer body refers to the creation and commercialisation of bodily needs such as sex, cigarettes, labour-saving devices or cars, a process in which doubt is created about the self to sell grace, spontaneity, vivaciousness and confidence (Csordas, 1994:6). It is within a conversation of consumerism that he befriended another man named Tyler, who ironically blew up the narrator's apartment and started a social gathering called 'Fight Club'. 'What I found was that the field is a complex site of power, one which could be conceptualised in a number of ways, either as a web, network or text of the bodies living in it' (Henry, 2003:237). The emphasis of the fight club created by the narrator, and Tyler relates to the 'complex site of power' as they both find

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>4</sup> Fight Club (1999) is a North American film, starring American actors Edward Norton and Brad Pitt, based on the 1996 novel of the same name by Chuck Palahniuk.

'agency'. This form of agency is thus seen as a means of breaking away from a social norm of consumerism within a capitalist society. The way this site is used allows the narrator and Tyler to assert a violent power on one another. What makes this site complex in terms of power is that, although the idea is to break away from the rules of society, the fight club is still governed by rules of its own for any other man who joins the club, restricting them from talking about it to the 'outside world'.

Other examples of resistance and forms of power relations range from global phenomena (such as the apartheid and Nazi regimes) that gripped our attention regarding understanding and living through the corruptness of power. This is also reminiscent of the small-scale events in local communities that impacted inhabitants of society in a huge way, such as poor housing and loss of jobs due to government's 'empty promises'. In contemporary South Africa, we should shift our mindsets to understand what power relations entail by examining the forms of resistance and attempts made to distance these relations. 'With the shift in perspective I am advocating, asking not about the status of resistance itself but about what the forms of resistance indicate about the forms of power that they are up against, we are onto new ground' (Abu-Lughod, 1990:47).

Methodologies of studying power look at the ways in which a person can use power to their advantage. This usage of power assumes an exertion of force from one person on the other in terms of whose intentions of action are stronger than the other. This, however, does not mean that power exists between two people, as power may also be negotiated among the self, in which 'power' happens as soon as it is enacted. Foucault (1985) poses questions with regard to the power of thoughts toward the self in relation to a person's experience. These questions include: 'What are the games of truth by which man proposes to think his own nature when he perceives himself to be mad; when he considers himself to be ill; when he conceives of himself as a living, speaking, labouring being; when he judges and punishes himself as a criminal?' (Foucault, 1985:7). To answer these questions, we need to look at the person who is the actor of power. To look at that person, Foucault proposed a theoretical shift that had also been required to analyse what is often described as the demonstrations of 'power'.

This apparent shift led Foucault to think of the person as a 'subject' of power. 'It seemed appropriate to look for the forms and modalities of the relation to self by which the individual constitutes and recognises himself qua subject' (Foucault, 1985:6). However, in reference to Foucault's (1985:11) view, the 'techniques of the self' have certainly lost some of their importance and independence when they were incorporated into the exercise of religious power in early Christianity, and later into educative, medical and psychological types of practices. Further questioning could probe what this would mean for people who plan on stealing power from the 'powerful', as a form of resistance, for their own survival. It could be argued that an individual as a subject of power has the capability to overthrow another form of power, whether it is individual or institutionally driven. Ortner (1995) citing Michel Foucault (1978) and James Scott (1985) explains that the notion of resistance becomes complicated to explain, especially when the concept of power is involved. Whereas Foucault concentrated on more persistent and daily forms of power and less institutionalised power, Scott focused on less organised but more pervasive and daily forms of resistance. Therefore, Ortner asserts the question: 'When a poor man steals from a rich man, is this resistance or simply a survival strategy?' (Ortner, 1995:175).

To look further into the techniques of the self, it needs to be taken into account that morality plays a role in the way people renovate themselves. In reference to the works by Foucault on morality and practices of the self, one must be mindful of the ambiguity of the term 'morality'. 'By 'morality', one means a set of values and rules of action that are recommended to individuals through the intermediary of various prescriptive agencies such as the family (in one of its roles), educational institutions, churches, and so forth' (Foucault, 1985:25). He also states that morality refers to an individual's perceptible behaviour in relation to the rules and values that were advocated to them as they negotiate veneration and impertinence of these rules and values among themself.

# Agency and Positive and Negative Freedom

How could anthropological views of power be understood within various contexts in South Africa through agency as a method? Living in post-apartheid South Africa, people are living out the 'freedom' for which their predecessors fought. Arguably, the biggest debate or discussion around power and agency is that the idea of 'freedom' should not be understood as 'independence as free will'. An example of this statement could be the 'freedom of speech' that the South African media have fought for, and how this freedom was stripped from ambitious journalists. What powers of the governmental body diminishes the freedom of the people who seek for the truth around politics in South Africa? Foucault's way of thinking about government states that the government does not refer only to political structures or to the management of states but rather that it allocates the way in which the conduct of individuals or of groups of individuals might be directed, namely the government of children, families, communities, the sick and the souls (Foucault, 1982:790).

One needs to also understand the distinction between agency and freedom. While Foucault looked at freedom from the perspective of authority, Laidlaw looks at agency as acts of various degrees that are powerful and of structural importance. 'What the concept of agency, as it has become popularised in anthropology, picks out is a matter of the effectiveness of action - specifically its effectiveness in producing, reproducing or changing the structures within which people act' (Laidlaw, 2002:315). People who have agency found ways in rethinking the social norm of society that appropriate the lifestyle of people who share the same mindset and liberty of power and how it ought to be used. Agency among individuals creates opportunities for continuous rethinking of ethics and freedom in relation to the use of power, especially within the changing perspectives of anthropological conceptualisation. As people are contesting social norms of their society that do not bring them a sense of contentment, they act out a power that they realise through their agency. It is not questioned, however, whether we could be missing other aspects of 'power' that infiltrate the way we apply power in our everyday lives, wherein one of these aspects are using power symbolically. Instances in society could reflect the ways that the use of language constitutes how people interact with each other, such as verbal confrontations or verbal abuse. The power attached to these confrontations provokes the incentive for symbolic power of linguistics, especially between men and women.

According to Ahearn (2001), unequal power relations can result in and be the result of symbolic violence. As a form of power and in reference to anthropologist/sociologist Pierre

Bourdieu, this occurs when individuals mistakenly consider a standard dialect or style of speaking to be truly superior to the way they themselves speak, rather than an arbitrary difference afforded by social significance. Language and power are therefore commonly intertwined (Ahearn, 2001:111). A segment of Mahmood's research on Islamist politics in Egypt also looks at the practices of women's mosque movements as a form of Islamic Revival. This assumes the existence of a divine plan for human life embodied in the Quran, the critical explanation of literature, and the moral codes derived from there that each individual is responsible for following.

Mahmood refers to the work of Judith Butler, in which feminist scholarship treated norms as an external social burden that limited the individual. 'Butler forces us to rethink this external-internal opposition by arguing that social norms are the necessary ground through which the subject is realised and comes to enact her agency' (Mahmood, 2005:19). This enactment of agency by the people goes against what the ideals of socio-politics attempt to bring to society. It therefore brings about why power being studied by the method of agency could be considered for the advancement of civilisation without the feeling of power being the 'stigma' factor that people discouraged as their communities became globalised. As Mahmood stresses the importance of feminist scholarship of women's agency in connection to the unbreakable chain of patriarchal and religious oppression, she questions 'the overwhelming tendency within poststructuralist feminist scholarship to conceptualise agency in terms of subversion or resignification of social norms, to locate agency within those operations that resist the dominating and subjectivating modes of power' (Mahmood, 2005:14). She also suggests that it is crucial to detach the notion of agency from the goals of evolutionary politics in order to grasp these forms of action. The reason for this could be that the focus of agency of the self could be examined according to the ways in which women follow a situated rule or law, such as religion. We could therefore also question whether they are not participating in their own oppression, bringing about central discussions on what freedom is to women in their lives.

However, the question is: if a person has agency, does that person have the ability to resist, and can they break free from norms by undoing and subverting them? Coming back to the notion of freedom, feminists and anthropologists have looked into the self that seeks liberation and autonomy, in which Mahmood looks at that freedom as normative to feminism, just as it is to liberalism, and how a critical study is applied to people who want to limit women's freedom rather than people who want to extend it. Mahmood (2005) therefore asserts two types of freedom, namely positive freedom and negative freedom, from a liberal theorist perspective. Her understanding of positive freedom is that it is the ability to realise an autonomous will, which is fashioned in accordance with the dictations of a 'universal reason' or 'self-interest', which is imaginative by the weight of custom, inspirational will and tradition.

Negative freedom, on the other hand, is the absence of external obstacles to self-guided choice and action that is imposed by either the state, corporations or personal individuals. In short, 'positive freedom may be best described as the capacity for self-mastery and self-government, and negative freedom as the absence of restraints of various kinds on one's ability to act as one wants' (Mahmood, 2005:11). We need to note that the idea of self-realisation itself is not an invention of the liberal tradition, but it is historically embedded in a variety of forms, such as the spiritual notion of self-mastery over one's obsessions. The notion of realising oneself through self-transformation from a religious perspective is present in Buddhism and a variety of mystical traditions, including Islam and Christianity. Through observations and research conducted by Mahmood and Abu-Lughod, we could understand how 'power' is being negotiated among people through various forms of practices, and how agency in individuals would seem to give them a sense of propriety. With a shifting focus on the view of studying of power, one could also look at power through another collaborative medium of agency and power relations.

# **Agency, Power and Positive Ethics**

The values of power that people act out towards other people could be analysed through power relations that are shared among people in society. Socio-cultural values that people invented within their own society carry the symbolical trait of strength, which gives the individual or people the power of stance or status. This status is therefore negotiated by the amount of power an individual might have in comparison to a community of people whose power acts as a unit for the collective. Female leaders in South Africa, such as members of the Democratic Alliance (DA), namely the Premier of the Western Cape Helen Zille and the Mayor of Cape Town Patricia de Lille, are examples of women who use their agency as a method to negotiate power relations among themselves and the people of Cape Town. People of Cape Town living in impoverished areas gain some kind of 'hope' in using their agency, as they feel that they are neglected by a political power of limited action or change. I question whether the agency of people in South Africa (who come from different backgrounds but share the same socio-linguistic understanding of what power ought to be) influences people's thoughts and mindsets for them to attain their own agency through the power of a collective community.

It is intriguing to observe how 'power' is being negotiated among people through various forms of practices in a globalising world. With a shifting focus on the view of studying of power, we need to look at power through another medium that could be a potential method of studying power. The values of power that people act out towards other people could be analysed through power relations that are shared among people in society. Socio-cultural values that people invented within their own society carry the symbolical trait of strength, which gives the individual or people the power of stance or status. This status is therefore negotiated by the amount of agency an individual might have in comparison to a community of people whose power acts as a unit for the collective.

Laura Ahearn's study focuses on agency, suggesting how important it is for scholars interested in agency to look closely at language and linguistic form. I agree with Ahearn (2001) as she argues that the issues that are embedded in language and agency are relevant to anthropological research because most anthropologists, whether archaeological, biological, cultural or linguistic, are concerned with what people say and do in their own particular contexts (Ahearn, 2001:109). There are also female members of Cape Town communities who have gone beyond the suffering of inflicted physical 'power' of domestic violence to use their power through agency to educate and reform their communities through charity work and motivational speaking. They encourage young and older women of society to rise against violence, in its physical and emotional form, from men and other women alike. Bourdieu (1977) states that the constitutive power that is granted to ordinary

language does not position itself in the language, but in the group which authorises it and invests it with authority (Bourdieu, 1977:21).

According to Mahmood (2005), rather than looking 'outside' the structures of power, Butler locates the possibility of agency within these structures of power, but more importantly she suggests that the repetitive structure of norms serves to provide the means for its destabilisation, and not only to consolidate a particular regime of discourse or power (Mahmood, 2005:20). With this said, women with agency are using power to take up positional stances in society as women of 'change' in sectors that are somewhat controlled by men or the patriarchal form. In terms of the discourses of sexuality and gender, the agency of women plays a huge role in power relations that were not always favoured, being the predecessor of social morale of society. However, we cannot limit agency to actions that dislocate existing power relations. Mahmood (2005) refers to Foucault's work that encourages one to think of agency in terms of the capacities and skills required to undertake certain kinds of moral actions and bound up with the historically and culturally specific disciplines that cannot be escaped from, through which a subject or person is formed (Mahmood, 2005: 29).

Could we thus look at these 'capacities' and 'skills' as the embodiment of performances in relation to agency? Mahmood emphasises that in the context of the mosque movement, this means closely analysing the scaffolding of practices both confrontational and embodied that secured the mosque participants' attachment to patriarchal forms of life that in turn provided the necessary conditions for both their subordination and their agency (Mahmood, 2005:154). By looking into the methodologies of studying power, a rethinking of the embodiment of performances through agency would help us to interpret moral values in relation to cultural, political and social relationships that are set within our own societies.

Mahmood therefore poses the question on how we would analyse operations of power that construct different kinds of bodies, knowledge and subjectivities whose paths do not follow the actuality of liberator politics. She argues that people who organise their lives are actually constitutive of different forms of personhood, knowledge and experience, and not simply on the terms of an annotation for collectively shared assumptions about the world and how they are positioned in it (Mahmood, 2005:16). In the moment that people form themselves through agency, subordination occurs at the same time. People therefore become subjects of their own formations and, in doing so, they understand their thoughts of personhood. Furthermore, people become submerged in their transformations as they opt to embody this change; so, if an individual continuously performs a new movement of the self within society, a reinforcement of norms is in motion. 'Such an understanding of power and subject formation encourages us to conceptualise agency not simply as a synonym for resistance to relations of domination, but as a capacity for action that specific relations of subordination create and enable' (Mahmood, 2005:16-17).

Mahmood refers to the debate about the *hijab* (veil) as just one part of a much larger discussion in Egyptian society, wherein political differences between Islamists and secularists, and even among Islamists of various persuasions, are articulated through arguments about ritual performative behaviour. Of the questions that were asked include 'how do we analyse the work that the body performs in these different conceptualisations of the norm? Furthermore, what sorts of ethical and political subjects are presupposed by these two imaginaries, and what forms of ethico-political life do they enable or foreclose?' (Mahmood, 2005:24).

We could answer these questions by referring to the power of resistance as a symbolic construct of agency through an embodied performance. Becker (2012:26) looks at the work of German ethnomusicologist and anthropologist Veit Erlmann, as he demonstrated in *African Stars* that black performance progressed in response to the increasing economic and racial segmentation of South African society. He illustrated that the 'cultural workers' of the anti-apartheid resistance movements were built on prior musical forms such as ragtime and specifically the Zulu *ingoma* (a dance performed by boys and girls without drums and accompanied by a chant) and *isicathamiya* (a singing style that originated from the South African Zulus). The urban African population had used these musical forms to comment on their unstable social position and to symbolically construct a secure space within a rapidly changing political world. The Bedouin women in Abu-Lughod's research presented the same type of resistance, as they sang about the men that they were forced to

marry, by taunting the groom's relatives with the suggestion that the bride was worthier of an officer than of the poor man who was getting her.

These forms of resistance clearly depict symbolic constructs of agency, as their performances embody the resistance of subordination in which positive ethics play a role for these performances to occur. 'Foucault's conception of positive ethics is Aristotelian in that it conceives of ethics not as an idea, or as a set of regulatory norms, but as a set of practical activities that are germane to a certain way of life' (Mahmood, 2005:27). From this idea, ethics are embedded in a set of specific practices which Aristotle called the 'practices of virtue'. However, Foucault's use of Aristotelian ethics is not aimed at explaining the assertion to a universal validity or at improving its various elements for solving modern moral problems, such as salvaging the idea of 'telos' or a collective notion of the 'good life'.

Instead, Foucault uses the Aristotelian tradition for us to have a constant thought of ethics as pertaining to a specific set of procedures, techniques and discourses, through which highly specific ethical moral subjects are eventually formed. With that said, it is more than just looking at subjectivation of norms for the production of desire; it is about how norms are experienced and how the ethical subject can be seen as an agent, and how the agent uses ethics to regulate their life. Coming from a religious perspective, Foucault (1982) states that it has often been said that Christianity brought into being a code of ethics is fundamentally different from that of the Ancient World (Foucault, 1982:783). Foucault elaborates that Christianity is the only religion that has structured itself as a church. Christianity in this sense could be seen as a power that enables an individual to find a sense of truth of the individual self. This form of power is salvation oriented, as opposed to political power. It is a person dedicated to a religious life, as opposed to the principle of dominion, as it would be individualising as opposed to legal power. It is coextensive and continuous with life and is linked with a production of truth, in which, for the person, it is the truth of the individual himself.

For Foucault, ethics are a modality of power that permit individuals, either by themselves or with the help of other people, a certain number of operations on their own bodies and souls, thoughts and behaviour. Ethics are a way of being in order to transform themselves into the willing subjects of a particular moral discourse. I assert a link between the performance of music within Pentecostal churches and this context, as musicians' evangelical training is conducted through ethical means. For this reason, I use Foucault's notion of 'moral subjectivation' as the medium of developing the self. 'Moral subjectivation, in turn, refers to the models available for setting up and developing relationships with the self, for self-reflection, self-knowledge, self-examination, for the decipherment of the self by oneself, for the transformations that one seeks to accomplish with oneself as object' (Mahmood, 2005:28). I argue that the models used for developing relationships with the self for evangelical musicians are the embodied performances of music in the church or wherever the musicians find themselves to be for the purpose of ministering. Mahmood states that the precise embodied form that obedience to a moral code takes is not a dependent but a necessary element of ethical analysis in that it is a means to describing the specific constitution of the ethical subject (Mahmood, 2005:29). As the individual lives out the new transformation of the self to be an evangelical musician, the foundation of moral subjectivation becomes embodied in the performance of the ethical subject. In this way, the individual feels that their life is complete, knowing that the individual chooses the thinking for their agency and, in doing so, that the self is released.

# Conclusion

Social scientists continue to rethink the notions of agency, resistance and ethics as methodologies of studying power. Furthermore, they elaborate on how these methodologies were a reification within the South African and the broader context. Through an anthropological perspective, people living under the apprehensive supremacist rule are engaging with these methodologies for the preservation of the individual self. By recognising shifts of the self through the power of subjectivation, it is important to note that people are able to empower themselves to attain a self that is solely desired, without the fear of counteracting their own morale among social, political or religious institutions. 'Understanding power not as an intrinsic property of an individual but as flowing from complex relationships between individuals, organisations and institutions has significant methodological impact for those studying power' (Conti & O'Neil, 2007:68). South

Africans coming from various socio-cultural backgrounds seek to understand the power they have based on inheritance or self-enlightenment.

Mahmood's work during the period of the 1970s on the processes of human agency within structures of subordination thus also portray the bleak battle between oppressive masculinity and femininity and vice versa, and particularly within the context of South Africa where circumstances faced by abused women are rampant. This, however, has not stopped women from seeking to understand the magnitude of their agency, resistance and their ethical aptitudes in order for the 'self' to stand against identity politics affirmed by a dogmatic agenda. Therefore, they act out a method of power that they realise within their capacity through performance. For this reason, a particular resistance to a norm, whether it be social or institutional, facilitates the self-examination of the individual. The result of this type of resistance contributes to the transformation of the self. Furthermore, ethics of the self become central to the negotiation of regard and disregard of power among the individual, even if the individual is a participant in their own oppression.

# List of References

Abu-Lughod, L. 1990. The romance of resistance: tracing transformations of power through Bedouin Women. *American ethnologist*, 17(1):41-55.

Ahearn, L.M. 2001. Language and agency. *Annual review of anthropology*, 30(1):109-137.

Becker, H. 2007. De-provincialising South African anthropology: on relevance, public culture & the citizen anthropologist. *Anthropology Southern Africa*, 30(3-4):85-96.

Becker, H. 2012. Anthropology and the study of popular culture: a perspective from the southern tip of Africa. *Research in African literatures*, 43(4):17-37.

Bourdieu, P. 1977. Outline of a theory of practice. Cambridge, UK: Cambridge University Press.

Conti, J.A. & O'Neil, M. 2007. Studying power: qualitative methods and the global elite. *Qualitative research*, 7(1):63-82.

ISSN: 2596809

Csordas, T.J. 1994. Introduction: the body as a representation and being-in-the-world. (*In* Csordas, T.J., *ed*. Embodiment and experience: the essential ground of culture and self. Cambridge, UK: Cambridge University Press. p. 1-24.)

Foucault, M. 1982. The subject and power. Critical inquiry, 8(4):777-795.

Foucault, M. 1985. The use of pleasure: the history of sexuality, v. 2. New York: Random House.

Henry, M.G. 2003. Where are you really from? Representation, identity and power in the fieldwork experiences of a South Asian diasporic. *Qualitative research* 3(2):229-242.

Laidlaw, J. 2002. For an anthropology of ethics and freedom. *Journal of the Royal Anthropological Institute*, 8(2):311-332.

Mahmood, S. 2005. Politics of piety: the Islamic revival and the feminist subject. Princeton, N.J.: Princeton University Press.

Ortner, S.B. 1995. Resistance and the problem of ethnographic refusal. *Comparative studies in society and history*, 37(1):173-193.

# A GREENER APPROACH TO SECONDARY METAL, NON-METAL AND MINERAL PRODUCT MANAGEMENT

#### Byelongo Elisee Isheloke (Central Technical College)

ebyelongo@gmail.com

This article focuses on the identification of drawbacks that hamper the effectiveness of secondary metal, non-metal and mineral product operations, with the aim of addressing health, safety and quality. The rationale for this study was based on the information that the financial turmoil has led to a significantly reduced demand for scrap metals. The research required interdepartmental and interdisciplinary inputs. The results revealed that excellent quality initiatives have a positive impact on the value-adding operations. A total of 75.5% of respondents agreed that quality enhancements increase productivity.

*Keywords*: continentalised beneficiation, mineral products, productivity and innovation, quality initiatives, quality improvements, scrap management, secondary metal

#### Introduction

During an industrial cohesion planning event for the scrap metal recycling industry and the environment, Fasheun (2010) advocated for local beneficiation of metals through secondary metal product recycling operations. This was to oppose the dependency on the exportation of recycled products as it is done currently by most recyclers. Recyclers currently export finished products overseas, bringing the very products back to Africa for sale at a higher and arbitrary price. This trading system robs the province, the country and the continent of Africa of significant amounts of money and deprives the local community of opportunities for job creation, skills development and continentalised (Pan-African) beneficiation. Grobler, Warnich, Carrell, Elbert and Hatfield. (2006) observe that many companies are turning themselves inside out to remain competitive in the market-

# **Problem Statement**

The world economic crisis has impacted negatively the secondary metal recycling industry. This has led to a significant reduction in scrap (Brookes, 2009) and mineral demand. There have not been sufficient publications on the scrap metal, non-metal and mineral industry in this country, let alone in KwaZulu-Natal (KZN). Recycling of metal and mineral products or the re-use of products that save energy is a sound economic practice with the potential to preserve our direct environment. It also promotes economic upliftment of the unemployed population, while catering for the conservation of mother earth, the planet. Recycling is a very sustainable green practice that paves the way to a continentalised beneficiation of metal and mineral products (Fasheun, 2010). With the above in mind, it is pertinent to conduct research in this regard.

#### **Research Aims**

The aim was to examine the influence of quality initiatives on the operations of a selected metal recycling company in KZN.

#### **Research Objectives**

The objectives of this research are threefold:

- to determine the influence of quality initiatives on the company's productivity;
- to evaluate the significance of education on quality issues towards enhancing health and safety in recycling firms; and
- to identify the drawbacks that hamper the effectiveness of quality initiatives in the metal operations.

#### **Research Questions**

The study sought to answer the following research questions:

- Is it recommendable to integrate quality and safety systems in metal and mineral recycling operations?
- What are the perceptions of metal and mineral workers of the health and safety and quality initiatives?
- What challenges do recyclers face in the industry?

- What is the impact of metal, non-metal and mineral recycling on the environment?
- How does one go about integrating health and safety into secondary metal and mineral operations?
- What is the impact of the global economic crisis on the metal and mineral industry?
- Can beneficiation be Pan-African rather than just being national?
- What quality initiatives take place in the case-studied company and why?

#### **Literature Review**

#### **Definitions of Quality and Quality Initiatives**

According to Juran, cited by Mitra (2008), quality is the fitness of a product for its intended use. Lakhal and Pasin (2008) suggest that another word for quality improvement initiatives is innovation or internal process improvement (Kelemen, 2003). Besterfield (2009) argues that quality brings forth the idea of an excellent product or service that either fulfils or surpasses the stakeholders' expectations. Based on perceptions, quality can be schematised quantitatively as follows: Q = P/E; where Q=quality; P=performance and E=expectations. If Q is greater than 1.0, the customer has feels happy, satisfied or a sense of pleasure. Quality initiatives in the scrap metal recycling industry are beset with benefits and drawbacks.

#### **Benefits of Quality Initiatives**

RIOS (2006), as the first management system standard designed exclusively for the scrap recycling industry, emphasises the following benefits of quality improvement:

- It decreases the environmental expenses.
- It increases product sales.
- It enhances consumers' confidence and satisfaction.
- It lowers health and safety expenses.
- It improves relations with sister organisations, legislators and regulators.

- It boosts efficiency and profitability.
- It helps a company to gain a competitive advantage.

Grobler et al. (2006) maintain that improved quality means survival of the business. Amidst the crisis and the economic recession, competition will increase and only metal firms with quality products will thrive (Downturn Brings Opportunity, 2008). As part of efforts to establish KZN guidelines for metal recycling business, ISO 14001 would help to develop comprehensive, environmentally friendly best practices within the metal recycling industry (Christie, 2010). Fasheun (2010) mentions the importance of capacitating local scrap recycling companies so that their final products could be processed and produced locally rather than beneficiating metals and minerals in Western or Eastern countries alone. Some metal dealers who see the West and the East as their regular market are against this suggestion of local benefit (Fasheun, 2010).

# **Drawbacks that Influence Quality Initiatives**

A number of drawbacks can be identified. The current bottlenecks are partly caused by the fact that some scrap metal dealers are reluctant to try innovative ways of conducting secondary metal, non-metal and mineral recycling operations in the region. The lack of official guidelines for metal recycling trading in KZN is but another drawback (Christie, 2010). Within the scrap recycling industry itself, there is a need to define the technical terminology so that sister businesses can communicate effectively. It is confusing, for example, to see that for many the term 'scrap' means altogether a different thing. There is a negative connotation attached to terminologies such as waste and scrap, so much so that it becomes most appropriate to use the concept 'secondary metal product' instead of metal waste and scrap. However, it remains to be seen whether organisations will buy into this idea. Research reveals that at different levels, people speak in different languages.

The lack of infrastructure, machinery, insufficient cash or cash equivalents, flaws in the system, a decreased demand for scrap and an alarming shortage of skills are drawbacks that small and medium enterprises (SME) would have to surmount on daily basis to overcome the aftermath of the global economic crisis. These challenges are better understood when explained at the hand of the seven deadly diseases identified by Dr.

Deming. Deming points out the lack of consistency in planning, the emphasis on shortterm profits, managerial issues, the problem of focussing on visible figures only, as well as the cost factor as some of the drawbacks that managers should consider (OmniLingua, 2004).

The current economic downturn has been the first recession in 17 years that saw South Africa losing almost 900 000 jobs, most of them to the detriment of the poor or previously disadvantaged communities. However, most economic indicators show that South Africa, and without any doubt KZN, is now coping with an economic slow-down just as the economy was starting to create jobs (Zuma, 2012). There is a need to place the scrap recycling industry at the centre of the job creation strategy (Ndwandwe, 2012). Facts from the industry reveal that:

- thirty-three per cent of the US aluminium supply comes from recycled materials;
- two out of three pounds of steel made in the US is manufactured using ferrous scrap;
- recycling one ton of aluminium sources up to eight tons of bauxite ore and 44 megawatt hours of electricity;
- more than 150 million metric tons of scraps are processed annually; and
- forty-four million tons of scrap are exported to 153 countries annually.

# **Quality Measurement and Improvement Tools**

There are various quality measurement and improvement tools. The overlaps between these tools make them difficult to categorise. However, for the sake of this study, a number of tools have been singled out as crucial in metal recycling operations. These tools include the house of quality; the SWOT-analysis; the indices, data, analysis, action, review, again mechanism (IDAARA mechanism); the value chain framework; the just-in-time (JIT) inventory system; scenario analysis; the define, review, identify, verify, execute (DRIVE) approach; the benchmarking technique; brainstorming; the Institute of Scrap Recycling Industry (ISRI) scrap specifications; the Recycling Industry Operations Standards (RIOS); and the safety, environmental, corporate governance, quality, HIV/Aids management systems or codes of practice (SECQA model) (Nankana, 2005; Johnson et al., 2006;

Shapiro, 2007; Scrap Specifications Circular, 2008; Singh, 2006). These tools, if used effectively, will enhance productivity.

# **Going Green to Preserve the Environment**

A new approach in metal products would integrate waste management and life cycle assessment (LCA) to come up with environmentally friendly operations (Christensen, 2011; Kreng & Chiu, 2012). This is consistent with President Zuma's statement in parliament. He said that in order to respond to international standards and embark on environmentally friendly initiatives, the focus should be on green jobs creation (Zuma, 2012). In 2009, during an interview, President Clinton emphasised the need to place the scrap recycling industry at the centre of the job creation strategy. Scrap recycling is but one effective way to reduce energy consumption (How scrap recycling protects the environment while providing 'green jobs' for Americans, 2009). A clean and orderly environment is always required (Wang et al., 2009).

# **Research Methodology**

The study followed a multi-method approach, i.e. method triangulation. This enabled the researcher to draw on both qualitative and quantitative data for analysis (Bennett, 2003). Depending on the situation, either explorative or descriptive methods have been used to address quality initiatives. Gibbert et al. (2008) clarify the importance of following a mixed approach in research. In order to avoid bias and the limitation of memory recall, they suggest that the researcher triangulates interview data with secondary sources. In this study, these sources include annual reports, press releases and published newspaper articles (Golden as cited by Van de Ven & Poole, 2005). As the target of 70 respondents was small, it became appropriate to do a census study. A total of 68 people filled in questionnaires. The response rate was 97%. The data collected from the respondents were analysed with Predictive Analytical Software (PASW) version 18.0.

#### Findings

# **Hindrances to Quality Initiatives**

The findings on hindrances to quality initiatives were gathered by using an open-ended question. Other findings were gathered via questions with Likert-type scale answers as is shown later on. Figure 1 identifies the hindrances to quality initiatives. The most pressing statement was with regard to salaries (57%). The finding on salaries is probably due to the disparity between the huge earnings of management and the very low wages given to manual workers involved in the operations. Problems related to wages and salary are common in the metal and mining companies in South Africa. It is not solely a problem found in bigger companies, as small-, medium- and micro-enterprises (SMMEs) face similar challenges, especially following the worldwide economic nightmare. Metals have always been a store of value in times of financial crisis (Moumakwa & Perold, 2014).

The decline in commodity prices and the refusal to buy metals and minerals during and in the aftermath of the economic recession could be cited as one of the excuses advanced by the recyclers not to increase the wages and salaries of operators and other general workers. The second most common statement refers to safety (27%) as shown in Figure 1 below.

# Figure 1: Hindrances to Quality Initiatives



A total of 57% required an increase in income in order to embark on quality initiatives and perform a quality job (Figure 1). Zondo (2005) established that gain sharing enhances employees' satisfaction and stimulates them to participate in problem solving in the firm.

# **Product Quality and Safety**

The research findings reveal satisfactorily that product quality is emphasised in the company under investigation.





Figure 2 demonstrates that the company should prioritise health, safety and quality. More than half of the respondents (53.1%) did not feel that the company prioritised safety and quality, while 32.7% felt that the company did do so. This finding is consistent with Singh's (2006), who is of the opinion that safety and quality, as well as other management systems have an impact when they are integrated. There are studies that support changing a company's culture into one of coaching and training. Figure 3 shows the results on product quality.

Figure 3 indicates that the company produces metal and non-metal products. This is in keeping with the environmentally friendly practices of recycling operations. Even though

a total of 61.2% agrees that the scraps produced are free of dirt, a total of 30.6% of respondents oppose this view and indicates it as a matter of concern. It is an indication that more should be done to meet RIOS requirements and ISRI specifications.



# Figure 3: Product Quality

This is also true for the statement, 'the company is ensuring that bales are made of intended materials,' where 24.5% of the respondents disagreed. A total of 59.2% agreed that the company does not ensures that bales meet the specifications well enough. One would expect a higher score on these quality-related constructs. A total of 16.3% of respondents neither agreed nor disagreed. This is an indication of a lack of motivation in the current affairs of the firm among some.

Zondo (2005) states that gainsharing as a booster of interests is important and practical. The findings reveal that the workforce believes that the scraps, i.e. ferrous stock, nonmetals such as polyvinyl chloride (PVC), as well as mineral products, including copper, aluminium, and zinc, meet quality requirements. In keeping with quality initiatives, manpower is needed to burn dirt on bales, brush out dirt and clean unwanted stuff on metal and mineral commodities.

The study demonstrates that quality enhancement increases product sales. Although operations scored low, a total of 90.9% of managers and supervisors were of the opinion that the company meets the ISRI specifications based on which it is benchmarked. Although quality is generally met, the economic meltdown has negatively affected the scrap trade, causing the demand for metals to decrease (Brookes, 2009).

The company's report provides a summary of metals and minerals that were affected by the recession (Euro Trade Metals Africa, 2007). Table 1 presents a summary of scrap metal, non-metal and mineral products traded by most recycling companies in KZN.

| Codes            | Commodity  | Number of items |
|------------------|--|-----------------|
|                  | Copper   | 17 categories   |
| 101/102-101/123  | Other: Tinned Copper Wire; Chrome<br>Copper                          | 2 categories    |
| 099/062-100/101  | Copper/Milberry  | 3 categories    |
| 100/090-101/106  | Berry  | 8 categories    |
| 100/107-101/119  | Birch Cliff  | 4 categories    |
| 102/151-107/2523 | Gun Metal  | 15 categories   |
| 102/150-107/220  | Brass  | 15 categories   |
| 115/505-115/506  | Circuit Boards   | 3 categories    |
|                  | Ferrous Stock  | 9 categories    |
|                  | HMS 1 (Hard Metal Steel; LMS (Light Metal Steel – sub-grade unbaled) |                 |
|                  | LMS (baled;Cast Iron; Steel Shavings; Chrome Steel; P & S (Plate &   |                 |
| 345/718 Xc       | Structural);Stainless Steel-Magnetic; Tin Plate                      |                 |
| 102/158-200/455  | Other refining & Slags   | 15 categories   |
| 102/166-         | Refinery gear  | 16 categories   |
| 200/455          |  |                 |
| 115/203          | PVC  |                 |
| 101/120          | China Mixed Metals   | 15 categories   |
| 200/442-200/500  | Aluminium  | 28 categories   |
| 300/374-446/350  | White Metal  | 11 categories   |
| 345/717-345/720  | Stainless Steel  | 11 categories   |
| 550/650-550/653  | Zinc   | 4 categories    |
|                  |  |                 |

# **Table 1: Secondary Metal, Non-Metal and Mineral Products common in KZN Trading**

Source: Euro Trade Metals Africa (2007)

# Recommendations

A set of recommendations includes the need to embrace an integrated approach to quality (SECQA model) and the snake analogy safety strategy (SASS, 2011). The solution to the problems identified in the company lies in the two models and the possibility to innovate according to the needs that arise. It is also recommended that the company resumes health
and safety training, as well as other training such as time management and weighbridge control mechanisms.

#### Conclusions

In relation to the aim, which was to investigate the impact of quality initiatives in the operations of the metal recycling company, there is a significant relationship between quality initiatives and the efficiency of the recycling operations of metal, non-metal and mineral products.

In relation to the objectives, the following conclusions are salient:

Objective 1: to determine the influence of quality initiatives on the company's productivity:

A total of 75.5% of the respondents agrees that quality improvement increases scrap metal sales. This is a productivity measurement in most companies.

Objective 2: to evaluate the significance of education on quality issues towards enhancing health and safety:

There is a need to conduct training to improve managers' attitude towards enhancing health and safety as an integrated approach to quality management. Therefore, it is concluded that more training and retraining, learning and unlearning should be catered for in this company.

Objective 3: to identify the drawbacks hampering the effectiveness of quality initiatives in metal operations:

This objective was as well achieved. Numerous hindrances and bottlenecks were identified. Among the others, the cost factor, the attitude of the personnel involved or the decisionmakers and the problems in the system itself were highlighted. The following misses and near misses were found: bad cash flow, ineffective grading of materials or insufficient weighbridge control mechanisms; inefficient consultancy approach; mismanagement of time; insufficient or irregularly patterned productivity; and ineffective communication across the echelons.

## List of References

Bennett, J. 2003. Evaluation methods in research. New York: Continuum.

Besterfield, D.H. 2009. Quality control. 8<sup>th</sup> ed. Upper Saddle River, N.J.: Pearson International Edition.

Brookes, P. 2009. World scrap market in 2009: volatility remains threat in challenging markets. *Metal bulletin*, (9079):12, Summer.

Christensen, T.H. 2011. Solid waste technology and management. Chichester, West Sussex: Wiley.

Christie, L. 2010. Minutes of the Metal Recyclers Steering Committee meeting held on28 January. Durban: KZN Agriculture, Environmental Affairs and Rural Development.

Deming, E. 2009. Seven deadly diseases. Available: https://www.google.com/imgres?imgurl=https://i.ytimg.com/vi/rpi (accessed 15 January 2017).

Downturn Brings Opportunity. 2008. Metal bulletin: the year the rules changed. *Metal bulletin*, End-of-year issue: 29.

Euro Trade Metals Africa (EMA). 2007. Eurotrade trading status report. Phoenix Industrial Park: EMA.

Fasheun, T. 2010. Industrial cohesion planning for the scrap metal recycling industry and the environment. Pietermaritzburg: KZN Agriculture, Environmental Affairs and Rural Development.

Foster, K. 2009. Scrap is key to economic regeneration: Bill Cliton. Available: www.kcscrapyard.com/wp-content/uploads/scrap\_is\_key.pdf (Accessed 15 January 2018).

Gilbert, M., Ruigrok, W. and Wicki, B. 2008. What passes as a vigorous case study. *Strategic Management Journal*, 29: 1465-1474.

Grobler, P.A., Warnich, S., Carrell, M.R., Elbert, N.F. & Hatfield, R.D. 2006. Human resource management in South Africa. 3<sup>rd</sup> ed. London: Thomson.

Isheloke, B.E. 2011. SASS 2011: Snake Analogy Safety Strategy. Durban: EMA.

Johnson, G., Scholes, K. & Whittington, R. 2006. Exploring corporate strategy: text and cases. 7<sup>th</sup> ed. London: Financial Times Prentice Hall.

Kelemen, M. 2003. Practical approaches to quality. London: Sage.

Kreng, V.B & Chiu, Y.W. 2012. Applying KM matrix and LCA theory to organizational. *African journal of business management*, 6(25):7569-7576.

Lakhal, L. & Pasin, F. 2008. The direct and indirect impact of product quality on financial performance: a causal model. *Total quality management and business excellence*, 19(10):1087-1099.

Mitra, A. 2008. Fundamentals of quality control and improvement: solutions manual to accompany. 3<sup>rd</sup> ed. Hoboken, N.J.: Wiley.

Moumakwa, O. & Perold, P. 2014. Performance of South Africa's precious metals and minerals sector during the third quarter of 2014. *MB bulletin*, 27(3):1-21.

Nankana, A.N. 2005. The seven magnificent: simple, quick and cost effective tools for improvement. New Delhi: New Age International.

Ndwandwe, E. 2012. Focus on big break: recycling turns garbage into business, creates jobs. *Mercury business report:* 23, 30th March.

OmniLingua. 2004. PDSA cycle. http://www.omniLingua.com/en/quality.html Date of access: 9 October 2010.

RIOS (Recycling Industry Operating Standard). 2006. The key to continual QEH & S improvement. Washington, D.C.: ISRI.

ISRI (Institute of Scrap Recycling Industries). 2008. Scrap specifications circular. Washington, D.C.: ISRI.

Scrap Specifications Circular. 2008. Washington, DC: ISRI.

Shapiro, J.F. 2007. Modelling the supply chain. 2<sup>nd</sup> ed. Belmont, Calif.: Thomson Brooks/Cole.

Singh, S. 2006. An integrated approach to quality. Durban: University of Technology. (Thesis - D.Tech.)

Van de Ven, A.H. & Poole, M.S. 2005. Alternative approaches for studying organizational change. *Organization studies*, 26(9):1377-1404.

Wang, L.K., Shammas, N.K. & Hung, Y., *ed.* 2009. Waste treatment in the metal manufacturing, forming, coating and finishing industries. Boca Raton, Fla.: CRC Press.

Zondo, R.D. 2005. Management Attitudes towards Gainsharing as a strategic tool for productivity improvement at a selected South African company. Durban: University of Technology. (Dissertation - M.Tech.)

Zuma, J.G. 2012. State of Nation's Address. SABC 2, 9 February, 1900hrs-2000hrs.

# LIVELIHOODS DIVERSIFICATION AMONG RIVERBED FARMERS: A CASE STUDY OF NYAMINYAMI DISTRICT, ZIMBABWE

## Felix Tombindo and Takunda J Chirau (Damelin: Menlyn)

tombindofelix@gmail.com

This research reviews diversification in livelihood studies based on a case study of riverbed farmers in semi-arid Negande communal area in NyamiNyami district, Zimbabwe. Riverbed farming is a seasonal livelihood strategy that involves cultivating on the riverbed of a local Mawena river during winter. Riverbed farming originated because of the semi-arid agroecological conditions that generally characterise the Zambezi Valley and the NyamiNyami district. The study is grounded in a qualitative methodology; with focus groups, transect walks, unstructured and key informant interviews as the main data soliciting tools. It was deduced that riverbed farmers try to diversify their livelihoods in Negande because of the seasonality of the farming practice but with little if any success for positive livelihood outcomes. A chasm and lack of common understanding were deduced between riverbed farmers and important institutions, such as Government. These institutions do not recognise the need to address the plight of the farmers by availing input support to them, as the farming practice is 'unconventional'. The study recommends policy reforms through, for instance, resettlement of Negande inhabitants to ecologically suitable farming regions, so that Negande can evade severe hunger, malnutrition and human capital underdevelopment.

Keywords: diversification, mabbonzyi, riverbed farming, rural livelihoods

#### Introduction

This research comments on diversification in livelihood studies based on a case study of riverbed farmers in semi-arid Negande communal area in the NyamiNyami district, Zimbabwe. Negande is characterised by adverse climatic and ecological conditions (poor soils, high temperatures and recurrent droughts). These factors militate against agriculture, which is the immediate safety net for the community. The central reference for analysis is a case study of 'rural survival innovation' in the form of riverbed farming (hereafter interchangeably referred to as *mabbonzyi* as riverbed farmers call it). Taking cognisance of the influence of external institutions as well as the 'mixed-bag' nature of rural livelihoods (rural livelihoods scholarship has for long painted a reflex-like, spontaneous

reference to the diversified nature of rural livelihoods), the study probes and critiques the 'diversification' of livelihoods survival strategies.

Omay communal land is one of three communal lands that make up the NyamiNyami district (Mubaya, 2008; Sibanda, 2001). The other two are Makande (formerly Kanyati) and Gatshe-Gatshe. NyamiNyami district is in the North-Western part of Zimbabwe (Mashonaland West province) and is part of the Zambezi Valley. Omay communal land is sub-divided into nine wards. Of the nine wards, eight are under the traditional jurisdiction of four chiefs, namely Mola, Negande, Msampakaruma and Nebiri. Chiefs Mola and Negande are Tonga chiefs and the other two are of Shangwe origin. Highlighting the ethnic composition here is important for two reasons. First, *mabbonzyi* is an agricultural practice linked to the Tonga people and their historical connections with life in the hot and semi-arid Zambezi Valley. Second, the Tonga constitute the 'traditional population of NyamiNyami district' (Mashinya, 2007:14). For these reasons, reference is made mainly to the Tonga people in this background.

At the time of this study, an agricultural extension officer asserted that Negande has 756 households. It is located approximately 20 kilometres from Siakobvu growth point and poorly connected to the outside world. A dust road that is mostly inaccessible during the rainy season due to the flooding of the Mawena river connects Negande to Siakobvu. *Mabbonzyi* farming is practised on the Mawena riverbed during winter. Poor physical capital (road networks) is detrimental to the realisation of positive livelihood outcomes because roads are vital for linking an area to external markets. Roads also make livelihood outsourcing viable through the unhindered migration of people in search for work. Often, people from Negande must travel the 20-kilometre distance to Siakobvu on foot where they can access transport in the form of one bus that connects the area to either Karoi town (210 kilometres away) or to Chitekete growth point (40 kilometres away) in the Gokwe district.

The settlement of the BaTonga people in the NyamiNyami district dates back to their forced displacement to pave the way for the Kariba dam construction in the 1950s. The displacement of the BaTonga was accompanied with very little if no compensation for their

disturbed livelihood and this has turned them into one of the most impoverished, least developed and unconnected communities in Zimbabwe (Basilwizi Trust, 2010; Musona, 2011). NyamiNyami district lies in Zimbabwe's natural region 5 (which is semi-arid). This explains the area's susceptibility to persistent droughts. A report by UNDP in 2003 ranked NyamiNyami as the poorest of Zimbabwe's 55 districts (Save the Children, 2004). This displacement has subjected the Tonga people to livelihood vulnerability in an area that is susceptible to persistent droughts and malaria and that is tsetse infested.

Although livelihood experts point to the exposure of everyone (rich or poor, rural or urban) to livelihood vulnerability, the case of the Tonga in Negande is worsened by limited diversification options and, where diversification is endeavoured, chances of realising positive livelihood outcomes are severely meagre. Reminiscent of the classical development of capitalism, NyamiNyami has been subjected to a protracted history of the neo-enclosure of productive assets from the rural population. The colonial and postcolonial governments have systematically access-affected natural resource management regimes that prevent NyamiNyami inhabitants from accessing natural resource endowments in their area, particularly but not limited to wildlife. Authoritative natural resource management institutions<sup>5</sup> refer to them as poachers (Dzingirai, 2003a:41), while their meagre agricultural produce is annually destroyed by wild animals like elephants, hippos and buffaloes, which are strictly protected by the state (Musona, 2011; Dzingirai, 2003a, 2003b; Mashingaidze, 2013; Sibanda, 2001). The area is characterised by chronic poverty as a result of limited social and educational development opportunities, isolation from markets, poor soils and erratic rainfall. As such, NyamiNyami is a site of countless relief projects (Metcalfe, 1994; Mashinya, 2007:114). Such relief projects, though plausible, do not enable the people to be self-sufficient as they tend to tackle only the 'symptoms of the problem' (starvation and hunger), rather than empower the people to stand on their own by

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>5</sup>This refers in particular to the Department of National Parks and Wildlife Authority and the Campfire Communal Areas Management Programme for Indigenous Resources (CAMPFIRE) arrangement. The latter is controlled by the NyamiNyami Rural District Council. All these institutions vest ownership of land and natural resources in the hands of the state and curtail rural livelihoods options by restricting natural resource use and access by rural communities in NyamiNyami.

tackling the roots of the problem (supporting people to eke out their own livelihoods through availing to them required resources or inputs).

#### **Problem Statement**

Macro policies premised on 'redistributive justice' adopted by the post-colonial Zimbabwean government since the turn of the millennium such as the Fast Track Land Reform Programme (FTLRP) have surprisingly turned a blind eye toward minority groups such as the BaTonga people. Yet, their lives appear to be based primarily on agriculture in predominantly semi-arid areas. Such neglect indubitably militates against the achievement of noble goals such as the Millennium Development Goals (MDGs). The Negande communal area forms part of Zimbabwe's regions and this study through observation of the unique type of farming aimed to analyse the livelihood portfolios of households in question and see whether an 'ethnology' could be compiled which resonates with the rest of Zimbabwe's rural populace.

The paper does not claim to bring nascent or new literature with regard to rural livelihoods scholarship in general, but it is complementary to a broad base of studies on rural livelihoods in Zimbabwe that have ignored this marginalised area. Most of the recent studies since the turn of the millennium on livelihoods in Zimbabwe have tended to focus on the FTLRP and livelihoods or food security (Jowah, 2009; Chabhorongaet al., 2010; Chingarande, 2010). Furthermore, the other studies paid particular attention to the 'informal economy' and livelihoods (Chirau & Chamuka, 2013; Chirau et al., 2014), but none of these have had a direct reflection of the situation in Negande. In a nutshell, this study adds to such paucity of information about rural livelihood in a marginal community such as Negande.

#### Objectives

- To identify the livelihood diversification options among riverbed farmers in Negande.
- To assess the contribution of diversification strategies augmenting riverbed farming.

#### **Research Questions**

• What are the different livelihood activities engaged in by riverbed farmers?

- What endowments do respective households have access to for complementing riverbed farming?
- How successful are riverbed farmers' livelihood diversification activities towards providing positive livelihood outcomes?

## **Rural Livelihoods Diversification**

Livelihoods diversification describes the building of a 'diverse set or portfolio of activities and assets to survive and better their standard of living' (Ellis, 1997:5; Ellis, 2000:15). Hussein and Nelson (2016:3) define diversification as 'attempts by households to raise new incomes and reduce environmental risk, which differ sharply by the degree of freedom of choice (to diversify or not), and the reversibility of the outcome'. The aspect of freedom of choice raised by Hussein and Nelson (2016) is key here because it tells us that different households react differently to the need to engage in various livelihood activities. At a household level, these activities may denote different activities in which a member or members engage for survival (Makita, 2016:45).

#### The Sustainable Livelihoods Framework

Most people who live in the rural areas of poor countries and many who live in the urban areas are engaged in an unremitting struggle to secure a livelihood in the face of adverse social, economic and often political circumstances (Murray, 2001:2). The study used the Sustainable Livelihoods Framework (SLF) to analyse the riverbed farmers' livelihood strategies. The term 'sustainable livelihood' relates to a wide set of issues which encompass much of the broader debate about the relationships between poverty and the (natural) environment (Scoones, 1998). Livelihood analysis provides a valuable framework for understanding farmers' diverse 'rural life worlds', including their possible interest in and access to proposed innovations. Livelihood research focuses on the actualities of the lives of poor and vulnerable groups in an attempt to determine how these groups make their living in the context of risk and stress (Bohlen, 2001).

Diversification as a theme in livelihood studies emanates from what the SLF categorises as assets or capitals. A livelihood is considered 'sustainable' when it can cope with and recover from stresses and shocks, and maintain or enhance its capabilities and assets, while not undermining the natural resource base (Chambers & Conway, 1992). It is based on assets or capital in pursuit of different livelihood activities as well as withstanding and recovering from shocks. A livelihood comprises the capabilities, assets (including both material and social resources) and activities required for a means of living. The SLF demonstrates the preconditions for the attainment of sustainable livelihoods in different contexts through access to a range of livelihood resources which are combined in the pursuit of different livelihood strategies (Scoones, 1998). The SLF commences with assets owned, controlled or accessed by a household or individual (Ellis, 2000).

As such, access to assets (capital) is a panacea for the construction of livelihoods and to circumvent poverty trap. Various assets include natural capital, physical capital, financial capital, human capital and social capital (Scoones, 2000). Assets 'are not simply resources that people use to build livelihoods: they give them the capability to be and act' (Bebbington, 1999:2029). Assets for agricultural livelihood activities may take the form of machinery or tools needed for the pursuit of the farming practice that different households have or do not have for the purpose of their agricultural practice and the social resources that they have; that is, inter-households' connections or relations that they may have that may contribute towards livelihood outcomes.

Human and social capital may relate to issues regarding labour force composition and availability and other connections that different households may have to contribute towards the livelihood practice. Financial resources also constitute assets as they may also contribute to the attainment of sustainable livelihoods. The SLF looks at people as endowed with a variety of options through which they can attain livelihoods on 'different livelihood strategies' or coping strategies that people employ when exposed to a variety of challenges that militate against their livelihoods strategies.

Household strategies comprise different support sources and activities at different times of the year and these include gardening, use of common pool resources, share-rearing livestock and family splitting (Chambers, 1995:174). Households have a varied livelihood portfolio, with displays of infinite resourcefulness to make ends meet (Campbell, 2008). The logic behind this is that though people may be constrained by a number of factors –

political, economic or natural – they always engage in a number of alternatives in their battle for survival, which Murray mentioned at the beginning of this chapter.

As such, livelihood studies appraise the ability of people to diversify or engage in a number of activities aimed towards the attainment of a decent livelihood. Livelihood diversification through involvement in on-farm, off-farm and non-farm activities often transforms people's lives (Scoones, 2009). Though primacy may be on agriculture when it comes to livelihood activities for most rural people, there are also formal or informal livelihood options that the people may engage in to augment the agricultural produce through the five capital endowments explained.

# **Livelihoods Diversification in Practice**

Agriculture anchors rural economies but it is not sufficient for the survival of most households. This is mainly because of variegated challenges that militate against agriculture, such as droughts, climate change and diminishing returns for respective households' landholdings. The traditional view that rural economies are solely agricultural is thus obsolete because farming households across the developing world earn an increasing share of their income from non-farm sources (Haggablade et al., 2007; Bernstein, 1992:3). This realisation has led to a 'mixed-bag'/ diversification picture of rural households' livelihood portfolios as they try to augment seasonal agricultural produce. Rainfall variability and uncertainty surrounding its annual reliability have prompted communities in drought-prone areas to adapt to dynamic weather variation through strategies, which include diversification of livelihoods (Ncube, 2013; Alderman & Paxson, 1992; FAO, 2004). Chirau, Nkambule and Mupambwa (2014:1) argue that rural livelihoods are not only based on natural resources and agrarian activities, but also include informal activities, NGO donations, social reciprocity, pensions and remittances.

Although he wrote of abstract traditional societies that are difficult to compare with contemporary societies, classical sociologist Emile Durkheim noted that people in a traditional society setup rely on mechanical solidarity, which is more of a collective way of living. This is with strong affine and kinship ties as opposed to a contemporary individualised life that is apparent in modern society, particularly in urban areas.

Consequently, Neves and Du Toit (2013) observed that livelihoods in South Africa are patterned with 'culturally inscribed patterns of mutuality and social reciprocity'.

Most rural households' safety nets reflect elements of mechanical solidarity where social relations/resources are used to make ends meet (Chirau et al., 2014; Francis, 2002). Francis (2010) notes access to social networks and the use of relations in the construction or reconstruction of livelihoods succinctly. The study argues on vulnerability and livelihood in Madibogo, North West Province, South Africa, where households make use of patronage relations to get social welfare resources. In a similar manner, Mexican rural farmers cope with hazards in the region with financial sources from relatives and neighbours (Saldana-Zorilla, 2006). Social capital and informal gift giving therefore form part of the avenues through which rural households try to survive.

Off-farm activities are sometimes locally available in rural areas as households make use of their surrounding natural resources to survive. Although farmers have a low capacity to adapt, they often survive and cope in various ways over time (Nhemachena & Hassan, 2007:2). People in dry rural areas harness natural resources for survival. In the Dande district, Zimbabwe, merlot fruit is used as a dryland rural livelihood strategy (Chazovachii et al., 2012:1). Similar findings came from Bangladesh; a UBING study (2000) established that a minimum of 40% of food requirements for the rural population come from aquatic or terrestrial sources that are not cultivated (Sachs & Agrawal, 2002). As such, rural households are resourceful in utilising natural resources for survival, but the success of such activities in keeping households in question from the danger of malnutrition and hunger might vary in the long run, depending on largely but not limited to access to such natural resources which may be governed by informal or formal institutions. The question as to whether diversification activities of rural people are long-lasting might be a difficult one but it can be generalised that they do diversify in order to make ends meet in attempts to augment their often-seasonal agricultural produce.

Migration also provides a livelihood diversification avenue through searching for work, markets and various goods and services (Bernstein, 1992:3). Looking at rural people as fixed with the context of the rural homes and tied to their settlements is prone to give an

armchair assessment as they constantly move to and from urban areas for survival. For many African countries, Kenya in particular, labour migration income significantly contributes to the livelihoods of many households through remittances (Greiner & Sakdapolrak, 2012:526). In Kenya, statistics affirm that a third of rural households divide their members between rural and urban homes. Hence, rather than viewing them as static and passive recipients of constraints of agricultural productivity such as droughts, rural communities should also be viewed within the lens of struggling continuously through migration and livelihoods outsourcing.

#### Methodology and Research Instruments

The study was qualitative in nature, with focus groups (FGDs), transect walks, key informant and unstructured interviews as data soliciting instruments. Purposive sampling was utilised to select participants for research. More than 50% of the respondents were *mabbonzyi* farmers, while those who were not directly involved in *mabbonzyi* farming were included for comparative reasons as well as to get a holistic overview of livelihood practices in Negande. Data were collected through face-to-face interviews, tracing respective life histories of households in Negande to get a description of how, why and to what degree of success *mabbonzyi* farming contributed to people's survival. The study managed to give room for people to voice their usually taken for granted 'imponderabilia' surrounding everyday livelihood struggles. A qualitative approach enabled open-ended questions and provided room for further probing.

Two FGDs with male and female were conducted. Focus was on old people with assumed rich 'cultural capital' (knowledge) on the origins of *mabbonzyi* farming due to their long stay in the area. FGDs enabled many respondents to be interviewed at the same time; it was therefore time saving. FGDs also allowed participants to air their views in a multi-vocal nature. Data collection coincided with the time for *mabbonzyi* farming and the majority of respondents were interviewed while working on the fields. This made the combination of transect walks and interviews inevitable. Fifteen unstructured interviews were conducted. Five of these fifteen participants did not engage in *mabbonzyi* farming. Unstructured interviews allow illiterate or semi-literate people to be surveyed (Pareriwa, 1992). As such, they enabled the study to be flexible as it allowed respondents to be

interviewed in their native language. The appropriateness of the sample size in qualitative research is usually subjective but data saturation in most cases starts at ten participants onwards. Choosing both *mabbonzyi* farmers and non-*mabbonzyi* farmers was meant to ensure a nuanced, 'representative' and holistic nature of livelihood in Negande, which might not have been possible if the research had focused solely on *mabbonzyi* farmers.

# **Ethical Considerations**

Research ethics are professional issues which include fundamental principles such as honesty, fairness, respect for persons, to allude to only a few (Frankfort-Nachmias & Nachmias, 2007). The study sought informed consent to help respondents understand why they were participating in the research. Participants should know that their involvement is voluntary at all times, and they should receive a thorough explanation beforehand of the benefits, rights, risks and dangers involved with their participation in the research project (Frankfort-Nachmias & Nachmias, 2000). As such, participants were fully informed of the exact nature of the study (an academic study). No lies or any forms of deceit were employed to motivate people to participate, as this would have violated the respondents' right to freedom in choosing to participate or not. The study also observed voluntarism. Respondents were not coerced into participating in the research. Only those who agreed to participate in the study were considered. The study also observed aspects of anonymity and privacy. Scupin and Decorse (2009) noted that when cultural anthropologists engage in participant observation, they usually become familiar with information that might, if made public, become harmful to the community or individuals in the community. To cater for this, pseudonyms were used to separate information or data from the respective respondents.

#### Findings

#### Mabbonzyi as a Livelihood Strategy

Agricultural communities engage in either agricultural extensification or intensification for livelihood construction (Nkamleu, 2011, Chirau et al., 2014) but for Negande inhabitants, neither of the two options is viable. Extensification is not possible due to a lack of abundant arable land, while intensification is difficult because of the unavailability of modern inputs

and technology. As such, people resorted to *mabbonzyi*, comprised of very small plots per household but with meagre inputs. *Mabbonzyi* is augmented (in some cases) by unrewarding cotton contract farming and cultivation of drought-resistant sorghum. Cultivation of sorghum and contract farming are done during the conventional rainy season.

*Mabbonzyi* farming is an innovative way of using scarce natural capital (land and water). It is a centuries-old farming practice linked to floodplain cultivation practised in the Zambezi Valley before the displacement of the Tonga people. *Mabbonzyi* emanated from people's lived experiences as a mechanism to cope with livelihood stress in the severely hot Zambezi Valley, and Negande residents 'inherited' it from their ancestors who used to farm three times a year as an adaptation strategy to the severe climate conditions in the area. The Zambezi Valley has always been hot and characterised by low rainfall and constant flooding, but before the forced displacement, it was easy to be food-secure due to the availability of the perennial Zambezi River which enabled farming throughout the year.

*Mabbonzyi*, before the displacement of the Tonga from the Zambezi Valley, was a form of a livelihood coping strategy from natural disaster shocks (persistent droughts due to flooding and sometimes meagre rainfall) that was not subject to external policies or institutions prohibitive of such a farming practice. *Mabbonzyi* is subjected to a constraining environmental policy framework that does not fully appreciate people's unremitting struggle for survival under the severe natural environment conditions. These are the challenges of the rhetoric of 'sustainable development'. Livelihood practices that contrast the objectives of conservation are bastardised by environmental management regimes. Scott's (1985) 'everyday forms of resistance' describe the subtle ways through which 'less powerful' people silently but significantly resist powerful structures.

*Mabbonzyi* practice is an animation of passive resistance in the face of environmentally induced strain on livelihoods and restrictive environmental rules. It provides some agency vital for coping with livelihood stress, although the extent of this agency is limited in terms of its contribution to household self-sufficiency. Chatembwa explained the origins of *Mabbonzyi* in Negande: 'When we relocated to Negande, there was no room for us to

continue the practice of *mabbonzyi* due to government laws that prohibit us from farming near the rivers. Local authorities – the chief and headmen – do not prohibit *mabbonzyi* because they know the predicament that we are in. *Mabbonzyi* is a realisation that adherence to prohibitive environmental conservation laws does not make our food secure ... chronic hunger and poverty made us see the need to ignore the law.'

Livelihood scholarship is concerned with, among other issues, the ability of a livelihood to continue to serve its purpose while at the same time maintaining the natural source where it is based (Chambers & Cornway, 1992; Scoones, 2000). Pioneers of *mabbonzyi* farming in Negande claim that their conventional fields which lay near the Mawena River were eroded by floods, thus prompting them to eventually farm directly on the riverbed. It started as flood plain cultivation which proved more viable compared to the meagre harvests that people got from conventional farming. However, this resulted in erosion and siltation of the river until the demarcation between the river channel and its banks became unnoticeable.

Relatives of the pioneers of *mabbonzyi* gradually became interested in this 'unorthodox' farming practice which yielded better returns. This led to a subsequent apportionment of the river in Toto. Usufruct rights for those with access to portions on the river generally lay in their claims that their ancestral fields were eroded away into the river, hence their undisputed entitlement to cultivate on the river. Social capital (connections to those with access to portions on the riverbed) is important as it gives people without direct access to portions on the riverbed access to riverbed farming. In this sense, *mabbonzyi* farming confirms the notion of livelihood as 'socially embedded' (Sakdapolrak, 2014) and beyond the household as the sole unit of analysis.

However, social capital also exposed some households to vulnerability because the more one cuts off their portion to give to relatives, the greater the reduction of yields they get. As such, social capital can be a source of livelihood vulnerability in as much as it can be a means to obtaining a sustainable livelihood. Siachakanzwa had this to say: 'I have allocated my *bbonzyi* to three of my married sons. I cannot leave them starving but this means the

harvest I get is too small. I am now left with 46 lines (approximately hundred squared metres) on which to farm. The harvests can last for only a month or even less.'

The magnitude of the contribution of *mabbonzyi* differed according to the size of farming portion, one's access to credit or cash for inputs and means to livelihoods diversification. In other words, the contribution of *mabbonzyi* varied from one household to another depending on their respective capital (financial, human and natural) endowments. The larger one's piece of land on the river, the more likely was their harvest. Strategic position of the portion was also linked to high productivity; with those portions on the middle of the river likely to yield huge harvests due to prolonged time of moisture in the middle of the river.

For those with other skills or occupations, their yields were comparatively higher than those who solely depended on *mabbonzyi* farming. Chatembwa, a teacher by profession, noted: '*Mabbonzyi* is invaluable in complementing my other survival strategies. Last year, my off-river fields did not yield anything due to floods. I had to make up for the loss through *mabbonzyi*. This year again, I did not get anything from conventional farming due to floods ... I am heavily counting on these *mabbonzyi* maize crops. Last year, I had two scotch carts loads of maize from *mabbonzyi*. The bulk of the produce is for household consumption. When I get good harvests like I did last year, I also reserve some few buckets of maize which I use for *maricho* (informal work assistance) from fellow villagers to clear the fields for the next season. Every year I have seeds set aside for *mabbonzyi* in advance so that I do not lose the moisture as part of my portion is quite some metres away from the middle of the river' (where moisture lasts long).

In some instances, those who had access to larger portions of *mabbonzyi* also directly turned natural capital (land) into financial capital. These 'landlords' apportioned their *mabbonzyi* fields into smaller segments from which they got reasonable amounts of cash through renting them out for a season. Tigere, one of the landlords, had this to say: 'I saw it befitting to rent out part of my *bbonzyi* as I had a large portion which I could not farm on my own with limited access to resources such as seeds ... people would expect me to cut out portions to give to my kin and affine relations but if I do that, we will all suffer

because they are also poorly resourced. It is better for me to help them through remitting some of the accruing revenue from the rented portion ... the little amount that I charge is US\$25; it varies with the size of the portion.'

Those opting to rent were also differentiated from the rest of the 'common villagers' as they had access to other means of gaining financial capital through part-time employment from occasional donors that came with food relief and other related programmes aimed at curbing rampant ill-being (hunger and low educational levels) in the ward. Tapera, who has been on contract with local NGO Cordaid since 2012, asserted that '(conventional) farming during the rainy season has been yielding very little for years. *Mabbonzyi* has been comparatively helpful. I do not have a portion of my own, but I make sure that I keep some money aside for renting from Tigere every season. Fertilisers, draught power and intensive labour are required for conventional farming, unlike for *mabbonzyi*, so I will continue renting portions of *mabbonzyi* for my family's survival.'

Rural communities worldwide are characterised by heterogeneity, which results in differentiated livelihood strategies and outcomes. The same was evident in Negande. While a few respondents took *mabbonzyi* as a meagre livelihood strategy, the majority of those who engaged in the activity were largely dependent on it for their survival. Paradoxically, it emerged from the study that *mabbonzyi* is a seasonal livelihood strategy that can see the people under study through for only an average of three to four months from the time that they harvest the crop between late June and the entirety of August. This renders most people prone to chronic food shortages for most months of the year.

The majority of those who depended heavily on *mabbonzyi* were found to be people from lower societal castes, especially widowed women without sufficient human capital to engage in other substantive livelihood alternatives. Melody, one of the female focus group participants, had this to say: '*Mabbonzyi* is where our lives entirely rest on, but it does not last us the whole year. It lasts only for a few months – we do not survive from *sadza* ... look at our skin, does it reflect the skin of people who survive from *sadza*? Usually, I get three to six 50-kg bags which, with the size of my household (eight members), barely lasts

us three months. By December the stock will have dried up and to wait for food donations which usually come in February, we will have suffered a lot.'

The background to the origins of *mabbonzyi* farming clearly shows that the livelihood strategy is seasonal. Hence, this calls for alternative survival means other than riverbed farming. It is to these that the remaining sections turn in detail.

# Livelihoods Diversification among Mabbonzyi Farmers

As people come face-to-face with the need to eke out a living, they over a long time try to develop agency or coping strategies which sometimes, though alien to outsiders, are meaningful to those behind the ingenuity to come out of deprivation and severe ill-being, especially malnutrition and chronic hunger. In Negande, different households pursued different livelihood portfolios. The success of these depended on a range of all the five capitals necessary for a positive livelihood outcome, but especially human capital in the form of skills to engage in reliable formal employment. Households with sufficient human capital in terms of 'technical knowhow' to engage in long-term occupation or work relied less on *mabbonzyi*. Chatmebwa asserted that *'mabbonzyi* is a small alternative to a range of activities other activities I engage in for my family to survive. I am a government worker (a teacher) and I also have goats that I sell during times of hardship. My two wives rear chicken for household consumption and for sale.'

Two other respondents, Takawira and Orders, who during fieldwork for this study were working for local NGOs, Cordaid and Save the Children respectively, also cited formal employment. Such employment, however, was seasonal. For instance, Orders got employment when Save the Children came for food relief purposes during the November to March period. Hence, while reliable, this source of employment had to be utilised along with other activities to see their respective households through the season.

'Community' is a convenient sociological term which sometimes conceals the heterogeneity of households. Most households in Negande were identified as incapacitated in terms of chances of getting formal employment due to lack of formal education. This lack of adequately developed human capital did not, however, mean a complete passivity on the part of the people. Some households engaged in informal work in return for cash or

goods such as grain. Men engaged in manual labour such as building houses, construction of cattle kraals and moulding of bricks. Women gathered grass for thatching and either bartered it or sold it for cash within the community to those who needed it. 'Agency' is a crucial human characteristic in the face of constraints but this should not mislead us in the case of Negande community to seeing them as a well-endowed people with available alternatives for survival.

Livelihood scholarship often overemphasises the ability of people to overcome constraining structures through diversification / the language of coping (Taru, 2013; Mate, 2010). But this runs the risk of a speculative grand narrative which homogenises people in Negande, with the result that peculiarities of different households and their respective success or failure to achieve positive livelihood outcomes will not be captured succinctly. In most cases, this diversification proved to be seasonal (short-lived) with very limited remuneration or returns and thus insufficient to act as reliable sources for household food security. Siakanya explained: 'I engage in a variety of activities like building houses, moulding of bricks and house thatching. These help, but are not very reliable. The challenge is that I do not get someone who wants to have their house built or thatched on a monthly basis. Some can do the job on their own.'

The seasonality of diversification outcomes is pervasive in Negande, but adversity hit female-headed households more than households that had a male head. Widows, especially, were the most affected and they claimed that sometimes they went for weeks without a proper meal. In attempting to complement produce form *mabbonzyi*, some of them travelled to Chitekete in Gokwe where they would work in cotton fields after harvests. They cited difficulties in terms of unavailability of a well-developed physical capital (transport in this case) to ferry them to Chitekete and, as such, they had to walk a 40-km distance to Chitekete.

This had a constraining effect on their chances to get the *maricho* (informal, temporary jobs, in this case clearing cotton fields) because most time would be spent on the road and nearby households would have taken the available jobs already. Even if there had been a well-developed road network connecting Negande to the outside world, respondents

lamented that they could not afford the exorbitant fare charges to travel to Chitekete in search of informal employment. Vaida, a widow, asserted that: 'Besides *mabbonzyi*, I have very limited options for survival. Sometimes, I travel to Chitekete to look for temporary informal employment, usually clearing of cotton fields. There are challenges with this as sometimes I find the work already gone because of the time that it takes me to travel to Chitekete on foot. Life is not easy here ... usually, we have one meal a day and during the worst of times, we go for days without a proper meal.'

Echoing the same sentiments as Vaida was Keresia, who highlighted the limited survival strategies, the surveillance of wildlife and meagre options for wild fruit gathering that in the long run did not to a larger extent curb chronic hunger bedevilling her household. Mention was made of wild fruits such as *utsiga* and *pandakata* (no English or botanical name was found for these two), baobab fruit and aloe flowers, which were used for relish and eaten with *sadza*. Some households also gathered *utsiga* fruit for sale to other households that did not have access to it.

References to *utsiga* consumption by respondents in this study confirm reports by The Standard newspaper in February 2014 that Negande residents were facing severe food insecurity and were surviving on wild fruit, which did not, however, solve the problem of hunger. Keresia lamented that: 'I am a "bachelor" (meaning a widow), without any livestock or other reliable means to survive other than agriculture. When produce from my *bbonzyi* is finished, my household survives on *utsiga* which we gather from the forests. Most of it is sour but there is no option; we just eat to remain alive. I have three children and five grandchildren whom I cannot send to school as most of the times they do not have a proper meal. I also cannot afford to pay for their fees.'

Some relatively affluent households or families have livestock, especially goats which they can sell during times of livelihood stress. They, however, lamented against the unavailability of ready and reliable markets from which they could fetch reasonable returns from selling their livestock. This is again attributable to poor road networks that limit access to outside markets. As a result, they sell their livestock to local teachers and other formally employed professionals such as nurses or the local agriculture extension officer.

While this presented some sort of 'bail out', respondents complained about their weakened negotiation power for reasonable prices.

Those with money often do not want to pay amounts that congruent to the value of chicken, goats or produce from the garden. Usually, a mature hen or cock would go for US\$5 or US\$6 respectively, but teachers do not want to pay; they negotiate for lower prices and would pay US\$3 or US4. They know that there are no reliable buyers there and the sellers depend so much on them. A goat worth US\$25 ends up being sold for US\$15. A plate of tomatoes worth US\$1 ends up getting US\$0.50 in return. They take advantage of the sellers, knowing that there is nowhere else for them to sell. Out of desperation, the low prices are given.

The study found that conventional farming was not obsolete in Negande as some households engaged in the cultivation of the drought-resistant sorghum crop. Sorghum was for brewing of a 'one-day processed beer' known in the area as *chikirikiri*. *Chikirikiri* was sold through a standardised 2.5 litre *nderema* cup in cash or kind. In cash, it was pegged at US\$1 per *nderema* cup; with alternative purchasing, customers without cash could barter for beer with a 2.5 litre container of maize grain or an equivalent of sweet potatoes. The bulk of this beer is brewed in a huge drum ranging from 100 to 300 litres. Calculated for its rate of return value, *chikirikiri* is a significant source of livelihood diversification. *Chikirikiri* seemed to be a reliable source of quick income, not only for those who brewed it but also for local shop owners who sell important ingredients required for the brewing of the beer such as yeast.

Local shop owner Makanhaire said: 'Beer brewing is a vibrant source of income for local people here and this has also benefited me as a shop owner. Due to the increased demand for yeast, I always make sure that I have enough supply of yeast all the times. Yeast is one good that does not expire in my shop and I don't hesitate to buy it in bulk, unlike other goods which can take months or even the whole year without being bought, hence making me prone to loss.'

## **Food Donations and External Support**

Rural areas in Zimbabwe have been subject to massive food relief interventions, especially during the turn of the millennium with the isolation of the country from the international community. Negande, however, has always been in need of such food relief due to the unbearable natural environment and structural conditions. One major NGO, Save the Children, was very proactive in providing basic amenities, not only food relief but also support in education for children through donations of text and exercise books. The government's ministry of social welfare was another crucial player in donating money and sometimes inputs for farming such as seeds and fertilisers. The contribution of food donations, however, was inadequate due to a number of reasons. The first is the selective nature concerning beneficiaries, which made the bulk of respondents in this study lose appreciation of the contribution of such interventions.

Save the Children comes with food hand-outs, but most households do not benefit because they usually target the elderly and disabled. 'It is not every elderly person who benefits; the selection procedure is done by headmen who capture the names of the eligible persons but surprisingly my old mom who deserves to be there has never had the name taken down for food aid. We usually hear it when the day of food handouts has arrived, but the selection process is never clear.'

Here, the use of social capital was acknowledged because of its paramountcy, as those who failed to benefit from the food aid scheme were quick to assert the access that they got to food handouts from those who would have benefited. Kwezera had this to say: 'I have never directly benefited from food and other donations. I rely on the mercies of fellow villagers. When someone who has received food donations hears my children crying, out of their own mercy, they help. Even for inputs for farming, we heavily rely on donations from fellow villagers.'

While donations from outside did contribute to Negande people's livelihood portfolios, it was found that, in the long run, the donations were seasonal and therefore short-lived. They could not, eventually, capacitate the poorest of the villagers to move out of the vicious cycle of poverty in which they found themselves. The support and donations tackled the symptoms of the problem (starvation and hunger) rather than the real structural causes of the hunger itself.

Data in this study substantiate the generalisation of rural livelihoods scholarship (Chirau et al., 2014; Jowah, 2009; Bernstein, 1992) that 'agriculture is the mainstay of rural economies'. The influence of agroecological regions is significant (Dube & Phiri, 2013) because it directly affects the contribution of agriculture for rural households in different regions of space and time. A relativist approach that takes cognisance of regional peculiarities reflective of different rural economies avoids generalisations in terms of our understanding of rurality. As such, this study deduced that rurality is context-specific and has differentiated susceptibility to vulnerability as well as the strategies that people devise to cope with crop failure.

The study also resonates well with the livelihoods framework as well as previous literature in that all rural people try to diversify their livelihoods to cope in the face of vulnerability and livelihood constraints. Riverbed farming is itself an indication of *mabbonzyi* farmers' conscious attempts to traverse the persistent failure of conventional farming. The capacity of people in the study to cope in terms of activities that are beyond the farm depended on an array of capital endowments not least but inclusive of human capital (knowledge). Furthermore, access to natural capital (for those that rented out their portions in exchange for cash) and social resources (access to portions on the riverbed) were through relations and connections as was access to important goods, such as food donations for those who did not directly benefit.

Francis (2010) suggested that we must think of people's livelihoods as reactions to the external environment rather than as 'coping strategies'. The use of 'coping', 'survival' and 'strategies' conceal the depth of despair in which people find themselves (Mate, 2010; Taru, 2013). These arguments concur with the realities faced by *mabbonzyi* farmers. Looking at their livelihood options in terms of reactions better suits them than viewing them as 'strategising', which easily regards all households as endowed with the capability to cope with livelihoods. Since most households were worse-off, even those who practised *mabbonzyi*, reacting could be a better term for a livelihood study to consider, as it does not

stretch the optimism of people as calculative, being capable to act and cope with every risk they face.

In terms of the question of sustaining itself without depleting the natural resource base, *mabbonzyi* farming is unsustainable in the long run (the riverbed is evidently being eroded despite farmers' attempts to use minimum tillage techniques). This is largely attributable to ecological marginality and the context in which the people's livelihoods exist. The study thus argues that conventional natural resources conservation and popular environmental degradation narratives attribute to environmental degradation and to the lack of capacity of the locals to be custodians of their natural environments. It is rather an alienation from resource base. In light of this, if possible, policies such as the Fast Track Land Reform Programme should be revised to accommodate minority ethnic groups that live on the margins where adverse weather conditions make their livelihoods difficult. Instead of castigating rural people as incapable of caring for the environment, institutions like Government create the vulnerability context, which leads to unsustainable livelihood activities as people try to adapt to constant failure of livelihoods and severe ill-being.

The significance of capital endowments cannot be undermined. Due to poor physical capital development (road networks especially), *mabbonzyi* farmers are incapacitated in terms of seeking outward safety nets (migration to other areas to seek alternative employment). Contrary to a generalised view of migration of household members in search for paid income, cognisance must be taken that there are contexts in which migrating on its own is a mammoth task. Poor human capital development (specifically through formal education) also militates against meaningful livelihood construction other than agriculture, and the lack of this skill proved detrimental as households that did not have it were found with fewer options of diversification, unlike the few that had it and had options of formal employment for waged income. It is a point of emphasis from this study, therefore, that the government must invest not only in educating vast numbers of households in marginal communities, Negande in particular, but also in availing to them access to outside markets and surrounding natural resources so that they become capacitated in times of risk and crop failure.

Inter- and intra-households' stratification along the lines of capital endowments and capabilities (Francis, 2010) need not be ignored because such dynamics determine the success or failure of individuals to cope or to be resilient during times of livelihood stress and shocks. The vulnerability of livelihood to stress and shocks, just like poverty, is also gendered as this study revealed female-headed households that appeared less able to 'constructively react' and meaningfully 'cope' with persistent flooding, droughts and hunger. This concurs with livelihood scholarships that note the gendered nature of access to vital livelihoods resources (particularly land) and the marginalisation of women (Bhatasara, 2011; Chingarande, 2010; Prowse, 2010; Chirau et al., 2014). In this regard, livelihood research, rather than looking at rural livelihood generally and focusing on household as a unit of analysis, must narrow its analysis to individuals and how they survive.

Overall, rural livelihoods in Zimbabwe cannot be generalised as they tend to be imbued with different ecological conditions which determine people's respective reactions to the vulnerability conditions to which households find themselves subjected. Many invaluable analytical tools for livelihood studies (e.g. diversification and coping strategies) need sceptical analysis because what works for one household, village or district may not apply in another. The simplistic notion of outward migration and remittances as a safety net that most rural livelihood scholarships adhere to relentlessly was found not to be a significant contributor to livelihoods in Negande. While households may engage in a number of activities for survival in the face of severe vagaries of environmental marginality and hazards, these were found to be mostly seasonal, and not sufficient for adequate survival and well-being of most the respective households. The study agrees with Cannon's (2008) assertion that households, in responding to livelihoods shocks and stress, are left worse off. Therefore, making simplistic assessments of households being resilient to shock might be a misguided conclusion.

## List of References

Alderman, H. & Paxson, C.H. 1992. Do the poor insure? A synthesis of the literature on risk and consumption in developing countries. Washington, D.C.: World Bank. (Policy research working papers, WPS 1008.)

Basilwizi Trust. 2010. Sustainable development support for a poverty free Zambezi Valley: Strategic plan 2010 - 2015. Bulawayo, Zimbabwe: Basilwizi Trust.

Bebbington, A. 1999. Capitals and capabilities: a framework for analysing peasant viability, rural livelihoods and poverty. *World development*, 27(12):2021-2044.

Bernstein, H. 1992. Agrarian structures and change: Sub-Saharan Africa. (*In* Bernstein, H., Crow, B. & Johnson, H., *eds*. Rural livelihoods: crises and responses. Oxford: Oxford University Press and the Open University. Ch. 2.)

Bhatasara, S. 2011. Women, land and poverty in Zimbabwe: deconstructing the impacts of the Fast Track Land Reform Program. *Journal of sustainable development in Africa*, 13(1):316-330.

Bohlen, H.G. 2001. Neue Ansatze der geographischen Risikorforschung: Ein Analyserahmen zur Berstimmung nachhaltiger Lebernssicherung von Armutsgruppen. *Die Erde*, 132(2):119-140.

Campbell, B. 2008. Links between the Local Trade in Natural Products, Livelihoods and Poverty Alleviation in a semi-arid Region of South Africa. Vol. 36(3). March 2008. DOI: 10.1016/j.worlddev.2007.03.003

Cannon, T. 2008. Reducing people's vulnerability to natural hazards communities and resilience. (Research Paper / UNU-WIDER, No. 2008.34.)

Chabhoronga, K., Hahlani, C. & Chigora, P. 2010. An analysis of the impact of the fast track land reform programme on disaster management in Zimbabwe: a case of Vungu Rural District (2000-2009). *Journal of sustainable development in Africa*, 12(2):144-164.

Chambers, R. 1995. Poverty and livelihoods: whose reality counts? *Environment and urbanization*, 7(1):173-204.

Chambers, R. & Conway, G. 1992. Sustainable rural livelihoods: practical concepts for the 21<sup>st</sup> century. Sussex: Institute of Development Studies. (IDS paper no. 296.)

Chazovachii, B., Mutangi, G.T., Chitongo, L. & Mushuku, A. 2012. Dry land livelihood strategies: Merlot (Masawu) fruit utilisation in Dande Area. *Zimbabwe journal of sustainable development in Africa*, 14(3):98-110.

Chingarande, S.D. 2010. Livelihoods after land reform in Zimbabwe: gender and livelihoods in Nyabamba A1 Resettlement Area, Chimanimani District of Manicaland Province in Zimbabwe. Harare: University of Zimbabwe. Sociology Department. (Working paper 5.)

Chirau, T. & Chamuka, P. 2013. Politicisation of urban space: evidence from women in formal traders at Magaba, Harare in Zimbabwe. *Global advanced research journal of history, political science and international relations*, 2(2):014-026.

Chirau, T. J.; Nkambule, S and Mupambwa, G. 2014 Rural Livelihoods in Zimbabwe: Heterogeneity, Diversification and Vulnerability. International Journal of Innovation and Applied Studies SSN 20289324, 5(1), pp. 5-15. [Online], Available from: http://www.issr journals.org/ijias/ [Accessed 4 September 2014].

Dube, T. and Phiri, K. 2013. Rural Livelihoods under Stress: The Impact of Climate Change on Livelihoods in South Western Zimbabwe. American International Journal of Contemporary Research Vol. 3 No. 5; May 2013. Lupane State University: Department of Development Studies.

Durkheim, E. 1982. The Rules of the Sociological Method (edited by with an introduction by Steven Lukes, translated by W. D. Halls). New York: The Free Press.

Dzingirai, V. 2003a. CAMPFIRE is not for Ndebele migrants: the impact of excluding outsiders from CAMPFIRE in the Zambezi Valley, Zimbabwe. *Journal of Southern African studies*, 29(2):445-459.

Dzingirai, V. 2003b. The new scramble for the African countryside. *Development and change*, 34(2):243-264.

Ellis, F. 1998. 1997. Household strategies and rural livelihood diversification, The Journal of Development Studies, 35:1, 1-38, DOI: 10.1080/00220389808422553

Ellis, F. 2000. Rural livelihoods and diversity in developing countries. Oxford: Oxford University Press.

FAO (Food and Agriculture Organization of the United Nations). 2004. The state of food and agriculture 2003-2004: agricultural biotechnology: meeting the needs of the poor? Rome: FAO.

Francis, E. 2010. Rural livelihoods, institutions and vulnerability in North West Province, South Africa. *Journal of Southern African studies*, 28(3):531-550.

Frankfort-Nachmias, C and Nachmias, D. 2000. Research Methods in The Social Sciences. New York: Worth.

Greiner, C. & Sakdapolrak, P. 2012. Rural-urban migration, agrarian change and the environment in Kenya: a critical review of the literature. *Population and environment*, 34(4):524-553.

Haggablade, S. et-al. 2007. Transforming the rural nonfarm economy. Baltimore: Johns Hopkins University Press.

Hussein, K. & Nelson, J. 2016. Sustainable livelihoods and livelihoods diversification. Brighton, UK: University of Sussex. Institute of Development Studies. (IDS working paper 69.)

Jowah, E.V. 2009. Rural livelihoods and food security in the aftermath of the fast track land reform in Zimbabwe. Grahamstown: Rhodes University. (Dissertation - MA.)

Makita, R. 2016. Livelihood diversification with certification-supported farming: the case of land reform beneficiaries in the Philippines. *Asia Pacific viewpoint*, 57(1):44-59.

Mashingaidze, T.M. 2013. Beyond the Kariba dam induced displacements: the Zimbabwean Tonga's struggles for restitution, 1990s - 2000s. *International journal on minority and group rights*, 20(3):381-404.

Mashinya, J. 2007. Participation and devolution in Zimbabwe's CAMPFIRE program: findings from local projects in Mahenye and Nyami-Nyami. College Park, Md.: University of Maryland. (Thesis - PhD.)

Mate, R. 2010. Feminist responses to the neo-liberal global economic order. *Buwa*! *Journal on African women's experiences*, 1(1).

Metcalfe, S. 1994. The Zimbabwe communal area management programme for indigenous resources (CAMFIRE). (*In* Western, D. & Wright, D., *eds*. Natural connections: perspectives in community-based conservation. Washington, D.C.: Island Press. p. 161-92.)

Mubaya, C.P. 2008. Community-based Natural Resources Management (CBNRN) in distress: experiences from Omay Communal Lands, Zimbabwe. Bloomington, Ind.: Indiana University.

Murray, C. 2001. Livelihoods research: some conceptual and methodological issues. Manchester: University of Manchester. Department of Sociology.

Musona, M. 2011. An exploration of the causes of social unrest in Omay communal lands of Nyami Nyami District in Zimbabwe: a human needs perspective. Port Elizabeth: Nelson Mandela Metropolitan University. (Thesis - PhD.)

Ncube, A. 2013. Household food security: the case of Hurungwe district, Zimbabwe. Pretoria: University of South Africa. (Dissertation - MA.)

Neves, D. & Du Toit, A. 2013. Rural livelihoods in South Africa: complexity, vulnerability and differentiation. *Journal of agrarian change*, 13(1):93-115.

Nhemachena, C. & Hassan, R. 2007. Micro-level analysis of farmers' adaptation to climate change in Southern Africa. Washington, D.C.: International Food Policy Research Institute. (IFPRI discussion paper 00714.)

Nkamleu, G.B. 2011. Extensification versus intensification: revisiting the role of land in African agricultural growth. Tunis: African Development Bank.

Pareriwa, M. 1992. Carrying out your research project. Harare: Ministry of Health and Child Welfare.

Prowse, M. 2010. Integrating reflexivity into livelihoods research. *Progress in development studies*, 10(3):211-231.

Sachs, W. & Agrawal, H. 2002. The Jo'burg memo: fairness in a fragile world. (Memorandum for the World Summit on Sustainable Development.) Berlin: Heinrich Foundation.

Sakdapolrak, P. 2014. Livelihoods as social practices: re-energising livelihoods research with Bourdieu's theory of practice. *Geographica Helvetica*, 69(1):19-28.

Saldana-Zorilla, S.O. 2006. Stakeholders' views in reducing rural vulnerability to natural disasters in Southern Mexico: hazard exposure, coping and adaptive capacity. *Global environmental change*, 18(4):583-597.

Save the Children. 2004. Household economy assessments: Binga and Nyaminyami (Kariba Rural) Districts, Matabeleland North and Mashonaland West Provinces, Zimbabwe. Harare: Save the Children.

Scoones, I. 1998. Sustainable livelihoods: a framework for analysis. Brighton, UK: Institute of Development Studies (IDS). (IDS working paper 72.)

Scoones, I. 2009. Livelihoods perspectives and rural development: critical perspectives in agrarian change and peasant studies. *Journal of peasant studies*, 36(1):171-196.

Scoones, I. 1998. Sustainable Livehoods: A framework for analysis. IDS, Working Paper 72, IDS, Brighton, UK, June 1998.

Scott, J.C. 1985. Weapons of the weak: everyday forms of peasant resistance. New Haven, Conn.: Yale University Press.

Scupin, R. and Decorse, C. R. 2009. Anthropology: A Global Perspective (6th edition). PHI Learning Private Limited.

Sibanda, B.M.C. 2001. Wildlife and communities at the crossroads: is Zimbabwe's Campfire the way forward? Harare: SAPES Books.

Taru, J. 2013. NGO projects and urban livelihood activities: lessons from institutionalized urban gardens in Masvingo. *Journal of social and political sciences*, 2(1):04-11.

The Standard. 2014. Starvation kills Kariba, Siakobvu villagers. *The Standard*, 9 February. http://www.thestandard.co.zw/2014/02/09/starvation-stalks-kariba-siakobvu-villagers/. Date of access: 9 February 2014.

# IS 'READICIDE' A MERE TREND, A CRISIS OR THE INEVITABLE END OF READING IN SOUTH AFRICAN SCHOOLS? OBSERVATIONS FROM THE CLASSROOM

#### Emmanuel Nwaneri (Damelin: Pretoria City)

emmanwaneri@gmail.com

*Keywords*: *Reading, Readicide, Home Language, Education, Signage, Researcher Decline, Sample, Humanities, Assessment* 

#### Introduction

In layman's terms, this article describes reading as the act of interpreting written messages. Furthermore, reading is one of the two principal ingredients that need to be present before people can qualify as educated. The other ingredient is writing. Thus, an educated person needs to be able to read and write. These two abilities must be present and expressed as evidence of having obtained education.

McGuinness (1997:6) describes reading as a 'skilled behaviour'. In her logical explanation, she outlined that reading needs to be taught by starting with simple methods and building up to the 'complex whole'. According to Jennings (1965:4), reading is the 'practical management of the world about us'. Furthermore, he explains that reading begins with the management of signs that surround us. In other words, reading helps people to interpret what they see and attach meaning to them.

In almost every country in the world, a copious amount of money is spent on education. The desire to educate people occupies the front seat in every government's plan of action or expense sheet. Even on a personal level, a child is sent to school almost as soon as they can stand on their own two legs and walk. The desire of every parent, everywhere in the world, to educate their child knows no bounds. The need to acquire education is drummed into almost every child in every home and almost no effort is spared to expose children to education at all levels.

At the most rudimentary stage of schooling, otherwise known as crèche or kindergarten, children begin their education by interpreting images, pictures and symbols. Eventually, as they progress and get older and move ahead on the stepladder of learning, they learn the alphabet (or letters). Words are formed by those letters and the meaning of each word is understood.

For the rest of the long years spent in the classroom – moving from primary to high school and onto tertiary institutions – the child acquires learning along the way and eventually graduates in a particular speciality, which qualifies them to seek employment as a specialist in a specific field of study. At every step of this tedious, knowledge acquisition marathon called schooling, the basic activities of reading and writing remain unchanged, necessary and non-negotiable. Classmates, teachers, subjects, qualifications and schools will surely change along the way, but the twin-activities of reading and writing remain constant. If for no other reason, reading takes place in the form of studying to prepare the child to write assessments which they must pass to move on to the next stage of learning. So, if education remains a great need, it has become impossible to avoid reading as a means to achieving education.

However, it is also noticeable that reading is gradually often being limited to merely a means to passing examinations. In other words, if there is no looming examination, there is no point in opening a book and interpreting the written message therein. This tendency has crept into the fabric of society, so much so that despite the fact that 'all around the world ... more money is being spent on higher education' (Barnett & Coate, 2005), reading habits seem to be on the decline.

#### **Problem Statement**

Evidence of a poor or declining reading culture abounds almost everywhere we look in South Africa. The simple example of unsold bundles of newspapers and magazines in supermarket aisles, as well as piles of unsold newspapers and magazines gathering dust by the street corners with near-idle vendors standing guard is testament to how little interest is attached to reading in our society. The growing popularity of online reading must, however, be mentioned as a possible reason behind the growing stacks of unsold newspapers and magazines.

This attitude is proof of a greater malaise borne of historical perceptions in people's upbringing. Cain (2010:4) made reference to this by stating that there is a wrong perception in most cultures that as long as children are taught to read and understand the meanings of individual words, understanding will naturally follow.

To make things worse, children's upbringing at home often lays the foundations of their attitudes even when they get to school. For instance, in response to an article posted online by Michelle Ainslie, a reader commented that:

'Children aren't reading because parents aren't reading. I see it in all my friends' homes. If the parents read books for fun and relaxation, the children do too. If the parents, even ones who grew up with books, watch TV and surf the net, the children do too. Monkey see, monkey do.' (www.parent24.com, 2011).

Similarly, Machado (2015:434) buttressed this point by stating that everything that parents and family members do, which involves books with their children, often has a positive outcome on the child's development.

It has therefore created a situation where children generally struggle with reading and equally with writing, despite the best efforts of class teachers. Outside of the school, there is even less motivation to get involved in reading anything because learners are surrounded by people (family members, friends, neighbours) who have almost no interest in reading – as highlighted in the response to Ainslie's post above.

Altogether, reading seems to be facing a concerted assault from all aspects of society, which demand a study of this nature to determine the level(s) of this attack.

#### Aims and Objectives

To effectively contribute to the available body of literature on reading attitudes, this study will assess the rate or amount of decline in reading, with special focus on the classroom and learners. The study was therefore undertaken with the following objectives in mind:

- To determine if educators have any real impact on the reading abilities of learners in South Africa;
- To determine the level of decline in reading culture among learners; and
- To measure the level of success or failure of interventions by educators to improving learners' reading skills.

#### **Research Questions**

The following research questions were addressed to achieve the objectives of the study:

- Are learners improving their reading skills based on specific methods used by educators?
- How serious is the problem of decline in reading among South African students?
- Do current teaching methods in South African schools constitute a hinderance to a better reading culture?
- Are educators aware of declining reading levels among learners?
- Are educators applying imaginative methods to addressing the problem of declining reading levels among learners?

#### Significance of the Study

This study will contribute to assisting policy-makers, especially the Departments of Basic Education and Higher Education, to implement policies and interventions that will help arrest the slide in reading standards among learners and students, who are all potential employees and employees in the larger labour market.
A reading culture can be introduced to children only by parents and family members; then entrenched in children as learners at school, before it can spread to the larger society. It is imperative, therefore, that the findings and conclusions of such a study can contribute fresh ideas and approaches to changing attitudes towards reading – which impact on almost all aspects of human life.

# **Literature Review**

The researcher came across the term *readicide* in Gallagher (2009:vii) entitled *Readicide: How schools are killing reading and what you can do about it.* Gallagher, who boasts a 22year-long career as a class teacher in California, USA, emphatically describes the term as 'the systematic killing of the love of reading ... by inane, mind-numbing practices found in schools'. His background as a class teacher is put to good use as his findings reveal that many reading activities that take place in the classroom actually contribute to the death of reading, rather than the enhancement of it.

Before focusing on the classroom, however, it is necessary to point out that the external environment outside of it is becoming increasingly hostile to reading. Lauristin and Vihalemm (2014:14) seemingly hit the nail on the head by asserting that 'Reading ... has been challenged by powerful audiovisual media'. They added that the long-held position of books as a cultural medium and source of knowledge is now being fiercely questioned by tools such as the internet.

This trend is better understood against the backdrop of the role that reading plays in our lives. In other words, it is necessary to realise how important reading is to feel any sense of alarm at what is seen as its decline. Thus, a study carried out by West and Chew (2014:14) for the UNESCO (United Nations Educational, Scientific and Cultural Organisation) attempts to paint a clear picture of exactly where reading stands in the human scale of preferences. Accordingly, it declares that: 'Study after study has shown that ... people who read often become better readers, and better reading leads to success in school and other areas of life. Conversely, people who do not read fail to acquire habits of literacy which can lead to problems cultivating new skills and difficulties that transcend education' (West & Chew, 2014:14).

Such a strong assertion, which is based on 'study after study' clearly establishes the place of reading in people's lives. This confirms the earlier point that peradventure the decline in reading ought to be a valid source of worry to all and sundry.

In buttress West and Chew's study, a separate report (2002:17) commissioned by the Organisation for Economic Cooperation and Development (OECD) among European countries concluded that 'In our highly-literate societies, reading is a pre-requisite for success in life. But not just reading. Literacy skills apply to learning, working and living'.

Another report from a discussion paper based on a Statistics Canada (2011) study supports this viewpoint by adding that 'the level of reading literacy or ability has a direct effect on pre-tax income, employment, health, and on participation in continued education among students'. The report also showed that people with lower levels of reading ability are more likely to depend on public assistance and government welfare and also tend to be involved in crime. This element of necessity attached to reading as a vital aspect of human existence was even taken to the extreme by Jennings (1965:4), who declared emphatically that the 'non-reader can only survive in a mental home'.

Coming closer to South Africa, the declining trend of reading appears even weightier than in other parts of the world. The table below illustrates where Africa (and South Africa by default) stands in the bigger picture of the declining reading trend.

# Table 1: Top 20 Countries with Highest Reading Habits (NOP World Culture ScoreIndex, 2005)

| Country           | Average reading hours per |  |  |
|-------------------|---------------------------|--|--|
|                   | week                      |  |  |
| 1. India          | 10.42 hours               |  |  |
| 2. Thailand       | 9.24 hours                |  |  |
| 3. China          | 8.00 hours                |  |  |
| 4. Philippines    | 7.36 hours                |  |  |
| 5. Egypt          | 7.30 hours                |  |  |
| 6. Czech Republic | 7.24 hours                |  |  |

| 7. Russia        | 7.06 hours |
|------------------|------------|
| 8. Sweden        | 6.54 hours |
| 9. France        | 6.54 hours |
| 10. Hungary      | 6.48 hours |
| 11. Saudi Arabia | 6.48 hours |
| 12. Hong Kong    | 6.42 hours |
| 13. Poland       | 6.30 hours |
| 14. Venezuela    | 6.24 hours |
| 15. South Africa | 6.18 hours |
| 16. Australia    | 6.18 hours |
| 17. Indonesia    | 6.00 hours |
| 18 Argentina     | 5.54 hours |
| 19. Turkey       | 5.54 hours |
| 20. Spain        | 5.48 hours |

The table clearly reveals where Africa (albeit South Africa) stands in the hierarchy of reading nations. It also shows that South Africa occupies the fifteenth position. Although this is commendable considering that South Africa ranks ahead of the likes of the USA, Canada and the United Kingdom, South Africans still spend four hours per week less on reading compared to India. Even the leading African 'reader-friendly' country Egypt still spends three hours per week on average less than India. Another important point to highlight from the table above is that the reading figures were obtained from a cross-section of each country's society and not among students or learners alone. NOP further revealed that the results were obtained from people aged 13 years and older, from 30 countries around the world. The results therefore help to demonstrate the existence of a reading culture when people can devote at least four hours weekly to reading any written material.

So why is South Africa not higher up on this list? To understand the underlying reasons plaguing South African students today and to get a perspective of why their reading skills are so poor, it might be important to examine their collective background and early learning history.

On his blog *Gautango: It takes Two*, Bob (sic) wrote a piece entitled *What Is Wrong with South African Schools?* and identified the most important reason behind South Africa's poor reading culture as language.

He noted that:

'The ability to read English, which is South Africa's primary language of education and trade, is crucial for success at school (and beyond). Yet in my experience working at two private schools in Soweto, I ... discovered that learners are not being prepared to succeed in reading. The average Grade 2 learner cannot name the letters or their sounds, and most of the Grade 3 learners cannot read English at a Grade 1 level.' (www.gautango.wordpress.com, 2007)

Bob crucially noted that because learners are taught in their home languages during the first two years of schooling, it becomes a herculean task to expect them to adapt to English, which they almost never speak at home in the subsequent years of school. He then asks rhetorically, why the need to spend time teaching a child to read isiZulu – for instance – when he would soon be asked to read English in a matter of months?

Indeed, English language (in which all the samples used in this study were written) may not be the home language of choice for the majority of South Africans. In fact, based on the 2011 census figures, only 9.6% of South Africans claim English as their home language (Johnston, 2014:34). Despite this lop-sidedness, English remains a major language in official and government circles and is also a 'major asset' (Johnston, 2014:34) in the labour market in this country.

The ability to read, understand and write English language therefore supersedes the ability to read and write in South Africa's other eleven official languages. The widespread problem of how tedious it is to write in English therefore can be traced back to a poor reading culture, which may indeed have its roots in the classroom, but clearly extends beyond it into all aspects of South African life. Similarly, other problems such as poor infrastructures and ill-equipped school libraries are affecting the ability of learners in South Africa to adequately understand and read properly at the beginning of their early education. Accordingly, a piece by Roomtoread, a global organisation devoted to improving literacy and educational standards in developing countries, paints a clear picture of what is really happening in our schools:

'Orlando High School in Soweto is the state-run school that many of the students who participated in the 1976 Soweto riots attended. In 2006, 30 years after the uprising, the educational situation continues to be devastating.' (www.roomtoread.org, 2005)

It goes on to describe how only one teacher is available to teach 900 students all three sciences offered. Equally, it outlines how a computer lab sits empty with no computers; the school library has books, but are neither up-to-date nor relevant. This is apparently repeated across the length-and-breadth of the country, because among all the government-owned high schools in South Africa, 80% of them have no library.

Furthermore, the organisation reveals that as at 2005, the pass rate at high schools for the national exams was less than 50% for three of the last five years. Among white learners, over 20.65% have completed high school. In the same age group for black learners, only 14% start and complete high school.

Attitude also remains a valid reason behind learner apathy towards schooling in general and reading in particular. A national survey of schools across the country in 2005 by the Human Sciences Research Council (HSRC) revealed very high levels of teacher late-coming and absenteeism – especially in public schools. All in all, the survey found that:

- Teachers work an average of only 41 hours weekly, despite a requirement of a minimum of 43 hours by the Department of Basic Education;
- Fourteen per cent (14%) of school time is spent on writing reports, assessments, record-keeping and evaluation;
- Another 14% is spent by teachers on planning and attending meetings;

• Only about 3.5 hours are spent on actual teaching in class daily. (www.hsrc.ac.za, 2005:44)

Additionally, the study revealed that inadequate (and even no) attention is paid by teachers to writing, based on an analysis of learner workbooks. It was found that the majority of Grade 3 language classes learners engage in writing exercises only once a week. Even when that happens, most of the writing consists of exercises made up of isolated words; sentences are hardly seen, while longer passages rarely exist.

## An Overview of South Africa's Declining Standard of Education

Education is mentioned earlier in this study simply as the ability to read and write. To expatiate further on its meaning, Taneja (1990:4) elaborates by insisting that education is not 'merely ... the acquisition of knowledge or experience, but it means the development of habits, attitudes and skills which help a man to lead a full and worthwhile life'. There is little doubt that some of the vital tools required to attain education at all levels remain the ability to read and write.

When educational standards begin to drop, it must equally translate to the fact that reading and writing abilities are falling. A clear indication of these declining standards of education in South Africa was highlighted by Mlatsheni (2005:49-54), who noted that there are fewer matriculating students in the country who are passing with exemption – a requirement to South African university admission. Of the few number of matriculants who do pass, according to him, 82% of them are 'functionally illiterate' because they do not possess adequate literacy and communicational skills such as reading, writing and solving mathematical problems.

Mlatsheni adds that the situation eventually leads to high dropout rates from universities because many students are not prepared for success at higher educational level. Daniels (2007:55-71) cited further that 30% of first year students in South Africa's universities drop out; a little over 20% drop out in their second and third years, and of the remaining 50% less than half (i.e. 25%) fail to graduate within the required timeframe for their courses.

Van der Berg (2005:56) describes the situation in South Africa's schooling system as a crisis. This, according to him, is because 'primary school reading and mathematics abilities are an ominous predictor of later performance' by learners. He stressed further – using detailed and extensive data obtained from Grade 6 learners in the country – that schools in the country are located and arranged according to the mean socio-economic status of learners. Van der Berg (2005:56) concluded that '80% of South African schools fail to transform learners' future chances and in fact hold back middle-income children from expected levels of performance'.

In retrospect, Mlatsheni (2005:49) further revealed that the problems of poor performance of students at tertiary level often originate at an early stage of education. He used the Western Cape as an example, where he noted that only 32% of Grade 3 learners can read at the level set in the national curriculum. The implication, according to him, is that children are forever 'trapped in catch-up mode for most or all of their schooling' life.

## **Research Methodology and Procedures**

## Methodology

Research methodology is a systematic way of solving a problem. It is the science of studying how research is conducted. Essentially, the procedures by which researchers go about their work of describing, explaining and predicting phenomena are called the research methodology (Rajasekar et al., 2006). This process is used in collecting information and data for the purpose of making business decisions. A qualitative approach was adopted in this research. Since the study was concerned with measuring people's attitudes and everyday behaviour, Silverman (2009:10) helped explain that qualitative methods are best utilised if a researcher is concerned with exploring people's life histories or everyday behaviour.

This section provides a general outlook of the research design and the type of methodology used. The study therefore attempted to answer the following research question: Is the decline in reading standards in South African schools an ordinary trend, a crisis or the death knell for reading?

Three methods were used to collect data, namely: direct observation of classroom behaviour and activities of students, an analysis of students' writing during class activities and assessments as well as random examples of writing errors in the public domain, which are evidence of a poor reading culture.

## Sample Frame and Profile

Sampling is the selection of a part (a sample) from an entire population to make inferences or draw specific conclusions about the whole. In this case, a particular group of students were sampled to help draw conclusions on the general populace of South African students.

To better understand sampling, the researcher wishes to explain that its main purpose is to reduce the time, effort and resources that would have been spent if the entire population were studied. At the same time, sampling still helps to obtain data that are accurate representations of the whole population.

The success of sampling therefore lies in its accuracy in reflecting the state of affairs in the population (Forcece & Richer, 1973:121-122). Likewise, a sampling frame is a specific list that closely approximates all the elements (people) in the population. This list is often developed by the researcher, based on the type of data they are seeking from the population.

A good sampling frame, according to Neuman (2000:201), is vital to good and effective sampling. The sampling frame for this study is drawn from tertiary school students. The researcher chose tertiary students due to the expectation that their level of reading and writing should be of a high standard, and the fact that they must have been exposed to basic reading, comprehension and writing from their primary and high school learning years.

## **Research Findings and Data Analysis**

## Samples of Errors in School Assessments

For the purpose of this study, the researcher conducted an analysis of randomly selected samples of assessments written by students from three tertiary institutions. The institutions are well known in South Africa and have campuses in all the major cities of the country.

The three institutions are leaders in providing tertiary education to thousands of students across the country annually. In the process, they award certificates, diplomas and degrees to these students.

Students from such renowned institutions are therefore expected to be up-to-standard, polished and well tutored to project the benefits of a sound education. The following samples of written assessments will greatly help to prove or disprove the above assertions and help to cast more light on the reading and writing abilities of the average South African student. Emphasis in these samples will be on the words, phrases and punctuation marks that appear in bold letters.

## **Ethical Clearance**

Samples 1–6, which are copies of students' assessments, were obtained directly from the tertiary institutions concerned. The assessments were all written in 2011 and, according to the institutions' policies, they could keep these scripts for only five (5) years, after which they were obliged to destroy or discard them.

However, Samples 7–9 (all written in 2017) were obtained from the students who wrote the assessments themselves. The samples were their personal copies which had been marked and returned to them; they were willing to provide them as part of this study.

It was important to make use of such samples spread over a range of time to help show or indicate a pattern of reading habit(s) among students.



At the top of the page, the student started with: 'Entrepreneur is **a** someone ...'. In line 3, the student wrote: '**Or** someone starting a business'. A grammatically correct sentence should not start with a conjunction, in this case 'or'. Under item VI, line 2, the student wrote 'Measures **changes** ...'. In line 5, the student wrote '... used as a **masure** of inflation'. Clearly, all these phrases contain grammatical and spelling errors.



In line 12, the student wrote: 'It's a creation for jobs'. The sentence is grammatically incorrect because the pronoun 'it' is disconnected from whatever the writer was saying in the previous sentence. Also, the phrase '... a **creation for** jobs' has no logical meaning. Similarly, in line 15, the student wrote: 'Goods are distributed in the same way **man** and **women do** what **they** fathers and mothers **use** to do.' The words 'man' and 'women' show inconsistency in the use of singular and plural words, while the words 'do' and 'use' ought to be in the past tense. Also, the use of the word 'they' is the wrong pronoun.

| IV Why the product is produced?          |
|--|
| - is produced For who . T                |
| - where the product is need &            |
| _  |
|  |
|  |
|  |
| V. producer / Meinketh                   |
| - Household I                            |
| - Gorvenment r                           |
|  |
|  |
| VI. Consumer price index are Prices that |
| the market Charge car Consumer per       |
| a certe: geods ad services.              |

In lines 1 and 2 of Sample 3, both statements are apparently questions, but there are no question marks at the end of each line. In line 2, the student wrote: **'is** produced for who'. There are two problems here: the word 'is' starts a sentence in small letters, while it does not qualify anything. The writer cannot show what the word 'is' refers to.

| Question 3.   |
|---|
| 3.1. * Contract casting<br>- The application of job cristing to relative<br>cost limits, particularly units that take a<br>considerable length of time to complete<br>and are constructed away from the entreprises |
| Premisci  |
| * Batch casting   |
| - When a job cosists of a number of indentical<br>Hems and they are costed as such, they total  |
| cast the completed batch is averaged over a<br>number of components.  |

In line 11, the student wrote: 'When a job **cosists** of a number of **indentical** items ...' In this instance, the two errors are simple spelling mistakes.

# Sample 5

that 1 gover < tates abour 11 ore He marke produce taxa 700 produce tree that ce. 190 the. ma entrepreneur Ships Ke are Certain taxe ke+ ma the that 10 1+ allou People are d Finglis Dec at be the 10 tate here The nt 700 the Jec they VUIR 11 Cheesa Cio 1+ who 10en 1 the the they market 15 Par 1-+6 Ule the cire perfre. and eque 3.11

In Sample 5, the student wrote in line 1: 'Labour **are** state/**goverment** that taxes the market on goods and services that they produce **on**'. Firstly, the subject-verb agreement is incorrect. Also, 'government' is wrongly spelled and the sentence ends with the word 'on', which has no place in the sentence. It would be perfect for the sentence to end with 'produce'. In line 5, the student wrote: '**entrepreneurships** are certain market that **taxe a** certain goods and services ...'. This student wrongly starts a sentence with small letters; they then spelled 'taxes' incorrectly without the letter 's' at the end of the word. Furthermore, the student describes 'goods and services' with and indefinite article.

In line 10, the student wrote: 'Decision **are** not being finalized ...' If they had written 'decision' as singular, it ought to be followed by the word 'is' and not 'are'. Still on this sample, in line 12, **'g'vernment'** was wrongly-spelt. Then the word '**does'nt'** showed a misapplication of an apostrophe meant to show a contraction. The apostrophe ought to appear between the letters 'n' and 't' because the word being contracted is 'not'. In continuation of the same sentence, the student wrote: '... certain decision they don't **rule**'. One can only assume that the student meant to use the word 'make', which conveys a greater meaning than 'rule'.

#### Sample 6

la

In line 2, the student wrote 'The **manufacture need** human labour in order to carry out the productions and activities in the factory, this labour force will be from the household and also **its** from the demand of employment'. In this case, the student probably meant to say 'manufacturer' and, in that case, the accompanying verb should be 'needs' and not 'need'. Moving along that sentence, there is a comma between the words 'factory' and 'this'. The comma should have been a full stop, after which a new sentence should start as it currently constitutes the error referred to as a comma splice. Lastly, the use of the word 'its' makes no logical sense.

## Sample 7

o make regotigions Grende time allango Machines ome with Stratepier OFINOUK

In Sample 7, line 5 shows that the student wrote: 'To do **job the work** as fast as possible ...' Clearly, this statement is constructed poorly and carries no meaning.

Question 2 telivery casting 2.1. - It increase accuracy 10 dates His very useful (Ostin) development of The H make fad equitable payment tive mis-uses man power revent It helps in each department study man to choosmethod 1+ hela best Study Time motion ustem time Analytical estimating element Synthesis from tata.

In Sample 8, the student wrote in line 3: 'It **increase** accuracy in **fare casting** delivery dates'. The use of 'increase' is grammatically incorrect. Rather, the student ought to have written 'increases'. It can be assumed here that the student meant to write forecasting instead of 'fare casting', which is not a word.

In line 6, the student wrote: 'It **make** fast the development of equitable **insective** payment system.' The mistake with the word 'make' is that it cannot be qualified with an adverb like 'fast' and retain its original format. Instead, it has to change to 'makes'. In the same sentence, the use of the word 'insective' does not convey any meaning in the context of this sentence. The word is out of place in the sentence.

| OLUESTION OF                 |  |
|------------------------------|--|
|                              |  |
| 4.1 Applex summery of maying |  |
| - She meetion topole         |  |
| - finencial Anewsis          |  |
| - Supplier & quotation       |  |
| - Method Statement           |  |

In this example, the student wrote in line 4: 'Site **impection** report'. They meant to write the word 'inspection', but once again the inability to spell simple words correctly has distorted the sentence. In line 6, the student wrote: '**Suppliers** quotation' without any apostrophe to indicate that the quotation belongs to the supplier.

#### Samples of Reading and Writing Errors Outside the Classroom

In line with the earlier findings by the OECD regarding how reading ability or the lack thereof affects working and living standards of people outside the classroom and in later life, some practical examples of such are given next.

The researcher has compiled an album of signages which announce places and businesses, but contain glaring mistakes in spelling. However, the owners (or writers) of such signage, which are all confidently displayed in public, failed to notice the mistakes carried by the signages. These glaring errors are the result of poor reading abilities on a wide scale, which made it impossible for the owners (or writers) of such signage to notice their mistakes. The need for such samples obtained from outside the classroom is to highlight the fact that poor reading skills, which were hitherto undeveloped and unattended to in the classroom, could eventually hinder reading ability in future life and outside the classroom.



Figure 1: Signage displaying a wrongly spelled street name

The signage in Figure 1 was found above a store in central Johannesburg. The owners (writers) of the signage spelled the street name incorrectly. Rather than Harrison Street, they incorrectly wrote '**Harrisson**'. Of course, neither the owners of the store nor the writer of the signage noticed their glaring mistake.

## Figure 2: Building Name Improperly Spelled



This large, public building is located in the heart of Johannesburg, specifically in the highbrow, student-dominated suburb of Braamfontein. However, the building's name has been wrongly described as '**Arbour**' instead of 'Harbour', which is its proper name.



# Figure 3: Shop Signage Advertising Clothing Items

This particular signage was found in downtown Johannesburg. The shop obviously sells clothes and footwear based on the information on the signage. However, the owners' (or writer's) attempt of the signage which describes the items they sell contains the strange word **'takeys'.** One can only assume they meant to write the word 'takkies' used to describe the casual, sporty footwear.



## Figure 4: Shop Signage Advertising Computers

Many will recognise the name of this well-known computer supplies company. However, their signage – which was found at a busy intersection – does little justice to their name and reputation because of a small but significant spelling mistake. It is assumed that they meant to say 'Try Our New ...', which makes logical sense, rather than the 'Try **Out** New ...' which appears on the signage.

## Figure 5: Bible College Signage



This final signage belongs to a Bible college, which is stylishly called a university by its owners. However, their sense of style clearly does not extend to proper spelling because the word **'Anoited'** does not exist. 'Anointed' is an existing word and it can once more be assumed that it is the latter word which the owners (or writers) of the signage meant to use.

## Data (Sample) Analysis

All the above samples represent very obvious spelling and grammatical errors which have sadly become a common feature in our society. The worrying aspect of these poorly written assessments and signages is the fact that the students or writers do not see the mistakes therein, which is why the students submitted the work in this condition. It is also why the signages remained on display so publicly.

Accordingly, based on all the nine writing samples from the classroom used in this study, the ability of South African students to understand and apply basic grammatical rules such as punctuation, spelling and use of parts of speech is indeed low. All nine tertiary students' writing samples were analysed accordingly as seen in Table 2.

| Samples  | Spelling | Sentence     | Tenses | Parts of | Punctuation |
|----------|----------|--------------|--------|----------|-------------|
|          |          | Construction |        | Speech   |             |
| Sample 1 | 1        | 1            | -      | 2        | -           |
| Sample 2 | -        | 2            | 1      | -        | -           |
| Sample 3 | -        | 1            | -      | -        | 2           |
| Sample 4 | 2        | -            | 1      | -        | -           |
| Sample 5 | 3        | 1            | -      | 1        | 1           |
| Sample 6 | 1        | 1            | 1      | -        | 1           |
| Sample 7 | -        | 1            | -      | -        | -           |
| Sample 8 | 1        | -            | -      | 3        | -           |
| Sample 9 | 1        | -            | -      | -        | 1           |
| Total    | 9        | 6            | 3      | 6        | 5           |

# Table 2: Analysis of Students' Samples Error Count (numbers)

# Table 3: Analysis of Students' Samples Error Count (Percentages)

| Indices               | Percentage (%) |
|-----------------------|----------------|
| Spelling              | 100%           |
| Sentence Construction | 66.6%          |
| Tenses                | 33.3%          |
| Parts of Speech       | 66.6%          |
| Punctuation           | 55.5%          |

## Conclusions

At this stage of the study, a definite conclusion cannot be reached as to whether the decline in reading – or readicide – is a mere trend that would eventually fade away, a crisis or a finality that will sound the death knell of the simple act of turning over the pages of books. The inconclusivity is based on the small number of samples used for the study as well as the fact that the student assessments used were limited to only tertiary institutions – in actual fact, only three of them.

A more large-scale study would likely arrive at a different conclusion based on the findings it would reach. Nonetheless, it still does not dismiss the assertion that a crisis of reading exists in South African schools – albeit in tertiary schools.

From the samples of student assessments, it is clear that writing correctly is an issue. Writing naturally stems from reading. When people fail to read regularly, writing becomes tedious and difficult. Troia (2011:115) makes reference to this strong connection by stating that 'students who are good at particular reading skills tend to be good at ... writing skills'. Based on such a premise, the numerous mistakes identified in all the samples indicate a poor reading culture among both students and members of society. The fact that all the writers (i.e. 100% of the samples and pictures) could not see their own writing mistakes clearly proves that they either cannot identify such mistakes or simply do not know what is right and wrong when writing.

In the case of the students, it is even more alarming. Students naturally re-read their assignments, tests and examination scripts after writing and before submitting. When students still cannot identify and correct their own mistakes despite re-reading their scripts, it illustrates the depth of the poor reading culture existent in our tertiary schools.

## Findings

The following findings were thus deduced from the analysis of data obtained for the purpose of this study:

- All sampled students (100%) struggled with spelling;
- Almost two-thirds (66.6%) of students in three of the biggest tertiary institutions in South Africa cannot construct a correct sentence;
- A little more than two-thirds (66.7%) of students in three of the biggest tertiary institutions in the country are able to use tenses (e.g. past tense, present tense, future tense) correctly;
- Only about one-third (33.3%) of students in three of the biggest tertiary institutions in the country struggle to use correct tenses when writing;
- Nearly two-thirds (66.6%) of students from three of the biggest tertiary institutions in South Africa do not know how to write using proper parts of speech (e.g. nouns, pronouns, verbs, conjunctions);
- Over half (55.5%) of students in three of the biggest tertiary institutions in the country cannot use punctuation properly; and
- The obvious fact that the lecturers actually marked many of the errors correct (as seen from Samples 1–9) clearly indicates that the educators are failing to apply proper interventions to counter the decline in reading, or even failing to properly read themselves.

It is thus the conclusion of this study that the decline in reading – which has a direct link to writing ability (Troia, 2011:115) – in South African tertiary schools and among students has reached crisis proportions.

# Recommendations

The researcher – a lecturer in humanities modules – always asks students to devote at least the first 10 to 15 minutes of every class session to reading. Prior to every session, the researcher prepares passages or essays for them to read and understand, after which the group handles grammatical and structural issues identified from the passages. This aspect of the class sessions is not popular among the students but despite their negative body language and reluctance, it has helped to improve results in both their reading and understanding abilities, as well as their performances at the end of semester exams.

The researcher considers the classroom to be the place of ultimate learning, where young minds come in contact with knowledge in a regular and formal shape. The researcher always insists that students spend an allotted time of the day reading. It might be only 10 to 15 minutes, but when those minutes are added together every day of the week, it amounts to a lot of time spent on reading.

Subject manuals that students are given at the start of every semester are not properly read either. In an attempt to get to the root of why students fail, the researcher asked several of them to give him the reasons to why they performed poorly in previous exams. The reasons ranged from the difficulty of the subjects, difficulty in understanding the manual, lateness to classes, unattractiveness of the manuals, and lack of pictures in the manuals.

Further to asking them to read passages, the researcher equally rewrites the pages they have read and then deliberately includes spelling and tenses mistakes, which the class then together attempt to correct on the whiteboard. This is a deliberate attempt to draw their attention to common mistakes that arise in writing, which can be easily spotted after the students have completed reading the same passage.

From the researcher's observation, the students always find it much easier to spot mistakes in a passage they have previously read than in one they were seeing for the very first time. As simple as this approach seems, it greatly improves their ability to understand. Although the actual reading may be boring to them, they always participate actively in the identification and correction of mistakes.

Very often, this approach results in the students themselves asking for these exercises towards the end of every class session because of their sudden discovery of an inherent ability to spot mistakes and correct them. This ability – which they had all along – was utilised and put to use only after they had been made to read by the lecturer.

## Final Word

I never tire of telling my students that Business Communication – one of the modules I teach – is simply about writing. You need words to write and you cannot develop your vocabulary (or what I call word bank) without actually turning the pages of books and reading those tiny 'boring looking' letters written in black print.

My observation after many years of being involved with students, learning and teaching is that when students do not read, their vocabulary or word bank cannot improve. Inevitably, they will always struggle to answer questions and therefore fail exams. As long as reading and writing remain the two basic requirements to getting education, a deficiency in one or both of them will always affect the quality of students produced by our educational system.

Reading will surely not cease as an activity in our society. Therefore, readicide will not come full circle and bring reading to an end – as long as there remains a desire among people to get education for themselves and their children. However, the decline of reading remains a reality among us, as seen in the data and evidence presented herein. With more electronic gadgets flooding the shop shelves and holding today's young generation spellbound, the battle to rediscovering the art of reading is one that is being made harder – but one that we cannot afford to lose.

The simple act of turning the pages of books still remains the simple, straight-forward formula to avoiding readicide.

## List of References

Ainslie, M. s.a. Changes in the classroom have affected the basics: a psychologist examines what and why. http://www.parent24.com/comments. Date of access: 20 July 2017.

Barnett, R. & Coate, K. 2005. Engaging the curriculum in higher education. Maidenhead, UK: Open University Press.

Bob (sic). 2007. What is wrong with South African schools? Gautango: It takes two, 11 February. <u>https://gautango.wordpress.com/2007/02/11/whats-wrong-with-south-african-schools/ Date of access: 24</u> September 2017.

Cain, K. 2010. Reading development and difficulties. Sussex: Wiley.

Daniels, R.C. 2007. Skills shortages in South Africa: a literature review. Cape Town: University of Cape Town. Development Policy Research Unit.

Darity, W. & Goldsmith A.H. 1993. Unemployment, social psychology, and unemployment hysteresis. *Journal of post Keynesian economics*, 16(1):55-71.

Dilworth, D. 2014. Which countries spend the most time reading? NOP World Culture Score Index.

Forcece, D. & Richer, S. 1978. Social research methods. Englewood Cliffs, N.J.: Prentice Hall.

Gallagher, K. 2009. Readicide: how schools are killing reading and what you can do about it. Portland, Me.: Stenhouse Publishers.

Jennings, F. 1965. This is reading. New York: Columbia University. Bureau of Publications.

Johnston, A. 2014. South Africa: inventing the nation. London: Bloomsbury Publishing.

Kirsch, I., De Jong, J., LaFontaine, D., McQueen, J., Mendelovits, J. & Monseur, C. 2002. Reading for change: performance and engagement across countries: results from PISA 2000. Paris, France: Organisation for Economic Cooperation and Development (OECD).

Kraak, A. 2005. Education, science and skills development. http://www.hsrc.ac.za/uploads/ pageContent/3741/AnnRep0506/. Date of access: 23 September 2017.

Lauristin, M. & Vihalemm, P. 2014. Reading in changing society. Tartu: University of Tartu Press. (Studies in reading and book culture, v.2.)

Machado, J. 2015. Early childhood experiences in language arts: early literacy. Boston, Mass.: Wadsworth Cengage Learning.

McGuiness, D. 1999. Why our children can't read and what we can do about it: a scientific revolution in reading. New York: Free Press.

Mlatsheni, C. 2005. The youth labour market: what does it take to succeed? (Mimeo.)

Neuman, W.L. 2000. Social research methods: qualitative and quantitative approaches. 4th ed. Boston, Mass.: Allyn and Bacon.

Rajasekar, S., Philominathan, P. & Chinnathambi, V. 2006. Research methodology. Ithaca, N.Y.: Cornell University.

Silverman, D. 2009. Doing qualitative research. Thousand Oaks, Calif.: Sage.

Stanovich, K. 2000. Progress in understanding reading: scientific foundations and new frontiers. New York: Guildford Press.

Statistics Canada. s.a. National Forum on Literacy and Poverty. (Discussion paper.) http://www.statcan.gc.ca/pub/. Date of access: 23 September, 2017.

Taneja, V. 1990. Educational thought and practice. New Delhi: Sterling Publishers.

Taylor, N. 2009. South African education: what's wrong and how to fix it. Pretoria: Higher Education South Africa.

Troia, G., *ed.* 2011. Instruction and assessment for struggling writers: evidence-based practices. New York: Guildford Press.

Van der Berg, S. 2005. Education. (*In* Brown, S., *ed*. Conflict and governance. African minds.)

West, M & Chew, H. 2014. Reading in the mobile era: a study of mobile reading in developing countries. Paris: UNESCO.

# MOTIVATING FACTORS OF PERMANENT EMPLOYEES AT A RETAIL ORGANISATION IN PIETERMARITZBURG

## Nereshnee Naidoo (Damelin: Pietermaritzburg)

Nereshnee.Naidoo@damelin.co.za

Retail is a fast-moving industry and a contributor in the country's economic growth (Ansley in Carr, 2005). According to Barnes (2005) retail organisations are responsible for 1.8% of the total employment in South Africa, of which most are women employees. Investigating the factors that motivate retail employees enables managers to come up with strategies that can foster job satisfaction. This study carried a non-probability, purposive sampling style of 34 permanent retail employees of a particular organisation. Data were analysed using SPSS 15 and the study showed that promotion, general factors and payment are the most influential factors that motivate the participants, while benefits, personal factors and work content are the least motivating factors.

Keywords: motivation, motivators, work satisfaction

#### Introduction

According to Chakravarti (2003), employees in retail organisations are important resources and play an equally important role in aiding customers in selecting products. Furthermore, the number of products a retail organisation sells will contribute to the overall success of such an organisation. Michie, Oughton and Bennion (2002) state, 'Greater motivation will have a direct effect in improving productivity.' Therefore, it is important to keep employees motivated and satisfied in their positions.

## **Problem Statement**

'Employees' motives, socio-economic background and value system could all interact with how employees perform their work and react to efforts to influence their performance' (Carr, 2005). Therefore, it is pertinent that these three variables be considered when striving for performance in an organisation. Numerous factors influence the motivation of employees, such as benefits, promotion, work content, working conditions, etcetera (Carr, 2005). Currently, the retail organisation selected for this study does not have many benefits and the possibility of an early promotion is unlikely (Personal communication, 27 March 2011). The employees repeat their tasks on a daily basis, making the job very repetitive.

Retail organisations rely on customers to thrive. Employees are constantly interacting with customers of different backgrounds and personalities. However, Bent and Freathy (1997) state that retail employees are most demotivated by rude customers. The question one has to ask is, 'what are the motivating factors of permanent retail employees at a retail organisation in Pietermaritzburg if there are no growth opportunities for the employee, and as literature shows, customers play a major part in employees' demotivation?'

This study aims to uncover the motivating factors of permanent retail employees at a retail organisation in Pietermaritzburg. By distinguishing the underlying motivating factors, managers can come a step closer to understanding how they can ensure that employees are satisfied in the workplace. This can allow contributions to the performance outcomes of employees.

## **Research Objectives**

In order to achieve the overall purpose of this study, this study aims to:

- determine the most valued factors influencing the motivation of permanent retail employees in a local retail store situated in Pietermaritzburg; and to
- determine the least valued factors influencing the motivation of permanent retail employees in a local retail store situated in Pietermaritzburg.

## **Research Questions**

- What are the most valued factors influencing the motivation of permanent retail employees in a local retail store situated in Pietermaritzburg?
- What are the least valued factors influencing the motivation of permanent retail employees in a local retail store situated in Pietermaritzburg?

## Assumptions and Delimitation

This is a case study using permanent retail employees in a specific organisation in Pietermaritzburg. The sample was a non-probability purposive sample and the study was limited to the specific sample used in the study. The participants were permanent employees and did not include any casual workers or workers that had been outsourced from other services, such as security and cleaning services. The findings of the study cannot be generalised to other retail stores because the sample did not include a representative sample of the population. Furthermore, a generic limitation of case studies is that generalisation of results cannot occur.

## Literature Review

There are many different organisations that provide similar services and products. These organisations face various challenges in aiming for success. One of the challenges an organisation faces is the need to remain increasingly competitive against other organisations that offer similar services (Carr, 2005). One of the many ways an organisation can be competitive is through human capital. Here, I first demonstrate the link between human capital and the organisation and secondly, ways that can be used to influence human capitals behaviour. Theoretical information and empirical studies are explained and a critique of each study follows.

## The Congruence Model

The congruence model was devised by Nadler and Tushman (French & Bell, 1999). This model states that organisations have three aspects. The first aspect is input. An organisation's input encompasses three major factors, namely the environment, the resources and an organisation's history (French & Bell, 1999). The second aspect of an organisation is throughput. Throughput includes key factors of an organisation's strategy, namely the formal organisation, the informal arrangement of the organisation, the task of the organisation and the people belonging to the organisation (French & Bell, 1999). The last aspect of an organisation is the output. The output of an organisation includes the group performance and the individual performance in an organisation (French & Bell, 1999). It is evident from these aspects of an organisation that employees have a key role to play in each aspect. Therefore, employees are viewed as the vital competitive resources of an organisation, imployees are at the forefront.

Employees are responsible for sales and customer services. Customer satisfaction can play a role in an organisation's competitiveness. Due to the importance of the employees, a manager should consider ways that can facilitate the improvement of such resources to increase job satisfaction and therefore increase employee productivity in the process (Analoui, 2000; Arnolds & Boshoff, 2001; Ströh, cited in Carr, 2005). One of the many ways this can be done is by motivating employees (Griffin, cited in Wiley, 1995).

## Motivation

Studies on motivation and productivity have been done worldwide. Katzell and Thompson (2007) state that research on worker motivation has been a topic of concern recently due to the link to worker productivity. Perry and Potter (1982) state that there are three categories of motivational variables, namely individual characteristics, job characteristics and work environment characteristics. There are many different theories that aim to provide a description on how these categories contribute to one's motivation.

Individual characteristics refer to the characteristics that are inherent in an employee. These inherent characteristics that reside within an employee are believed to be the factors that contribute to one's motivation (Carr, 2005). Individual characteristics are also referred to as intrinsic factors. Intrinsic factors are defined as a behaviour that 'is evoked by the need of employees to feel competence and self-determination in dealing with their environment' (Lin, 2007). Theories that use the individual characteristics to explain motivation are McClelland's model and Maslow's hierarchy.

# McClelland's Model

McClelland's model depicts three categories for grouping individual characteristics, namely the need for achievement, the need for affiliation and the need for power (Carr, 2005). The need for achievement is the longing of an individual to exceed some expectation set out for them. It is the need to excel and be successful (Carr, 2005). The need for affiliation is the need for affectionate and close interpersonal relationship. Here the individual seeks acceptance from other co-workers (Carr, 2005). The need for power is the desire to influence others to act in a way they would not have acted without the influence. Here the individual aims to have control over the behaviour of others (Carr, 2005). Not

everyone has the same needs. By investigating which of the three needs are dominant in an employee, motivation techniques can be implemented. However, McClelland's model categorises individuals in three categories, but not everyone can be grouped accordingly. This model only includes one variable of motivation, namely individual characteristics. Humans are believed to be a product of external and internal factors.

# Maslow's Hierarchy of Needs

Maslow's hierarchy of needs consists of five needs that are either higher order needs or lower order needs. In order to reach self-actualisation, the highest of all needs, the other four needs have to be satisfied. The first of the lower order needs is physiological needs. Physiological needs include basic survival needs of a person, namely breathing, food, water, sex, sleep, homeostasis and excretion (Adevinka & Abdul-Rahman, 2013). The second lower order need is safety. Safety needs include security of body, of employment, of resources, of morality, of the family, of health and of property. The first of the higher order needs is social needs. Social needs include friendship, family and sexual intimacy (Adeyinka & Abdul-Rahman, 2013). The second of the higher order needs is esteem needs. Self-esteem includes confidence, achievement, respect of others and respect by others. Last of the higher order needs is self-actualisation. Self-actualisation includes morality, creativity, spontaneity, problem solving, and lack of prejudice and acceptance of facts (Adeyinka & Abdul-Rahman, 2013). However, like McClelland's model, only individual characteristics are catered for. This theory leaves out important factors when considering motivating techniques, as it does not cater for the other two variables identified by Perry and Potter (1982).

In order to understand the reason for finding a theory that includes all three variables, Bronfenbrenner's ecological systems theory is explained in the section that follows.

## **Bronfenbrenner's Ecological Systems Theory**

Bronfenbrenner's ecological systems theory states that human beings are holistic and are a product of interacting variables of a microsystem, mesosystem, ecosystem and microsystem (Paquette & Ryan, 2001). These systems are the different structures that make

up the environment and each system is nested in another system, with the individual at the core of the system.

The microsystem is the inner most layer. This system includes all the activities and interactions an individual has in the immediate surroundings (Shaffer & Kipp, 2007). The mesosystem is the second layer from the core of the system. The mesosystem includes the interactions among the individual's most immediate surroundings. Two examples of the mesosystem are for instance the school of the individual and the church group that the individual belongs to (Shaffer & Kipp, 2007). The third system is the exosystem. The exosystem contains the extended social system of an individual. This system is not directly linked to the individual, but nonetheless has an influence on the development of an individual. Two examples of this system are neighbours and mass media. The last system is the macrosystem. The microsystem is the global system in which development occurs. This includes laws and religious customs (Shaffer & Kipp, 2007).

Since humans are not only influenced by individual factors, but also by environmental factors, Herzberg's two-factor theory is the base theory for determining the motivators of permanent retail employees in a retail organisation in Pietermaritzburg.

# Herzberg's two-factor theory

A theory that also explains all of the characteristics of motivation is Herzberg's two-factor theory. This theory is unique as it incorporates elements of the job and work environments' characteristics, which are also known as extrinsic factors. Extrinsic factors are factors that are found outside of an individual. Herzberg believed that extrinsic factors are responsible for job dissatisfaction, while intrinsic factors are responsible for job satisfaction. Later, Herzberg conducted a study that led to the further development of the theory. The new development was the distinction between two sub-components of job satisfaction. These two sub-components are called motivation and hygiene.

According to Steyn (cited in Carr, 2005), motivation 'refers to this set of factors as the actual execution of the work' and according to Steyn (cited in Carr, 2005) and Swanepoel (cited in Carr, 2005), hygiene factors 'relates to the work environment.'

Herzberg researched the relationship between motivation and job satisfaction. In a study, Herzberg states that 'job satisfaction is a function of challenging, stimulating activities or Work Content' (Swanepoel, cited in Carr, 2005). In the study Herzberg 'concluded that all variables that make people feel either good or bad about their jobs can be grouped into one of two categories, hence, his theory being known as the two-factor theory of motivation' (Robbins, 1998; Spector, 2000; Swanepoel, cited in Carr, 2005). It is vital that job satisfaction and job dissatisfaction are properly understood. Herzberg states that the removal of hygiene factors does not necessary cause job satisfaction. In understanding motivators and hygiene factors, Herzberg categorises these factors (Carr, 2005).

Motivators have been identified as:

- achievement, 'which refers to the reach or attainment of a goal through effort, the successful accomplishment or completion of a task, the solving of a problem, the maintaining of a position and lastly, the visible results of a person's work' (Carr, 2005);
- recognition, which refers to recognising and acknowledging an individual's contributions to the organisation;
- responsibility, which involves delegating tasks to an individual and making the individual 'own' that task;
- advancement, which is the progression of an individual in the organisation.
- the work itself, which is the aspects surrounding the task of the job; and
- growth opportunities, which can be confused with advancement, but entails the upliftment of an individual. Growth refers to the skills, knowledge, experience and seniority of an individual.

The hygiene factors are as follows (Swanepoel, 1998 cited in Carr, 2005, p.30):

• Salary includes all 'financial rewards, such as the actual salary increase, performance increase etcetera.'

- Supervision includes 'all the skills and abilities of the supervisor to lead, to coach and to solve problems.'
- Relationship with supervisor 'refers to a good relationship with the supervisor resulting in continuous learning, willingness to listen to subordinate proposals, willingness to give credit and to defend an employee.'
- Relationship with colleagues refers to an enjoyable and encouraging relationship with co-workers. These characteristics are important as it aids in the development of a sense of fellowship and team spirit.
- Company policy and procedures 'include human resource policy, work organisation, production and other facilities, procedures and non-financial privileges.'
- Physical working conditions refer 'to the quality of work, availability of resources, and the environment in which the individual works.'
- Personal factors 'refer to long working hours and high stress which influences the individual's personal life resulting in negative feelings toward the job.'
- Status includes 'symbolism in the organisation, like position, title and office furniture.'
- Job security 'includes the factors that lead to a feeling of job security, for example, the survivability of the organisation, safety of a person's specific, job/position, medical aid and pension fund.'

Although Hertzberg believed that the removal of a hygiene factor did not mean job satisfaction was met, a recent study by Hoque et al. (2016) shows that hygiene factors can cause job satisfaction. The study showed that salary, working conditions, peer relations, participation in management, and social acceptance are important influences in work satisfaction. An important finding of the study is that is showed that salary and job satisfaction have a mutual relationship. As one increase, so does the other. However, Herzberg's two-factor theory is also open to criticism.

# Criticisms of Herzberg's two-factor theory

According to Mullins (cited in Carr, 2005), there are two common general criticisms of Herzberg's theory. The first criticism is that the research methodology is flawed, while the second criticism is that the sample population incorporated manual workers. In order to overcome these barriers, other studies are evaluated as well and the link between satisfaction and productivity is explained explicitly.

Schneider and Snyder (cited in Carr, 2005) define 'job satisfaction as a personal evaluation of conditions present in the job, or outcomes that arise as a result of having a job'.

Newstrom and Davis (cited in Carr, 2005) and Sorge and Warner (cited in Carr, 2005), state that of work satisfaction affects turnover, absenteeism and job performance. Huddleston and Good (cited in Carr, 2005) and Newstrom and Davis (cited in Carr, 2005) believe that if workers are not motivated, turnover will decrease. Workers will also become lazy and not carry out the tasks allocate to them, which will negatively affect productivity. This view is supported by various other studies, which found a relationship between job satisfaction and job performance (Khaleque, Hossain & Hoque, 1992, Babin & Boles, 1996, VanYperen & De Jong, 1997, Robbins, 1998 all cited in Louw, Meyer & Van Schalkwyk, 2000 cited in Carr, 2005, p. 40). As the link between job satisfaction and job performance has been established, the criticism of the sample characteristics can be evaluated. This is done by looking at earlier studies.

There have been numerous studies on motivation. A study that is closely linked to the sample population for the current study the research of Carr (2005). Carr (2005) researched motivation in retail managers. Although this was a different sample group, it was still in the same sector. The study involved the participants filling in a biographical questionnaire and the work motivation and job satisfaction questionnaire developed by De Beer (cited in Carr, 2005). The questionnaire contained the 16 factors established by Herzberg's two-factor theory. The study concluded that the sample is most likely to be motivated by factors relating to 'working conditions, personal and general sub-components and are least motivated by the remuneration they receive and Promotion opportunities' (Carr, 2005).
As suggested before, employees are the most vital part of an organisation. Employees make up most of the workforce in the organisation. The 16 factors identified by Herzberg are pertinent. Not many studies have been studies done on permanent retail employees or on different industries. More studies in the retail industry are done on managerial staff.

#### **Research Methodology**

#### **Research Design**

The research objectives of the study could best be met by the use of a quantitative design. There are three types of research designs, namely exploratory research, descriptive research and explanatory research. Exploratory research is used to gather information on 'relatively unknown areas of study' (Durrheim, cited in Terre Blanche et al., 2006). Descriptive research involves describing an occurrence, while explanatory research involves finding the 'causal explanation' for the occurrence (Durrheim, in Terre Blanche et al., 2006) for such occurrences.

The study used a descriptive approach as the design meets the objectives of the study to provide descriptions of the factors that motivate permanent retail employees at a retail organisation in Pietermaritzburg. The disadvantage of using a descriptive approach is that the explanation behind the phenomena cannot be given (Welman et al., 2005). However, future qualitative research can be conducted using the knowledge provided by this study to provide an explanation of the results. There are two types of descriptive designs, namely a cross-sectional study and a longitudinal study. This study is a cross-sectional study as the sample was only measured once to uncover the motivating factors. Disadvantages of using this type of design are that any relationships found between variables do not imply causality and that people 'change.' Therefore, the motivating factors can change over time. This also limits our understanding of possible effects an employee's lifestyle could have on the motivating factors, which a longitudinal study would be able to identify.

#### Sample

The study in question is a case study of a local retail organisation based in the central business district in Pietermaritzburg. The organisation employs 47 non-managerial staff

members. However, 34 employees were present on the day that the study was conducted. The sample consisted of 9 males and 25 females. The sampling method that was employed was a purposive sampling method as the study aimed to investigate motivating factors in permanent retail employees. Permanent employees were used as opposed to casual workers, because casual workers do not receive the same benefits as permanent employees and some casual workers are students that may not envision remaining in the organisation for a long period of time.

#### **Data Collection**

Data was collected by the means of a self-developed biographic questionnaire and work satisfaction and motivation questionnaire, which was developed by De Beer (cited in Carr, 2005). The biographic questionnaire includes participants' present designation, level of highest education, age, race, first language, gender, and tenure at the work place. Biographic information was important to determine if biographic details have any influence on employee motivation in the organisation. The work satisfaction and motivation questionnaire (De Beer, cited in Carr, 2005) is an item questionnaire that operationalises the concept of 'motivation'. The work satisfaction and motivation questionnaire (De Beer, cited in Carr, 2005) consists of nine sub-components, which are work content, payment, promotion, recognition, working conditions, benefits, personal factors and my leader/supervisor.

These sub-components probe responses to the following (De Beer cited in Ali & Ahmed, 2009):

- 'Work content' investigates participants' feelings regarding the type of work (17 items);
- 'Payment' investigates participants' satisfaction with their salaries (4 items);
- 'Promotion' investigates the prospect that the organisation offers for promotion (3 items);
- 'Recognition' investigates whether the participant was receiving the recognition and feedback for the jobs performed (4 items);

- 'Working conditions' investigates the opportunity for socialising at the organisation (3 items);
- 'Benefits' looked at whether the benefits offered by the organisation such as pension, medical schemes and leave were satisfactory (3 items);
- 'Personal' investigated participants' feelings towards their present designation (2 items);
- 'My leader/supervisor' investigated the level of satisfaction with the manager (4 items); and
- 'General' investigated if the participants considered alternative employment (3 items).

The respondent is given three possible responses to each question, which were 'True', 'Not Sure' and 'Untrue'. The respondent was required to circle the appropriate response.

According to De Beer (cited in Carr, 2005), the questionnaire is valid and has internal consistency. Internal consistency is measured by the Cronbach alpha (Tredoux & Durrheim, 2002). The Cronbach alpha reliability coefficients for the subsections of the work satisfaction and motivation questionnaire as reported by De Beer (cited in Carr, 2005) are as follows:

Work Content (= 0.78), Payment (= 0.86), Promotion (= 0.84), Recognition (= 0.90), Working Conditions (= 0.77), Benefits (= 0.84), My Leader/Supervisor (= 0.72), and

General (= 0.75).

This shows that the instrument is adequately reliable as it is above 0.70 (Finchilescu, cited in Tredoux & Durrheim, 2002).

The Cronbach alpha reliability coefficients for the current study are:

Work Content ( $\propto = 0.709$ ), Payment ( $\propto = 0.751$ ), Promotion ( $\propto = 0.769$ ), Recognition ( $\propto = 0.702$ ), Working Conditions ( $\propto = -0.09$ ), Personal ( $\propto = 0.619$ ), Benefits ( $\propto = 0.239$ ), My Leader/Supervisor ( $\propto = 0.711$ ), and General ( $\propto = 0.553$ ). The overall reliability coefficient for the sub-categories of the scale was reported as 0.775, while the reliability coefficient for the 43 items in the scale was found to be 0.879. This shows that the instrument is adequately reliable as it is above 0.70 (Finchilescu, cited in Tredoux & Durrheim, 2002). However, the working conditions, benefits and general sub-components are unreliable as the coefficients falls significantly below 0.70.

#### **Data Collection Process**

The researcher met with the manager of the retail organisation and the manager subsequently consented to the organisation's participation in the study. A suitable day for data collection was scheduled. On the day of the data collection, the employees were addressed before administering the questionnaires. First, the nature of the study was explained. Second, the employees were informed about the process of administering the questionnaires. Third, confidentiality and informed consent were explained. Employees were also told that the questionnaires do not require their names, so they would not be identified. This guaranteed anonymity. The employees were made aware that no person from the retail organisation would have access to their questionnaires. Employees were told that participation in the study is voluntary and the employees could opt out of the study at any point. Employees that wished to participate were given consent forms to sign and the questionnaires were handed out. The questionnaires were collected from employees upon completion.

#### Data Analysis

Statistical methods were used (Durrheim, cited in Terre Blanche et al., 2006) to analyse the data. The data were transferred to a spreadsheet using SPSS 15. The items on the work satisfaction and motivation questionnaire were scored 1, 2, or 3, where a score closer to 1 indicates satisfaction and a score closer to 3 indicates the least satisfaction.

As the sample population is small and violates the parametric assumptions, nonparametric tests were used. A descriptive analysis was used to determine which factors influencing motivation are most and least apparent. A Spearman's correlation was run to determine the relationship between the sub-components of work motivation and work content, payment,

promotion, recognition, working conditions, benefits, personal factors and supervision amongst permanent retail employees in a retail organisation.

#### **Ethical Considerations**

Two ethical issues were identified. The first involved the dual role of the researcher, while the second involved the dissemination of results. The researcher fulfilled a dual role as the researcher was a casual employee at the organisation where the study was carried out. There could have been some degree of conflict regarding the boundaries. In order to minimise this, the manager and the employees were made aware that the researcher was acting in the capacity of a researcher and not as an employee of the organisation.

Second, the work satisfaction and motivation questionnaire (De Beer, cited in Carr, 2005) contained questions requiring the opinions of the employees. An ethical dilemma arose on whether or not to disseminate the results of the study. The study results will be disseminated by means of a presentation and will be kept in the resource centre of the University of KwaZulu-Natal.

#### **Research Findings**

#### **Response Rate**

The retail organisation employs 47 permanent non-managerial employees. Of the 47 employees, 34 were present during administering of the questionnaires. All 34 employees completed the questionnaire, resulting in a 72% (34/47 X 100) response rate. Of the 72% received, all questionnaires were completed in full.

#### Demographics

In order for an accurate description of the sample to be obtained, the participants were asked to provide details pertaining to their present designation, their highest level of education, age, race, gender, first language, and number of years employed by the organisation. The demographics of the 34 participants are illustrated below by means of graphs and summary tables.

#### Figure 1: Participants' Present Designation



Figure 1 indicates that 79.4% (n=27) of the participants are store assistants, while 20.6% (n=7) of the participants are cashiers.





The level of education of the participants divided into 5.9 % (n=2) of the participants having a Grade 8–11 education, 82.4% (n=28) of the participants having a Grade 12 education, 8.8% (n=3) of participants having a diploma, and 2.9% (n=1) of the participants responding 'other.' However, those who responded 'other' failed to specify their other highest level of education. It could be below a Grade 8 education or above an honours degree as the options for this question ranged from a Grade 8 education to having obtained an honours degree.

### Figure 3: Participants' Age



The age of the participants ranged from 21 to 57 years. Most of the participants were in the range of 25–30 years of age (46.9%), with the average age of participants being 33.79 years.





Figure 4 indicates an equal representation of Indian and African participants (n=15), with each comprising 41.1% of the sample. The rest of the sample included 8.8% (n=3) who were Coloured, while 2.9% (n=1) was White.

### Figure 5: Participants' Gender



As depicted in Figure 5, the majority of the participants were females (73.5%; n=25), while 26.5% (n=9) were male participants.

#### Figure 6: Participants' First Language



English is the first language for the majority of the participants, comprising 55.9% (n=19) of the sample. isiZulu is the first language for 38.2% (n=13) of the participants, while 2.9 % (n=1) of the sample has Afrikaans as a first language. The last 2.9% of the sample indicated 'other' as a first language. 'Other' has been identified as Setswana.

#### Figure 7: Participants' Tenure



The tenure of the participants ranged from 1 year to 27 years. The majority of the participants, which made up 58.7% (n=20) of the organisation's employees, have been employed for no longer than 5.5 years, while 5.8% (n=2) of the organisation's employees have been employed for a longer period. The average for tenure is 8.32 years.

The above description provides a comprehensive overview of the sample for the study. The next sections provides an analysis of the data received in light of the objectives of the study.

### Findings: Motivating Factors of Permanent Retail Employees at a Retail Organisation in Pietermaritzburg

Items on the work satisfaction and motivation questionnaire were randomised to reduce bias. The following table provides the question number of the item that belongs to the specific sub-component of the scale.

| Table 1: Items Comprising the Cub-components of the Work Satisfaction and |  |
|---|--|
| Motivation Scale  |  |

| Sub-components of Work      | Combination of items                           |  |  |
|-----------------------------|--|--|--|
| Satisfaction and Motivation |  |  |  |
| Work Content                | 1,2,3,4,11,12,13,14,20,21,26,30,31,34,36,38,41 |  |  |
| Payment                     | 5,22,27,43                                     |  |  |
| Promotion                   | 6,15,42  |  |  |
| Recognition                 | 7,16,28,37                                     |  |  |
| Working conditions          | 23,32,35                                       |  |  |
| Benefits                    | 8,17,40  |  |  |
| Personal                    | 9,24   |  |  |
| My Leader/Supervisor        | 10,18,29,39                                    |  |  |
| General                     | 19,25,33                                       |  |  |

In order to achieve the aim of the study, descriptive statistics were computed and are presented in Table 2.

|                      | Ν  | Minimum | Maximum | Mean    | Std. Deviation |
|----------------------|----|---------|---------|---------|----------------|
| Work Content         | 34 | 19.00   | 41.00   | 29.2941 | 5.61669        |
| Payment              | 34 | 4.00    | 12.00   | 9.0294  | 2.49223        |
| Promotion            | 34 | 4.00    | 9.00    | 7.7941  | 1.45184        |
| Recognition          | 34 | 4.00    | 12.00   | 8.7941  | 2.51997        |
| Working Conditions   | 34 | 3.00    | 9.00    | 6.1176  | 1.45153        |
| Benefits             | 34 | 4.00    | 9.00    | 5.7059  | 1.54781        |
| Personal             | 34 | 2.00    | 6.00    | 3.7941  | 1.53306        |
| My Leader/Supervisor | 34 | 4.00    | 12.00   | 7.7647  | 2.38758        |
| General              | 34 | 3.00    | 9.00    | 6.9706  | 1.86654        |
| Total                | 34 | 51.00   | 116.00  | 85.2647 | 14.14494       |

### Table 2: Descriptive Statistics of the Sub-components

As the sub-components of work satisfaction and motivation have varying numbers of items, the above means were divided by the number of items in each sub-component.

The means are noted below:

| Work Satisfaction and Motivation | Mean |
|----------------------------------|------|
| Work Content                     | 1.72 |
| Payment                          | 2.26 |
| Promotion                        | 2.60 |
| Recognition                      | 2.20 |
| Working Conditions               | 2.04 |
| Benefits                         | 1.90 |
| Personal                         | 1.90 |
| My Leader/Supervisor             | 1.94 |
| General                          | 2.33 |
| Total                            | 1.98 |

These means were then ranked in descending order so that the most and least valued factors could be identified.

| Table 4: Rank Order of Means for the Sub-components of the Work Satisfaction |
|--|
| and Motivation Scale   |

| Sub-components of Work Satisfaction and Motivation | Mean |
|--|------|
| Promotion  | 2.60 |
| General  | 2.33 |
| Payment  | 2.26 |
| Recognition  | 2.20 |
| Working conditions                                 | 2.04 |
| My Leader/Supervisor                               | 1.94 |
| Benefits   | 1.90 |
| Personal   | 1.90 |
| Work Content                                       | 1.72 |

From the above table, it can be clearly seen that the three sub-components of the work satisfaction and motivation scale that have the least influence on the employees' motivation and satisfaction were aspects related to promotion, general factors and payment. Aspects of work satisfaction and motivation related to work content, personal factors and benefits were found to be most influential. Although one can see the sub-scales that least motivate employees or most motivate employees, it is important to identify the specific item responsible for creating the motivation.

Below is a response summary of the questions for each of the nine sub-components of the work satisfaction and motivation scale.

| Work Content                                    | True       | Unsure     | Untrue     |
|---|------------|------------|------------|
| I am interested in my work                      | 26 (76.5%) | 4 (11.8%)  | 4 (11.8%)  |
| My work consists of a variety of work           | 25 (73.5%) | 5 (14.7%)  | 4 (11.8%)  |
| I receive training daily which teaches          | 12 (35.3%) | 4 (11.8%)  | 18 (52.9%) |
| me something new                                |            |            |            |
| My work is easy                                 | 14 (41.2%) | 4 (11.8%)  | 16 (47.1%) |
| The amount of work is easy to handle            | 11 (32.4%) | 9 (26.5%)  | 14 (41.2%) |
| I control the amount of work I do myself        | 18 (52.9%) | 6 (17.6%)  | 10 (29.4%) |
| I am completely independent of others           | 19 (55.9%) | 6 (17.6%)  | 9 (26.5%)  |
| I regard the content of my work as              | 28 (82.4%) | 4 (11.8%)  | 2 (5.9%)   |
| responsible                                     |            |            |            |
| I know exactly what my tasks are                | 31 (91.2%) | 1 (2.9%)   | 2 (5.9%)   |
| I am allowed to decide on the methods for       | 12 (35.3%) | 9 (26.5%)  | 13 (38.2%) |
| doing the work                                  |            |            |            |
| I am proud to say what kind of work I do        | 18 (52.9%) | 5 (14.7%)  | 11 (32.4%) |
| My work is the way to future success            | 17 (50%)   | 8 (23.5%)  | 9 (26.5%)  |
| I will not be dismissed without good reason     | 22 (64.7%) | 6 (17.6%)  | 6 (17.6%)  |
| I have the opportunity to take part when        | 7 (20.6%)  | 7 (20.6%)  | 20 (58.8%) |
| decisions are made                              |            |            |            |
| I feel that my work is of value in my           | 23 (67.6%) | 6 (17.6%)  | 5 (14.7%)  |
| department                                      |            |            |            |
| There is no time for idleness                   | 20 (58.8%) | 12 (35.3%) | 2 (5.9%)   |
| I have a certain degree of authority in my work | 14 (41.2%) | 8 (23.5%)  | 12 (35.3%) |

## Table 5: Responses to the Work Content Sub-component of the Work Satisfaction and Motivation Scale

The majority of the participants responded 'true' to 'I am interested in my work', 'I know exactly what my tasks are', 'My work consists of a variety of work', 'I control the amount of work I do myself', 'I am completely independent of others', 'I regard the content of my work as responsible, 'I am proud to say what work I do', 'I will not be dismissed without good reason', 'I feel that my work is of value in my department', and 'There is no time for idleness.' However, the majority of the participants responded 'untrue' to 'I receive training daily which teaches me something new' and 'I have an opportunity to take part when decisions are made.'

# Table 6: Responses to the Payment Sub-component of the Work Satisfaction andMotivation Scale

| Payment  | True       | Unsure     | Untrue     |
|--|------------|------------|------------|
| My salary is satisfactory in relation to what I do                 | 8 (23.5%)  | 7 (20.6%)  | 19 (55.9%) |
| I earn the same as or more than other people in a similar job      | 10 (29.4%) | 7 (20.6%)  | 17 (50%)   |
| The basis of payment, for example overtime payment, is responsible | 13(38.2)   | 8 (23.5%)  | 13 (38.2%) |
| Salary increases are decided in a fair manner                      | 3 (8.8%)   | 11 (32.4%) | 20 (58.8%) |

The majority of the participants responded 'untrue' to 'My salary is satisfactory in relation to what I do' and 'Salary increases are decided in a fair manner'.

# Table 7: Responses to the Promotion Sub-component of the Work Satisfaction andMotivation Scale

| Promotion                                    | True     | Unsure     | Untrue     |
|--|----------|------------|------------|
| I will be promoted within the next two years | 1 (2.9%) | 8 (23.5%)  | 25 (73.6%) |
| Everyone has an equal chance to be promoted  | 3 (8.8%) | 9 (26.5%)  | 22 (64.7%) |
| Staff is promoted in a fair and honest way   | 1 (2.9%) | 14 (41.2%) | 19 (55.9%) |

The majority of the participants responded 'untrue' to 'I will be promoted within the next two years', 'Everyone has an equal chance to be promoted' and 'Staff are promoted in a fair and honest way'.

### Table 8: Responses to the Recognition Sub-component of the Work Satisfaction andMotivation Scale

| Recognition                                    | True      | Unsure    | Untrue      |
|--|-----------|-----------|-------------|
| I am praised regularly for my work             | 9 (26.5%) | 7 (20.5%) | 18 (52.9%)  |
| I receive constructive criticism about my work | 3 (8.8%)  | 6 (17.6%) | 15 (44.12%) |
| I get credit for what I do                     | 6 (17.6)  | 9 (26.5%) | 19 (55.9%)  |
| I am told that I am making progress            | 12 (35.3) | 7 (20.5%) | 15 (44.2%)  |

The majority of the participants responded 'untrue' to 'I am praised regularly for my work' and 'I get credit for what I do'.

### Table 9: Responses to the Working Conditions the Sub-component of Work

#### Satisfaction and Motivation Scale

| Working Conditions                              | True       | Unsure    | Untrue     |
|---|------------|-----------|------------|
| My working hours are reasonable                 | 9 (26.5%)  | 8 (23.5%) | 17 (50%)   |
| I am never overworked                           | 8 (23.5%)  | 7 (20.5%) | 19 (55.9%) |
| I get the opportunity to mix with my colleagues | 22 (64.7%) | 5 (14.7%) | 7 (20.5%)  |
| and to communicate on aspects of our work       |            |           |            |

The majority of the participants responded 'true' to 'I get the opportunity to mix with my colleagues and to communicate on aspects of our work', whilst the majority of the participants also responded 'untrue' to 'I am never overworked'.

# Table 10: Responses to the Benefits Sub-component of the Work Satisfaction andMotivation Scale

| Benefits                                   | True       | Unsure     | Untrue     |
|--|------------|------------|------------|
| My pension benefits are good               | 9 (26.5%)  | 16 (47.1%) | 9 (26.5%)  |
| My medical scheme is satisfactory          | 13 (38.2%) | 12 (35.3%) | 9 (26.5%)  |
| I never have problems with my arrangements | 17 (50%)   | 6 (17.6%)  | 11 (32.4%) |
| for leave                                  |            |            |            |

There was no majority response for benefit.

# Table 11: Responses to the Personal Sub-component of the Work Satisfaction andMotivation Scale

| Personal                              | True       | Unsure     | Untrue     |
|---------------------------------------|------------|------------|------------|
| I am given work in accordance with my | 2 (5.9%)   | 20 (58.8%) | 12 (35.3%) |
| qualifications and skills             |            |            |            |
| I work in the department of my choice | 19 (55.9%) | 6 (17.6%)  | 9 (26.5%)  |

The majority of the participants responded 'true' to 'I work in the department of my choice'. However, the majority of the participants also responded 'unsure' to 'I am given work in accordance with my qualifications and skills'

# Table 12: Responses to the My Leader/Supervisor Sub-component of the WorkSatisfaction and Motivation Scale

| My Leader / Supervisor                | True       | Unsure     | Untrue     |
|---------------------------------------|------------|------------|------------|
| Is satisfied easily                   | 9 (26.5%)  | 12 (35.3%) | 13 (38.2%) |
| Will support me if there are problems | 17 (50%)   | 9 (26.5%)  | 8 (23.5%)  |
| Can be convinced and persuaded        | 20 (58.8%) | 1 (2.9%)   | 13 (38.2%) |
| Is a warm-hearted person              | 14 (41.2%) | 12 (35.3%) | 8 (23.5%)  |

The majority of the participants 'true' to 'Can be convinced and persuaded.'

| Table 13: Responses to the General Sub-component of the Work Satisfaction and |
|---|
| Motivation Scale  |

| General                                     | True       | Unsure    | Untrue      |
|---|------------|-----------|-------------|
| I have not considered changing jobs         | 9 (26.5%)  | 5 (14.7%) | 20 (58.8 %) |
| I have not been looking out for another job | 7 (20.5%)  | 1 (2.9%)  | 26 (76.5%)  |
| I am not thinking of resigning              | 11 (32.4%) | 9 (26.5%) | 14 (41.2%)  |

The majority of the participants responded 'untrue' to 'I have not considered changing jobs' and 'I have not been looking out for another job.'

Promotion, general and payment are the most influential factors that motivate the participants, while benefits, personal and work content are the least motivating factors.

#### **Discussion of the Findings**

#### Demographic Distribution of the Sample

The demographics show that of the 34 permanent, non-managerial employees, the gender composition was made up of 73.5% females (n=25), while 26.5% (n=9) were male participants. This reinforces the notion that the retail industry is female-dominated (The Retail Gender Agenda, 2010:5). The possible reason for this could be gender stereotypes surrounding the retail industry. For example, women are viewed as being more approachable than men, so an organisation would employ more females.

The tenure period ranged from 1 year to 27 years. The majority of the participants, making up 58.7% (n=20) of the organisation's employees, have been employed for no longer than 5.5 years, while 5.8% (n=2) of the organisation's employees have been employed for a longer period. The average number of years with the organisation was 8.32 years. When evaluating the sub-component 'general,' it was found that 58.8% (n=20) of the participants responded 'untrue' to 'I have considered changing jobs,' and 76.5% (n=26) of the

participants responded 'untrue' to 'I have been looking out for another job'. This indicates that most of the participants don't have the intention to leave the organisation.

### Determining the Most and Least Valued Factors Influencing the Motivation of Employees

In this study, the means for work content, payment, promotion, recognition, working conditions, benefits, personal factors, my leader/supervisor and general factors ranged from a high of 2.60 to a low of 1.72, with a mean of 1.98 for overall work satisfaction and motivation. The closer a mean was to 3, the more there was an inclination towards dissatisfaction, whereas a mean closer to 1 leaned towards satisfaction.

The employees in the sample were relatively motivated, which is indicated by mean 1.98. However, the general factors sub-component had a mean of 2.33. This indicates that the employees in the sample were considering seeking alternative employment, although they were relatively motivated. Work content had the lowest mean, which indicated that the employees were most satisfied and most motivated by the content of their work. However, employees were most dissatisfied and least motivated by the chance of a promotion as they responded 'untrue' to 'Everyone has an equal chance of being promoted.'

The literature suggests that job design is fundamental to motivation (Ramlall, 2004), while Morse and Weiss (cited in Vroom & Deci, 1970) specifically mention job design as being fundamental to sales persons. The participants in the study had the lowest mean for work content, which reinforces the above notion. Although most of the participants are dissatisfied with the promotion, general, payment, recognition and the working conditions, there is still a moderate satisfaction level in the organisation. This moderate satisfaction could be the result of my leader / supervisor, benefits, personal and work content.

Locke (cited in Steers & Porter, 1975) claims that the supervisor is key to an employee being satisfied with his/her job. Locke (cited in Steers & Porter, 1975) believes that an employee's satisfaction with his/her job 'reflects the degree to which he believes...that it fulfils or allows the fulfilment of his job values.' As such, Locke (cited in Steers & Porter, 1975) claims that the supervisor can influence satisfaction by 'facilitating or blocking

subordinate value attainment.' From the current study, the 'my leader/supervisor' subcomponent has a mean of 1.94, which indicates a relatively moderate satisfaction level.

Locke et al. (cited in Rynes et al., 2004) researched money as an incentive. There are different forms of monetary incentives, such as for instance benefits. Locke et al. (cited in Rynes et al., 2004) concluded that 'Money is the crucial incentive . . . no other incentive or motivational technique comes even close to money with respect to its instrumental value' (Rynes et al., 2004). In the present study, Benefits had a mean of 1.90, which suggests that most of the participants are moderately satisfied with the benefits the organisation offers. The organisation in question could improve the benefits they offer as the mean is still not a 1.

After reviewing the results in light of the literature, it can be concluded that work content is the most motivating factor while promotion is the least motivating factor. However, according to the job design theory, the participant's motivation should have been low as the work they do is monotonous (Ramlall, 2004). A possible explanation for this could be the supervisory skills in the organisation. The supervisor could have an influence on the employees' satisfaction with the work.

The participants in the study are relatively motivated and satisfied. Although there are many opposing views on work satisfaction and motivation, work content comes through strongly in the work of numerous authors. Supervisors are seen to be a key factor in influencing satisfaction through work content.

#### Recommendations

The study found that work content was the most valued motivating factor, while promotion was the least contributing sub-component to the moderate level of work satisfaction and motivation. Literature suggests that supervisors can reinforce work content as a motivator.

#### **Recommendations for the Organisation**

From the findings, the factors identified by the participants as being satisfying are work content, personal factors, benefits, and my leader/supervisor. The participants are least satisfied with promotion, general factors, payment, recognition and working conditions.

The organisation should improve in the areas that have been identified as least motivating for the employees to be more motivated and satisfied. Possible interventions for the above areas are:

#### Promotion

Although the organisation has employees that have been employed for a long period, the possibility that they will all be promoted within a two-year time frame is not likely. Promotions enable people to move up in the organisation and can enable employees to grow. The organisation should look at alternatives to promotions. The organisation can also look at restructuring the positions that they have to implement trainee positions as possible succession planning as they currently have many junior staff members and very little middle management.

#### General

The majority of the employees are looking at leaving the organisation. The organisation should look at developing other motivators to retain their employees.

#### Payment

The organisation can review the current payment structures as many employees believe that they are not being remunerated in a fair manner. A market analysis can be done on other retail organisations and the pay structures that are present to determine if the salary bracket being used is in fact fair. The organisation can also devise a policy regarding salary increases and can adopt a standard salary increase percentage across all departments.

#### Recognition

Many employees feel that they are not recognised for their hard work. The organisation can adopt an employee of the month incentive to show employees that they do appreciate them. However, the organisation should also train its management team human resource management skills, such as how to recognise and appreciate staff efforts. Managers in the organisation should also learn the skill of giving feedback to employees on their progress in a manner that would yield positive results.

#### Working Conditions

Although the participants are relatively satisfied with work content, the management of the organisation can improve the conditions of the work being done. This can be done by giving employees the opportunity to take part when decisions are made and/or providing the employees with training to learn new skills that can enable them to conduct their jobs more efficiently. The majority of the employees are unhappy with the hours they work. The organisation can review their current schedule to determine if they are in a position to make amendments to the time schedule of permanent employees by bringing in their casual employees (flexi hour employees) to either commence work at the start of the organisation's trading time or to end work at the completion of the organisations trading time. This could help the permanent employees to either come in later or leave earlier.

#### Limitations of the Study

Due to the nature of the sample group and the nature of the questions in the questionnaire, some problems were experienced. The data collection had to be carried out at a time suitable for the employees and the manager. Employees have different lunch times and are not allowed to leave their positions on the floor or tills. To overcome this, an agreement was made with the manager to arrange a convenient time. The time arranged for the collection of data was after the regular store meeting. However, due to employees being sick or on leave, not all employees could participate.

The reliability coefficient for working conditions is -0.09. This indicates that the item is unreliable. However, De Beer found this item to have a reliability of 0.77. A possible reason for this could be due to the response to 'I get the opportunity to mix with my colleagues and to communicate on aspects of our work'. Most of the participants answered 'true' to this item, whereas in the previous items they responded 'untrue'.

Since this was a case study, the findings cannot be generalised to the population at large. The findings are specific to the retail organisation in the study.

#### **Recommendations for Future Research**

The study can only provide statistical data on the factors that motivate permanent employees in a retail organisation in Pietermaritzburg. The study cannot provide reasons for the identification of these factors. Future studies can focus on more qualitative and open-ended methodologies. Instead of providing participants with sub-components of work satisfaction and motivation, the participants themselves can identify the sub-components that they are motivated by. Key areas for improvement by the organisation can also be requested from the participants, as this will indicate areas that can motivate the employees.

#### Conclusion

Retail organisations are a fast-moving industry and contributing factor in the country's economic growth (Ansley, cited in Carr, 2005). According to Chakravarti (2003) employees in retail organisations are important resources to an organisation, and employees play an equally important role in aiding customers in selecting products. Therefore, it is imperative to identify the factors that motivate employees.

#### List of References

Adeyinka, A.E., & Abdul-Rahman, O.A. (2013). Motivation and its effects on employee's performance. *Pakistan Journal of Social Sciences*, 10(2), pp. 99-104.

Ali, R., & Ahmed, M. S. (2009). The impact of reward and recognition programs on employee's motivation and satisfaction: an empirical study. *International Review of Business Research Papers*, 5(4), pp. 270-279.

Bent, R. & Freathy, P. (1997) Motivating the employee in the independent retail sector. *Journal of Retailing and Consumer Services*, 4(3), pp. 201-208.

Carr, G. (2005) Investigating the motivation of retail managers at a retail organisation in the Western Cape. [Online]. Available: http://etd.uwc.ac.za/usrfiles/modules/etd/docs/etd\_init\_9300\_1174552857.pdf Accessed 07 March 2011.

Chakravarti, A. (2003) Motivated perceptions of salesperson's actions and message: the role of consumer's self-regulatory goals and prior knowledge. Standford University. [Online]. Available: <u>http://proquest.uni.com/padweb?index</u> Accessed 16 March 2011.

Durrheim, K. (2006) Research Design. *In*: M. Terre Blanche, K. Durrheim, and D. Painter (eds) *Research in Practice: Applied Methods for the Social Sciences*. 2<sup>nd</sup> edition. Cape Town: University of Cape Town Press.

Durrheim, K. and Painter, D. (2006) Collecting quantitative data: Sampling and measuring. *In*: M. Terre Blanche, K. Durrheim, and D. Painter. 2006. *Research in Practice: Applied* 

*Methods for the Social Sciences*. 2<sup>nd</sup> edition. Cape Town: University of Cape Town Press.

French, W.C. & Bell, C.H. (1999) *Organizational development: Behavioral science interventions for organization improvement.* 6<sup>th</sup> edition. New Jersey: Prentice Hall.

Hoque, F., Rabbany., M.G., Anny, S.A., & Akter., A. (2016). Level of Job Satisfaction in Agribusiness sector in Bangladesh: An application of Herz-Berg Two Factors Motivation Theory. *International Journal of Economics, Commerce and Management*, 4(6), pp. 419-445.

Katzell, R.A., & Thompson, D.E. (1990) Work Motivation Theory and Practice. *American Psychologist*, 45(2), pp. 144-153.

Lin, H.F. (2007) Effects of extrinsic and intrinsic motivation on employee knowledge sharing intentions. *Journal of Information Science*. 33(2), pp. 135–149.

Louw, A.D., Meyer, J.C., & Van Schalkwyk, D.J. (2000) A comparison of the jobsatisfied and job-dissatisfied environmental health officer in South Africa. *Journal of Industrial Psychology*, 26(2), pp.27-31.

Michie, J., Oughton, C., & Bennion, Y. (2002) Employee ownership, motivation and productivity: A research report for Employees Direct from Birkbeck and The Work Foundation. London: Birkbeck University of London.

Osterloh, M. & Frey, B.S. (2000) Motivation, knowledge transfer and organisational forms. *Organization Science*, 11(5), pp. 538-550.

Paquette, D. & Ryan, J. (2001) *Bronfenbrenner's Ecological Systems Theory*. [Online]. Available: <u>http://pt3.nl.edu/paquetteryanwebquest.pdf</u> Accessed 24 March 2011.

Perry, J.L & Potter, L.W. (1982) Factors Affecting the Context for Motivation in Public Organisation. *The Academy of Management Review*, 7 (1), pp. 89-98.

Ramlall, S. (2004) A Review of Employee Motivation Theories and their Implications for Employee Retention within organizations. *Journal of American Academy of Business*. Cambridge, *pp*.52-63.

Rynes, S.L., Gerhart, B & Minette., K.A. (2004) The importance of pay in employee motivation: discrepancies between what they say and what they do. *Human Resource Management*, 43 (4), pp. 381-394.

Shaffer, D.R & Kipp, K. (2007). *Developmental Psychology: Childhood and adolescence*.7<sup>th</sup> edition. Thompson Wadson: United States of America.

*The Retail Gender Agenda* (2010). [Online]. Available: <u>http://news.bbc.co.uk/1/hi/business/8238508.stm</u> Accessed 18 August 2011. Tredoux, C., & Durrheim, K. (Eds). (2002) *Numbers, hypotheses and conclusions: A course in statistics for the social sciences*. Juta: Cape Town.

Welman, C., Kruger, F. and Mitchell, B. (2005) *Research Methodology*. 3<sup>rd</sup> edition. South Africa, Oxford University Press Southern Africa (Pty) Ltd.

### AN INVESTIGATION INTO THE ROLE OF SCHOOL LEADERS IN MANAGING CULTURAL DIVERSITY AMONG EDUCATORS IN TWO EX-MODEL C PRIMARY SCHOOLS IN GAUTENG, SOUTH AFRICA

#### **Charmaine Soupen**

Charmaines@live.co.za

Diversity may be the hardest thing for a society to live with, and perhaps the most dangerous thing for a society to be without {Nelson Mandela: 1994 (Inaugural Presidential Speech)

Keywords: diversity, leadership, cultural diversity, management

#### Introduction

The changes brought about in South Africa since the first democratic elections in 1994 have had a profound influence on the country, including on education. The end of apartheid brought with it the merging of the four different education departments, i.e. he White education department, Indian education department, Coloured education department and the Bantu education department into the unified Department of Education of South Africa.

The introduction of employment equity (through the Employment Equity Act 55 of 1998), saw people from diverse cultures and different backgrounds starting to work together in a common economy across the South African workforce. The Employment Equity Act aimed for equality by imposing the duty to eliminate unfair discrimination amongst the various groups (i.e. in current employment and remuneration practices). These groups are designated in the Act as 'Blacks, (Africans, Coloureds and Indians), women and people with disabilities'.

Thus, even after the democratic transition, employment inequities posed a serious challenge to the democratic state. The Employment Equity Act 55 of 1998 was intended to correct the inequities of the past and to create a workforce that reflected the demographics of the country (Republic of South Africa, 1998).

South Africa's aggressive Affirmative Action Act of 17 February 2014, (Labour Department) requires companies to give preferential hiring treatment to the country's 90 per cent Black population and women. It has garnered both praise and criticism. This consists of preferential access to education, employment, health care, or social welfare. In employment, affirmative action may also be known as employment equity. In this context, affirmative action requires that institutions increase hiring and promotion of candidates of mandated groups (Lakhan, 2003). It is against this background that this paper investigates whether school leaders have managed diversity successfully after 22 years of implementation.

#### **Research Questions**

The research questions are as follows:

#### Main Question

• What are the main challenges facing White principals from previously Whites-only schools in leading a diverse cultural staff?

#### Sub-Questions

- What is the meaning of the concept 'diversity'?
- What leadership styles should the principals adopt in order to manage cultural diversity in a school?
- What does education research and literature tell us about managing diversity in schools?
- Why is it important to manage diversity among educators in the school environment?
- What are the challenges that the leader of a school encounters in managing diversity?
- How can cultural diversity be better managed in the school environment?

This paper is based on evidence that was collected by means of a structured questionnaire that consisted of open-ended questions and semi-structured interviews with open-ended questions with the principals and staff of two ex-model C primary schools. The study and analysis of these figures/data, together with an analysis of the open-ended questions in the questionnaires and interviews, provide valuable information for the research.

The sections that follow present a review of literature that provides a conceptual and theoretical framework for the study, the methodology adopted to collect and analyse data that helped to answer the research questions, the analysis and discussion of the research findings, and a summary of the conclusions and recommendations from the findings.

#### **Literature Review**

#### What Is Culture and Diversity?

The literature review attempts to demonstrate that by taking into account the background of individual educators, the positive, complementary aspects of their diverse backgrounds and contexts can be brought together to facilitate cordial relations, which results in integration.

Culture as defined by Hebding and Glick (1976) is that complex whole that includes knowledge, beliefs, art, morals, law, custom, and any other capabilities and habits acquired by man as a member of society. They also state that culture may be seen as a historically derived system of explicit and implicit designs for living, which tends to be shared by all, or specifically designated members of a group or society. While the Centre for Advanced Research for Language Acquisition (http://www.carla.umn.edu/culture/definitions.html) defines culture as shared patterns of behaviours and interactions, cognitive constructs, and affective understanding that are learned through a process of socialisation.

Culture may be manifested in many ways: dress, language, food, gestures, manners, beliefs, norms, standards, perceptions, attitudes and priorities (Smit & Cronje, 2000). Grobler et al. (1994) suggest that multiculturalism or cultural diversity is the result of people with differing physical characteristics or cultural traditions coming together in a single society or environment. Within this 'melting pot' of differing cultures, there is an inherent tendency in individuals to attempt to preserve their own culture (Hicks & Gwynne, 1994)

whilet Hulmes (1989) states that in such situations of cultural and racial mix, the maintenance of cultural identity will be of high priority.

#### The Diversity Wheel

This model illustrates both the primary and secondary dimensions of diversity that affect us at home, work and in society. It is the dynamic interaction among all the dimensions that influences self-image, values, opportunities and expectations.

#### Figure 1: Diversity wheel



(Source: Irwin Professional Publishing, 1996)

Diversity is both specific, focused on an individual; and contextual, defined through societal constructs (Moore, 1999). Generally, researchers organise diversity characteristics into four areas: personality (e.g., traits, skills and abilities), internal (e.g., gender, race, ethnicity, I.Q., sexual orientation), external (e.g., culture, nationality, religion, marital or parental status), and organisational (e.g., position, department, union/non-union) (Digh, 1998a; Johnson, 2003; Simmons-Welburn, 1999).

The trend in defining diversity 'seems to favour a broad definition, one that goes beyond the visible differences' that, for many people, are too closely linked to affirmative action (Jones, 1999). One of the first researchers to use this inclusive definition, R. Roosevelt Thomas, Jr., was pivotal in moving diversity thinking beyond narrow EEO/Affirmative Action categories. In his landmark work, Beyond Race and Gender (1990), he argued that to manage diversity successfully, organisations must recognise that race and gender are only two of many diversity factors.

Managers and leaders must expand their perspective on diversity to include a variety of other dimensions (Thomas, 1992). Workplace diversity management, in his model, is also inclusive, defined as a 'comprehensive managerial process for developing an environment that works for all employees' (1992). This general definition also enables all staff to feel included rather than excluded, permitting them 'to connect and fortify relationships that enable employees to deal with more potentially volatile issues that may later arise' (Johnson, 2003).

# What Leadership Styles should the Principal Adopt in Order to Manage Cultural Diversity in a School?

Leadership and diversity are invariably connected as schools move from mono-cultural, non-diverse contexts to ones that contain ethnically diverse, multilingual and economically disadvantaged educators. Alexander (2002) is of the opinion that the increasing diversity in the South African education system calls for a new focus on the role of education managers. While Van der Linde (2002) focuses on the role of conflict in analysing the situation in two schools in South Africa, he is of the opinion that proper management can lead to a school environment where multiculturalism will not be an obstacle. Jones (1999) admits that the public discourse on diversity in South African schools has largely been confined to the issue of Black educators into White schools. He calls this focus 'misplaced', as the deafening silence remains on issues of curriculum, staffing policy, etc.

According to Fleisch (2002), in order to bring about school improvement initiatives, the understanding of culture is extremely important. Once the cultural context is understood, Garson (2000) concludes several recommendations of key values that should be promoted in school, including equity, tolerance, multilingualism, openness, accountability and social honour. She also stipulates concrete ideas that principals can implement such as pre-service and in-service training, policies to stop discrimination, and research on staff and learner diversity.

Borak (2005) argues that change cannot happen in the workplace unless management understands that diversity is about being susceptible to employment consequences as a result of one's association within or outside certain groups.' This is supported by Niki Leondakis, COO of Kempton Hotels and Restaurants, (H Careers, article 321), who suggests that truly effective diversity management does not happen haphazardly. Instead, it takes a proactive approach.

Henge (2000) highlights the following approaches with which school leaders can achieve diversity and cultural synergy:

- School leaders have the power to influence race relations in a positive direction through in-service training;
- New school leaders step into different contexts which allow for the implementation of new ideas to support the development of positive race relations;
- Proactive school leaders attend to underlying and overt conflicts by addressing them immediately or through mediation; and
- Allow other role groups to lead effectively to improve inter-cultural language relations

# What Does Education Research and Literature tell us about Managing Diversity in Schools?

Management, as defined by Van Schalkwyk (1993) is 'the sum of all activities necessary for an institution to function effectively.' Due to its diversity, the multicultural educational environment will require greater understanding by principals of the diverse cultural forces and the manner in which they may need to be accommodated. Managing diversity can be defined as a planned, systematic and comprehensive managerial process for developing an organisational environment in which all people, with their similarities and differences can contribute to the strategic and competitive advantage of the organisation and where no one is excluded on the basis of factors unrelated to productivity (De Vos, 1998). However, Smit and Morgan (1996) in Grobler et al. (2004) argue that managing diversity not only has to do with understanding each other in a multicultural society; it should also create an organisational environment in which people understand, accept, respect, tolerate and explore their differences. In such an environment all stakeholders despite their differences: feel a sense of belonging; are accepted; and are able to reach their full potential. Since the school 'bears the stamp of the cultural world in which it functions,' it is therefore never neutral, but rather shaped by the nature and needs of the community it serves (Van Schalkwyk, 1993). These factors will therefore tend to dictate to principals the management styles that are most conducive to that environment.

Workplace support would need to be developed, the organisational climate would need to be supportive of diversity, individuals would need to be recognised for developing diversity skills and competencies, and organisational goals and objectives should be set, aimed at coping with the many dimensions of diversity (Smit & Cronje, 2000). To accomplish this, the most effective management style would be a democratic style of management with good interpersonal communication and good decision-making skills. This is characterised by transparency, which creates space and opportunity for interactive learning. Should the management of a diverse cultural environment not be effective, it may allow perceptions to arise where certain cultural groups appear to be 'favoured' by principals.

Ansari and Jackson (1995) warn against 'unintentional marginalising' of minority groups instead of using them effectively in the team. This could create feelings of inferiority, resentment and dissention, destroying any possibility for cooperation and synergy. It has been suggested by De Vos (1998) that cultural changes often occur due to inter-cultural contact and individuals do attempt to preserve their own culture. This diversity of culture creates a richness of opportunity, in that it should provide situations for individuals to grow and learn about others.

According to Byars and Rue (2000), organisations in South Africa, must get away from the tradition of 'fitting employees into a single corporate mould.' Organisations, including schools, must create new human resource policies to explicitly recognise and respond to the unique needs of individuals, and (especially at school level), the needs of specific

communities. Grobler et al. (2004) suggest that greater diversity will create certain specific challenges to education, but also make some important contributions. Communication problems are certain to occur, including misunderstandings among employees and managers as well as the need to translate verbal and written materials into several languages (in the case of South Africa, this would mean eleven languages).

In conclusion, it can be gleaned from the literature that a mere understanding of the concepts of culture and diversity is insufficient. What is needed is a deeper understanding of how one's culture influences one's time, work ethics, individuality or one's role at school. The literature indicates that this is vital to principals, who should be aware of the dangers of stereotyping of individual as well as personal prejudices or biases based on an individual's background or culture.

#### Investigation

Mouton (2003) defines research design as the type of study to be undertaken in order to provide an acceptable answer to the research question. Welman and Kruger (2001) regard a research design as the plan according to which the researcher obtains research participants and collects information from them.

This study aims to investigate the role of the school leader in managing cultural diversity among educators in two ex model-C primary schools in Gauteng in South Africa. The following questions will be focused on: what are the main challenges facing a White principal from a previously Whites-only school, in leading a diverse cultural staff; what is the meaning of the concept 'diversity', what leadership styles should the principal adopt in order to manage cultural diversity in a school, what does education research and literature tell us about managing diversity in schools, why is it important to manage diversity among educators in the school environment, what are the challenges that the leader of a school encounter in managing diversity and how can cultural diversity be better managed in the school environment?

It also outlines the research methods and procedures, the data collection strategies that were used and the type of school that was selected. Also included are the challenges that were experienced in the course of the research, an exploratory analysis of the data and reflections on the research methodology. This research would be a case study of these two institutions.

### Qualitative Research Paradigm

The qualitative research method was utilised. The school's profile included figures on the schools' current staff composition and that prior to 1994 to provide background information. Qualitative research is based on a constructivist philosophy that assumes that reality is a multi-layered, interactive, shared social experience that is interpreted by individuals. Reality is a social construction; that is, individuals and groups derive or ascribe meanings to specific events, persons, processes, and objects. People form constructions to make sense of their world and reorganise these constructions as viewpoints, perceptions and belief systems. In other words, people's perceptions are what they consider real and it is thus what directs their actions, thoughts and feelings.

Qualitative research is first concerned with understanding social phenomena from participants' perspectives. That understanding is achieved by analysing the many contexts of the participants and by narrating participants' meanings for these situations and events (McMillan & Schumacher, 2006). Therefore, one must assume for the purposes of the research, that the participants are being truthful or stating their honest opinion.

Data was collected by means of a structured) questionnaire which consisted of open-ended questions. According to Cohen and Manion (cited by Mthethwa, 2004), questionnaires allow for the gathering data at a particular point in time with the aim of describing and explaining the nature of existing conditions, identifying the standards against which existing conditions can be compared and determining the relationships that exist between the specific events. The study and analysis of these figures/data, together with an analysis of the open-ended questions in the questionnaires and interviews, provided valuable information for the research.

Semi-structured interviews with open-ended questions were conducted with the principals and staff. These interviews were more justified in obtaining the 'how' and 'why,' especially concerning inter- racial and language barriers amongst staff. An interview is also appropriate to gain depth and deeper insight into emotions, experiences and feelings, when there are sensitive issues under discussion. Interviews were audio-recorded, unless objected to by the respondents. For example, in certain instances respondents preferred not to have their opinions, or confidential information, recorded.

#### Sample

For the purpose of this study, purposeful sampling was used which according to Polit and Hunglar (1999), a form of non-probability is sampling. The population comprises of the principals and educators of a public, primary schools in the Johannesburg. The schools were previously classified as an advantaged, Whites-only suburban schools. With South Africa becoming a democratic republic in 1994, staff and learners from different race, language and religious groups were employed and accepted at these schools. Demographic changes have affected the schools' catchment areas, which experienced an influx of Black, Coloured and Indian families, making this community a prime example of diverse cultures, living together.

#### **Data Collection Strategies**

Data collection strategies entailed the following: (i) survey, (ii) interviews and (iii) questionnaires to the principals and educators to help provide evidence to support conclusions drawn from the literature. The findings from the data collected through the above strategies would also reveal whether or not the actual context is indicative of the conclusions drawn from the literature.

#### Survey

Information on the schools' profile provided data on the schools' staff composition prior to 1994 (before democracy) and the current staff composition i.e. the number of Blacks, coloureds, Indians and Whites; the number of males and females; the various language and religious groups of staff.

#### Questionnaires

Questionnaires with open-ended questions were issued. Gummesson (1991) argues that one disadvantage of using the questionnaire is that, the emphasis is mostly on verbal statements and non- verbal gestures are neglected. Furthermore, questions cannot be explained to the respondents and sometimes can be misinterpreted. The aim was to maximise the validity and reliability of the results obtained from the principals so that the responses by the principals are justified. Not all staff completed the questionnaires. However, there was a ninety per cent response from the school, which made the study feasible.

#### Interviews

The principals and five educators in each school were interviewed. Open-ended questions in a semi-structured interview schedule (one-to one) were conducted. The interviews were audio-recorded.

#### Challenges

All participants were assured of confidentiality, as some were afraid of victimisation or discrimination by senior management. In some of the interviews, staff members were reluctant to divulge confidential information, which restricted the data to a certain extent. For example, some participants would say, 'I don't like to say why because ....'All participants participated voluntarily. Therefore, this research would have short-comings as the responses could be unreliable due to fear. It would be suggested to conduct this research among a number of schools rather than a single school.

#### **Exploratory Analysis of Data**

The research purpose is descriptive, showing the data obtained from the school's profile. The data collected is presented in the form of graphs. The research is also exploratory allowing for comparisons to be made from the period since 1994 until present. As emphasised by de Clercq (2003), the questionnaires and interviews were aimed at
measuring the attitudes, beliefs, opinions and perceptions of the educators and the principal, highlighting the common areas of concern or effectiveness.

## Consent

Informed consent was secured from the respondents, explaining clearly what was required of them. A letter of consent was written to the mega-district education circuit office of Johannesburg, seeking permission to approach the school to carry out the research. According to De Vos (2002), obtaining informed consent implied that all possible or adequate information about the goal of the investigation, the procedures that were followed during the investigation, the possible advantages, disadvantages and danger to which respondents may be exposed as well as the credibility of the research, be rendered to potential subjects.

### Data Analysis

To reiterate, this study focuses on investigating the role of the school leader in managing cultural diversity among educators in two ex-model C Primary School in Gauteng in South Africa.

The results of the schools' profile, the principals' and educators' responses are analysed in this chapter. The data collected shows how the schools have moved from a predominantly 'Whites only' school to a more racially and culturally diverse school and how the principals have managed such transformation. The schools' profile are represented in the form of graphs, which shows the transformation from an all 'Whites' schools prior to 1994 to a diverse cultural environment with regards to race, language, gender and religion. The graph shows the demographics of both the schools' population prior to 1994. It was 100% Whites.



Figure 2: Staff population of the school prior to 1994: School 1

Figure 3: Staff population of the school prior to 1994: School 2





Figure 4: Staff population of the School 1 in April 2016

SCHOOL 1: There are 10% African males; 20% African females; 10% Indian males; 20% Indian females; 0% Coloured males; 5% Coloured females; 5% White males and 30% White females



Figure 5: Staff population of the School 2 in April 2016

SCHOOL 2: There are 10% African males; 20% African females; 5% Indian males; 30% Indian females; 0% Coloured males; 0% Coloured females; 5% White males and 30% White females.

Figure 6:

Language composition prior 1994 is as follows in School 1:

- English: 15% males and 35% females
- Afrikaans: 20% males and 30% females

Language composition currently, is as follows in School 1:

- English: 20% males and 40% females
- Afrikaans: 5% males and 5% females
- Xhosa: 10% males and 20% females

It shows the change that had been brought about by diversity.

# Figure 6: Composition of the staff native language in School 1



# Figure 7: Composition of the staff native language in School 2



Language Composition prior 1994 is as follows in School 2:

- English: 20% males and 40% females
- Afrikaans: 10% males and 30% females

Language composition currently, is as follows in School 1:

- English: 10% males and 40% females
- Afrikaans: 5% males and 10% females
- Xhosa: 10% males and 20% females
- Other: 5% females

# Figure 8: The different religions of the staff population at School 1



Figure 8 depicts the religious groups of the staff population currently and prior 1994 in School 1.

PRIOR 1994:

90% Christians and 10% Other

# April 2016:

50% Christians; 10% Muslims; 20% Hindus and 10% Other



**Figure 9: The different religions of the staff population at School 2** 

Figure 9 depicts the religious groups of the staff population currently and prior 1994 in School 1.

Prior to 1994:

• 100% Christians

April 2016:

- 50% Christians
- 20% Muslims
- 25% Hindus

5% Other

Diversity had brought in Islam and Hinduism.

The following analysis was obtained from the questionnaires and the interview:

#### School 1:

•

#### **Definition of diversity:**

#### **Principal:**

'It is differences in people, a variety of people working and living together. The tolerance and acceptance of the differences within the group; how people overcome these differences to accomplish the common goal.'

#### Educator 3 and 4:

'It means differences in race, culture, views, opinions, religions, social standards.'

'It's different cultures, languages and racial groups existing harmoniously together, different beliefs, value systems and morals which are influenced by ideas on religion, history and family.'

**Conclusion:** The above responses correlate with the definitions provided in the literature review. This indicates that the staff has an understanding of the definition of diversity.

### **Integration of staff at the school:**

#### **Principal:**

'We have complete multiracial and multicultural diversity with our learners and educators.'

### Educator 2:

'All new educators are well integrated. Assistance is given when required in terms of inservice training. New educators do learn from other educators, who are willing to assist the new educators to adapt to the new system. New educators experience problems sometimes in adapting to the new system at our school.'

**Conclusion:** The principal and educators highlighted the positive aspects of integration of staff at the school, but were reluctant to elaborate on the 'problems' that new staff experienced. Some staff did point out that certain educators have little patience with new staff who is employed at the school. They also expressed the opinion that senior staff is reluctant to afford adequate time or space for the new staff to integrate or adapt to their new environment, and their new roles or job functions.

# **Benefits to the School in Becoming Diverse:**

# **Principal:**

'I have gained knowledge and insight into many cultures, beliefs and religions, which has enhanced and developed my tolerance level. Our school has grown in understanding other cultures and how it benefits us individually.'

# Educators 1 and 4:

'I have gained in knowledge of the different cultures and our teaching has benefitted the pupils.'

'I have learnt about the different cultures and now I am more tolerant and respectful of my colleagues ...'

**Conclusion:** The principal acknowledged that the advantage of a multicultural school environment is that all stakeholders are exposed to other cultures. Cultural diversity provides richness to the school environment, which brings different teaching styles and leads to the growth and development of all individuals.

The staff also feels that people no longer think narrow-mindedly or in a convergent manner, rather divergent thinking is encouraged. The principal also pointed out that, at times, due to ignorance about other cultural groups, effective interaction of the various cultural groups

is restricted. This has a negative impact on the quality of education due to language barriers, religious conflict and racial tensions. He suggested more in-service training is needed.

People begin to understand one another holistically (this is a conceptual framework developed by Senge, 1990). A learning organisation can be a key benefit to schools (Davidoff & Lazarus, 1997). Such a school can be a place where all individuals grow and develop. There is mutual respect and trust in the way that they talk to each other, and work together, no matter what their positions may be in the organisation. Senge (1990) states: learning organisations are organisations where people continue to expand their capacity to create the results they truly desire, new and expansive patterns of thinking are nurtured, collective aspiration is set free, and people are continually learning how to learn together.

# The Role of the Principal in Managing Cultural Diversity:

### **Principal:**

'I set the tone for tolerance and acceptance of different races, cultures and religions. I have to mediate fairly and firmly. I set boundaries of what is tolerant ...'

### Educator 2, 3 and 5:

'The principal is fully involved by leading by example. He encourages and develops new ideas. He is a team player. He plays a major role because he controls and manages learner admission, staff appointments and ensuring equity.'

'The principal mediates between learners, parents and educators. He tries to integrate the school by accommodating all cultural groups in the best way possible.'

'The principal is understanding and adheres to the rules. Some staff members found it difficult to accept his different ideas. He is not always successful in dealing with cultural conflict.'

It is evident from the respondents that a variety of approaches or management styles are employed by the principal. It was also gathered that the principal uses a much more contextsensitive and democratic approach to management and employs a bureaucratic and rulebound style of management. The principal emphasised that as a manager, knowledge and understanding of the different cultural groups within a school is essential in achieving cultural synergy.

#### **Competencies of the Principal in Managing Cultural Diversity:**

#### Principal:

'Sometimes I have to compromise in order to be sensitive to the huge variety of beliefs. I feel that I can manage a diverse staff as I have gained an understanding of the needs of the staff as a whole. A diversity management course would definitely be beneficial.'

### Educator 4:

'The principal works together as a team, and is capable to manage our diverse staff groups reasonably well, but there are times when a misunderstanding happens and the principal is misled...'

**Conclusion:** There is a general feeling that the principal is competent enough to manage a culturally diverse staff. The respondents also indicated that the principal understands the needs of his staff, he is a 'team player,' he promotes tolerance, is open and accommodating, builds bridges by mediating, and even asking for help when the need arises. The principal feels that he has had the experience since the inception of democracy in dealing with and managing a diverse staff. Most staff members agreed that the principal should also attend some form of in-service training in diversity. The principal acknowledged this.

### Conclusion

The responses of the principal and staff indicated that the school has become more diversified since 1994. The role of the principal and his management styles play an important part in achieving cultural synergy, where all stakeholders can work together in achieving their common goals. All the respondents from the school acknowledge that there is a need for change within the school environment and in education as a whole and are positive about this change. This can be seen as a major shift in the mind-set of individuals. There appears to be recognition of the need for acceptance and tolerance among all

individuals and a willingness to learn about other cultural practices. Staff diversity is not viewed as negative by the principal or educators.

### School 2

# **Definition of Diversity**

# **Principal:**

'It is a mixture of having the different race; gender; language orientation and religious groups working or living together.'

### Educator 1 and 5:

'It means people with different backgrounds; religion; language and race living together. Also people with different sexual orientation and gender.'

**Conclusion:** The above responses correlate with the definitions provided in the literature review in chapter three. However, the younger generation has a broader definition by adding the different sexual preferences of individuals. This indicates that the staff has an understanding of the definition of diversity and the younger generation is more ignorant to the difficulties endured prior to 1994. Many researchers of the past had omitted the sexual preferences that have been brought to the forefront in the twentieth century.

In a survey conducted in 2007, by the (SHRM), Society for Human Resource Management (SHRM, 2007), it was found that with a gradually increasing diverse workforce and consumer market, and the growth of the gay, lesbian, bisexual and transgender workforce, many employers struggled to help their established workforce adapt, and furthermore to bring new staff into the organisation's culture. This, however, helped to create a harmoniously diverse workplace. The above SHRM Foundation's records show that more than half of the Fortune 500 provide some form of diversity training that includes sexual orientation, and most of all the employers that prohibit discrimination based on gender identity have some form of related diversity training. In 2016, we notice an acceptance of this type of orientation.

# Integration of Staff at the School

# **Principal:**

'Our staff population is completely diverse. Since they work well together and enjoy the same synergy, I would state that the integration was successful.'

# Educator 2:

'Integration is part of our induction policy and we go through it quite stringently so as to not upset the apple-cart. Peering off works well as we learn the core values that are expected on the floor. Constant in house training is provided and where individuals are perceived to encounter issues, they are coached on a one to one basis.'

# Conclusion

The principal and educators highlighted the positive aspects of the integration of staff at the school, but were reluctant to identify the perception of problems as mentioned above. It seems that this school has a well-developed diversity and integration policy that is put into practice. However, many new personnel that had joined at the beginning of 2016, were not prepared to participate in this survey as they proclaimed that they needed more time at the school in order to answer such questions.

# **Benefits to the School in Becoming Diverse:**

# **Principal:**

'It has broadened my horizon into the many cultures, beliefs, religions, language and sexual orientations that's prevalent in today's society. I have learnt to handle diversity accordingly, so as to be tolerant and accepting of all.'

### Educators 3 and 4:

'I have learned to adjust my behaviour as well as my speech. It has made me wiser as a person.' 'I have learnt about the different cultures and now I am more tolerant and respectful of my colleagues ...'

**Conclusion:** It can be deducted that in School 2, all stakeholders have benefitted from integration. Individuals are appreciated for who they are and not what they are. People begin to understand one another holistically (this is a conceptual framework developed by Senge, 1990). The principal indicated that all senior managers should be given on-going training in order to implement with the staff. A learning organisation can be a key benefit to schools (Davidoff & Lazarus, 1997).

# The Role of the Principal in Managing Cultural Diversity:

# Principal:

'My motto is: Do what I do and not what I say. I lead by example and my staff follows my lead.'

#### Educator 1, 3 and 5:

'The principal is totally involved in leading by example. We just imitate his behaviour and this has worked wonders. 'He ensures that all culturally festivities are celebrated at school and the significance of each event is explained in detail so that everyone understands the reason for the celebration.' 'As part of the older staff, I am trying to embrace this new generation of thinking. I am not having a problem with it, however, it takes some time getting used to.'

**Conclusion**: It is evident that the principal is very influential in maintaining and managing diversity at the school. He emulates the type of behaviour that he expects. He uses the transformational leadership style by being a team player. He sets the tone at the school for expected behaviour.

### **Competencies of the Principal in Managing Cultural Diversity**

### **Principal:**

'I believe that God created everyone equal and in His image. This belief of mine has made me accept everyone, regardless of their beliefs/gender/race etc. With constant reading and information upload, I managed to maintain a smooth sailing ship. We would, however like the Department of Education to give us on-going training in creating a diverse atmosphere at school.'

# Educator 4:

'I think that the reason why diversity is so well maintained, is due to the age of the principal. He is young and from the new generation. He ensures the well-being of all his staff and we appreciate it.'

**Conclusion:** There is a general feeling that the principal is competent enough to manage a culturally diverse staff. His new way of thinking has had a positive influence in managing diversity. The respondents appreciated the principal's leadership skills, which have allowed him to understand the needs of his staff. He was described as a 'team player.' He is a hands-on principal who is not afraid to dirty his hands. The principal believes that being brought up during democracy has made a major impact on the way in which he manages diversity. He still wants more training in this regard.

# **Overall Conclusion**

The responses of the principal and staff indicate that the school has embraced diversity pretty well. The staff was eager and willing to participate in the interview when they were told the topic. The principal and his management styles have played an integral part in achieving cultural collaboration, where all stakeholders can work together in achieving their common goals. The staff is young and has had no issues with diversity, as many had indicated that they went to diverse schools. The older staff members have jumped on this bandwagon by learning to accept the conditions at the school. The principal has set a tone that has been sustained.

### Conclusion

Robbins (2003) defines diversity as: 'Managing diversity does not mean controlling or containing diversity, it means enabling every member ... to perform to his or her potential.' It is evident, from the responses and data that the schools have become more diversified,

in time, since 1994. Integration of the different cultures and attempts at attaining equity in terms of race and language has been achieved to a great extent.

The diversity strategy should be monitored on a continuous basis in order to identify successes, shortcomings and areas of improvement and modification. According to Robbins (2003), the most important form of evaluation is the quantifiable impact the strategy has in terms of performance and results. It is thus necessary to monitor and evaluate the process continuously.

In addition, workshops should be arranged to allow staff to participate in-group discussions with representatives from diverse groups. Robbins (2003) feels that panels with representatives from the diverse groups are beneficial. They will be able to participate in activities that are designed to change attitudes, for instance, exercises in which they learn to realise what it is like to feel different.

During sessions, participants should be encouraged to develop action plans and how the plans can be maintained, reinforced, monitored and evaluated. As Robbins (2003:32) states that it is important to create an environment that is truly fulfilling for each person, that nurtures the self-esteem and self-worth of each person, and that creates opportunities for all to mature into independence.

Accepting and understanding of languages other than English plays an important part in the success of the school. Since English is rapidly becoming the predominant language (although there are eleven official languages in South Africa) in which teaching and learning, and personal affairs are conducted, principals need to consider how they can make cross-cultural communication a source of strength. Ansari and Jackson (1995) also express the view that language issues could become a source of conflict and inequality within culturally diverse organisations.

### Recommendations

Although, the process of diversification of organisations has six stages: denial; recognition; acceptance; appreciation; valuing; and utilisation (Polit, 1999). It is believed that organisations should put in place strategies to enhance workforce diversity. In terms of

organisational learning, organisations are still stuck on the problem of getting people to value diversity and they have not yet determined ways to utilise and exploit it (Porras, 1991). It is the approach to diversity, not the diversity itself that determines the actual positive and negative outcomes (Adler, 1997).

The Department of Education should ensure that sufficient workshops and training are planned in advance for recruitment of a diverse staff. If there has been an investment in staff training, then staff awareness about the issues of discrimination and disadvantages should have been increased. Language workshops of the essential words such as greetings, of the various languages should be given.

Ensure that the school has a diversity policy that states the school's commitment to cultural diversity and highlights particular groups whom experience shows are more likely to be discriminated against and it must ensure it creates an environment that is free from harassment. Devise a committee to oversee the implementation of the policies. This committee will continually review practices. Introduce a training programme at school on diversity for managers and staff. Set up a mentoring system for all new educators.

In the research, the study proved an effective way of exploring managing diversity at two ex model-C primary schools. The qualitative method approach allowed one to see the progression of diversity from prior 1994 to current day. In ideal circumstances, it would have been useful to survey the opinions of a number of schools about the management of diversity, rather than just those of a 20% sample. If this research were repeated in future time, a wider range of opinions would be advisable.

Ultimately, the successful management of diversity implies the development of a strong school culture that values cultural differences. Hofstede (1980) summarises the whole issue as follows: 'The survival of mankind will depend on the ability of people who think differently to act together.'

## List of References

Alexander, G.R. 2002. A mind for multicultural management. *Nursing management*, 33(10):30-34.

Ansari, K.H. & Jackson, J. 1995. Managing cultural diversity at work. London: Clays, St. Ives.

Borak, M.E.M. 2005. Managing diversity: toward a globally inclusive workplace. Thousand Oaks, Calif.: Sage.

Byars, I.I. & Rue, L.W. 2000. Human resource management. 6<sup>th</sup> ed. Boston, Mass.: Irwin/McGraw-Hill.

Collins, J. & Porras, J. 1994. Built to last: successful habits of visionary companies. New York: HarperBusiness.

Davidoff, S. & Lazarus, S. 1997. The learning school: an organizational development approach. Cape Town: Juta.

De Clercq, F. 2003. Handout on approaches to social science research. Johannesburg: University of the Witwatersrand.

De Vos, A.S., *ed.* 1998. Research at grassroots: a primer for caring professions. Pretoria: Van Schaik.

Digh, P. 1998. Coming to terms with diversity. HR magazine, 43(12):117-120.

Fleisch, B.D. 2002. Managing educational change: the state and school reform in South Africa. Sandown: Heinemann.

Garson, P. 2000. Value-added education. The Teacher/Daily Mail and Guardian, June.

Grobler, B.R., Loock, C.F., Mestry, R. & Bisschoff, T.C. 2004. Management of cultural diversity as an aspect of school effectiveness. Johannesburg: Rand Afrikaans University. Department of Educational Sciences.

Gummesson, E. 1991. Qualitative methods in management research. Thousand Oaks, Calif.: Sage.

Hebding, D. & Glick, L. 1976. Introduction to sociology. Reading, Mass.: Addison-Wesley.

Henge, R.C. 2000. Leading for diversity: how school leaders achieve racial and ethnic harmony (ARC Associates, CREDE). http://www.crede.ucsc.edu/research/pdd/rb6.shtml Date of access: 13 February 2007.

Hicks, D. & Gwynne, M.A. 1994. Cultural anthropology. New York: HarperCollins College Publishers.

Hofstede, G. 1980. Cultures consequences: international differences in work-related values. London: Sage.

Hulmes, E. 1989. Education and cultural diversity. London: Longman.

Johnson, J.P., III. 2003. Creating a diverse workforce. http://www.shrm.org/hrresources/ whitepapers\_published/CMS\_005379.asp#P-4 Date of access: 13 February 2007.

Jones, D. 1999. The definition of diversity: two views. a more inclusive definition. *Journal of library administration*, 27(1-2):5-15.

Lakhan, S. 2003. Diversification of U.S. medical schools via affirmative action implementation. *BMC medical education*, 3(1):1-6.

Leondakis, N. 2006. Managing staff. HCareer, Article 321.

Loden, M. 1996. Implementing diversity. Chicago, Ill.: Irwin.

McMillan, J.H. & Schumacher, S. 2006. Research in education: evidence-based inquiry. 6<sup>th</sup> ed. Boston, Mass.: Pearson/Allyn and Bacon.

Moore, S. 1999. Understanding and managing diversity among groups at work: key issues for organizational training and development. *Journal of European industrial training*, 23(4-5):208–217.

Mouton, J. 2003. How to succeed in your master's and doctoral studies. Pretoria: Van Schaik Publishers.

Mthethwa, T.P. 2004. The role of principals in the promotion of total quality management. Pretoria: UNISA. (Thesis - PhD.)

Polit, D.F. & Hungler, B.P. 1999. Nursing research: principles and methods. 6<sup>th</sup> ed. New York: Lippincott.

Robbins, S.P. 2003. Organizational behaviour. 6<sup>th</sup> ed. Englewood Cliffs, N.J.: Prentice Hall International.

Senge, P. 1990. The five disciplines of a learning organization. London, Century Business.

SHRM (Society for Human Resource Management) Survey. 2006. Diversity training. http:// www.hrc.org/resources/diversity-training-on-sexual-orientation-and-genderidentity-issues Date of access: 13 February 2007.

SHRM (Society for Human Resource Management). 2007. How should my organization define diversity?

http://www.shrm.org/diversity/library\_published/nonIC/CMS\_011970.asp# Date of access: 13 February 2007.

Simmons-Welburn J. & Welburn, W.C. 2001. Cultivating partnerships/realizing diversity. *Journal of library administration*, 33(1-2):5-19.

Smit, P.J. & Cronje, G.J. 2000. Management principles. Cape Town: Creda Press.

South Africa. 1998. Employment Equity Act, no. 55. *Government Gazette*, No. 22209. Pretoria: Government Printer.

South Africa. Department of Education. 1996. Changing management to manage change in education: report of the task team on education management development. Pretoria: Department of Education.

Thomas, R.R., Jr. 1990. From affirmative action to affirming diversity. *Harvard business review*, 68:107-117.

Thomas, R.R., Jr. 1992. Beyond race and gender: unleashing the power of your total work force by managing diversity. New York: AMACOM (American Management Association).

Van der Linde, C.H. 2002. The role of good educational management in a changing South Africa. *Education bulletin*, 122(3):511-519.

Van Schalkwyk, O.J. 1993. The education system: theory and practice. Pretoria: Sigma Press.

Welman, J.C. & Kruger, S.J. 2001. Research methodology for the business and administrative sciences. Cape Town: Oxford University Press.

